

SACRED MUSIC

Volume 112, Number 2
(Summer) 1985





Altar and tomb in the crypt of the Basilica of St. Cecilia, Rome.

SACRED MUSIC

Volume 112, Number 2, Summer 1985

FROM THE EDITORS
Gregorian Chant and the Vernacular 3
Acoustics and Church Music 4

WHAT MAKES MUSIC SACRED?
Monsignor Richard J. Schuler 7

PAPAL MUSICAL KNIGHTS
Duane L.M.C. Galles 13

REVIEWS 21

NEWS 26

EDITORIAL NOTES 27

OPEN FORUM 27

CONTRIBUTORS 28

SACRED MUSIC Continuation of *Caecilia*, published by the Society of St. Caecilia since 1874, and *The Catholic Choirmaster*, published by the Society of St. Gregory of America since 1915. Published quarterly by the Church Music Association of America. Office of publications: 548 Lafond Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55103.

Editorial Board: Rev. Msgr. Richard J. Schuler, Editor
Rev. Ralph S. March, S.O. Cist.
Rev. John Buchanan
Harold Hughesdon
William P. Mahrt
Virginia A. Schubert
Cal Stepan
Rev. Richard M. Hogan
Mary Ellen Strapp
Judy Labon

News: Rev. Msgr. Richard J. Schuler
548 Lafond Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55103

Music for Review: Paul Salamunovich, 10828 Valley Spring Lane, N. Hollywood, Calif. 91602
Rev. Ralph S. March, S.O. Cist., Eintrachstrasse 166, D-5000 Koln 1,
West Germany
Paul Manz, 1700 E. 56th St., Chicago, Illinois 60637

*Membership, Circulation
and Advertising:* 548 Lafond Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55103

CHURCH MUSIC
ASSOCIATION
OF AMERICA

Officers and Board of Directors

President Monsignor Richard J. Schuler
Vice-President Gerhard Track
General Secretary Virginia A. Schubert
Treasurer Earl D. Hogan
Directors Rev. Ralph S. March, S.O. Cist.
Mrs. Donald G. Vellek
William P. Mahrt
Rev. Robert A. Skeris

Membership in the CMAA includes a subscription to SACRED MUSIC. Voting membership, \$12.50 annually; subscription membership, \$10.00 annually; student membership, \$5.00 annually. Single copies, \$3.00. Send membership applications and change of address to SACRED MUSIC, 548 Lafond Avenue, St. Paul, Minnesota 55103. Make all checks payable to Church Music Association of America.

Second class postage paid at St. Paul, Minnesota.

Library of Congress catalog card number: 62-6712/MN

Sacred Music is indexed in the Catholic Periodical and Literature Index, Music Index, and Music Article Guide.

Front Cover: Domenichino, *St. Ceclia*

Copyright Church Music Association of America, 1985

ISSN: 0036-2255

474960



Relief. Church of St. Cecilia, Cologne.

FROM THE EDITORS

Gregorian Chant and the Vernacular

Interest in using the Gregorian melodies with vernacular languages continues to surface, especially in the United States, even though in Europe the idea is no longer seriously pursued. To a certain extent, the Vatican Council itself gave impetus to such experimentation, since it ordered the preservation and use of Gregorian chant and at the same time permitted the employment of vernacular tongues in the sung liturgy.

In German-speaking countries, the movement for the use of the vernacular was underway much earlier than in other lands, and experiments and studies were undertaken as early as the 1930's to use chant with German texts. Serious reports were made about the feasibility of such efforts. Johannes Hatzfeld presented a memorandum to the German bishops' conference in 1953, indicating that the combining of the German language and the Gregorian melodies was not possible. The Allgemeiner Caecilien Verband published a compilation of studies on the matter in 1961, before the Second Vatican Council had even convened. Such authorities as Urbanus Bomm, abbot of Maria Laach, Ernst Tittel of Vienna and Father Eugène Cardine of Solesmes repeatedly wrote and spoke against such adaptations. The new liturgical books in the vernacular with their chant melodies for English texts are proof enough of the impossibility of the process.

Two important factors are involved in this question: 1) the need to preserve intact the corpus of Gregorian chant in its authentic melodies; 2) the necessity of creating new, truly artistic music to adorn the new vernacular texts.

First, the scholarly research into the manuscripts containing the ancient melodies undertaken in the second half of the 19th century, which continues into the present, is one of the greatest musicological projects ever brought to completion. The work of the Solesmes monks and the several efforts of musicologists in other lands, including Peter Wagner, are hailed by all as truly significant contributions to the art of music. Their work resulted in the restoration of the Gregorian melodies and the publication of the Vatican Edition, which spread the ancient chant of the Roman Church into all nations for universal use. To protect that research and its ancient heritage, the Holy See forbade strictly any change in the official melodies, since such would be a mutilation.

Secondly, in musical composition, notes are created to adorn a given text. Texts are not manipulated to fit a melody. The melody adorns the words, grows out of them and is closely united to them by the prosody, the meter, the quantitative and qualitative characteristics of the language, the tonic accent, the sentence structure and the very organic nature of the words themselves. A melody composed to a text cannot be separated from it and applied to another text or even a translation of that text without seriously altering the original. Chant melodies were composed to Latin texts and through the centuries they have come to be revered in a way analogous to the reverence paid to the Holy Scriptures. To adapt them is a violation.

Attempts at adaptation have failed. Even the efforts of the Solesmes monks before the Second Vatican Council to prepare chants for the new feasts which were introduced into the liturgy were not successful, and those were attempts using Latin texts. The vernacular languages are much farther removed. The new *Graduale Romanum* has eliminated all the ersatz centonizations that have been judged not to be authentic. The preface to the revised volume clearly indicates the principle of maintaining only authentic chants and eliminating all later inventions or modifications. The melodies must be preserved intact. If new texts for new feasts are introduced into the liturgy, then new melodies in a contemporary idiom must be found to adorn them. Here is the challenge of our time and the great opportunity of each age to create a new music in its own idiom for its new liturgies.

What, then, is the solution of this problem? How is the Gregorian chant to be preserved and fostered and given primacy of place? And how are we to have music for the new vernacular texts? It is simple. The Vatican Council has given the solution. Sing the Gregorian chant in Latin, since it is the official language of the Church and its use is mandated. But create a new music for the texts of the various vernacular liturgies. In that way, we will preserve intact and use the treasure of the centuries, and at the same time, we will create a new music that is truly art and not mere imitation or adaptation. When we try to adapt texts or melodies, we have neither the ancient treasure nor do we have a new art, but only a poor imitation.

R.J.S.

Acoustics and Church Music

Acoustics has to do with sound and space. From a musician's viewpoint it is of the utmost importance since it so closely impinges on his product for better or for worse. We tend today to think of it chiefly with respect to the various materials that reflect or absorb the sound that we produce. We look at a church and rejoice for the stone, plaster and wood surfaces; we lament the carpets, the absorbent tiles and the draperies.

For the choral musician, whose very purpose is to blend the harmonics produced by his organization, the absorption of his raw material into soft surfaces spells disaster at worst, frustration at least. For the pastor who wishes his congregation would sing more vigorously, the fact that no one can hear anyone else thoroughly discourages most of his people, and his efforts to have them sing never get anywhere.

Acoustics is the science of sound and in our time has become so important in planning concert halls and opera houses, but so little is done in the building of new churches. Acoustics is important not just for hearing, but it is even more important for making music.

The ancients and the medieval architects knew a great deal about the properties of sound and the need to build in such a way that the sound would be fostered and improved. After all, the invention of the loud-speaker system is within the memory of many even today. The need for the preacher and the cantor to project sound was important in the building of cathedrals as well as smaller parish churches. The Roman liturgy is built upon the spoken and sung word; sound must be audible.

Musicians likewise knew what they had to do in composing for the buildings they would be asked to fill with sound. I learned this in a very practical way when the Twin Cities Catholic Chorale and the Dallas Catholic Choir toured in Europe in the summer of 1974. We sang in the great gothic cathedral in Cologne; we were a group of eighty voices. The six-voice *Hexachord Mass* of Palestrina was on our program, while the proper parts of the Mass were in Gregorian chant, sung by a small schola of three or four men. After the Mass the comments were that the chant parts were heard clearly and projected throughout the vast church, but the Palestrina polyphony was not distinct and was lost in a confusion of sounds. How could it be that eighty voices were lost but three could be clearly heard?

In Rome we sang in Saint Peter's Basilica. Again we sang the Palestrina Mass. The basilica is enormous, but the strains of the polyphony were clearly audible even in the heights of the great dome. Here the music fit, and the style of composition belonged in the architecture of the building, whereas in Cologne, the polyphonic intricacies of the sixteenth century polyphony were foreign to the medieval building which was perfect for the music of the middle ages, the Gregorian chant. Musicians were aware of the properties of the building, and they composed that kind of music which allowed for the projection of their sounds to all parts of the edifice.

It is true that these buildings were not carpeted and had no acoustical tile lining their walls. But there is an element in their construction, whether they are gothic, renaissance or baroque in style, that is so often overlooked today in planning our new churches. It is the fact of proportion and geometry. Sound is intimately related to proportion. There is a kind of sacred geometry that should be considered in plans for a church. The ancient, medieval and baroque architects knew this, and the musicians composed their music to correspond to it.

It is no secret that the geometric proportions used in the historic buildings both in Europe and in this country are related to the basic consonant musical ratios: the octave, 1:2; the fifth, 2:3; the fourth, 3:4; and the major third, 4:5. The proportion 1:2 (musically the octave) dominates so much sacred architecture. The naves of these classic buildings have a relationship between their length and width and height. That there is a relationship between the visible proportion and the audible world of musical sound is found in various cultures including the medieval gothic architects, especially the Cistercians. In their churches, so purified of visible ornament, the importance of sound in touching the human spirit became ever more realized. Without here getting into the psychological question about the relative merits of hearing and seeing and whether the spoken word is primary in the search for truth (*fides ex auditu*), it must be admitted that sound does touch the spirit directly and exercises an

important force on the emotions and the person who experiences it in the fulness of its force and beauty. One may or may not agree with the reforming spirit of Saint Bernard and the Cistacian purity and austerity, both in the architecture and music that he fostered, but the fact is that when the visual was removed, the audible was emphasized and the emotional impact that was produced through sound brought about great religious experiences.

Today's church building has produced a monstrous acoustical nightmare that musicians must battle even to accomplish a minimum of beauty and emotional affect. We all know the impossible situation created by carpets, acoustical tiles, drapes and hangings. How often a great expenditure of parish money for a pipe organ seems so ineffective because the sounds the organ produces are absorbed into the walls and furniture of the building. But there is something more basic that is robbing the organ, the choir and the singing congregation of the value of music in reaching the souls of those who sing or listen. It lies in the geometry of present church building. The length, the height and the width of the structure. Sound waves must have space, just as light waves. They must travel, be reflected and produce the fulness of their harmonic potentials. That requires space, and the space that receives sounds that have themselves a proportion must itself be in a proportion. When the architecture and the music utilize a basic relationship, that of geometric proportion, then both are successful in reaching the soul of the worshiper for whom the building was built and the music composed and performed.

Today's churches lack length and they lack height, and the space itself is usually so minimal little chance for the movement of sound and its reflection is possible. The fulness of the harmonic richness is lost and the music does not achieve its potential. It falls flat and is deprived of its purpose to touch the hearts of the faithful and give glory to God.

Can it be that our age has not produced a great sacred music since the buildings we must perform in have been of such impossible acoustical construction that the art is unable to thrive in them? Even when we succeed in keeping the acoustical tiles and carpets out, is not the problem still present since the very shape of the new building militates against the sound that should fill it instead of encouraging it as it should.

We have much that we can learn from the great churches of the past. Even though their styles are different, yet in the Roman basilica, the romanesque and gothic long naves, the square church of the renaissance and the wide baroque building, the proportions remained and the sound was embellished. Our day should well have its own style, but the basic construction should not be unaware of the relationship between the geometric proportions of the building and the basic ratio that music itself possesses in its harmonic structure.

The ancients found a mystical relationship in the musical proportions, and the medieval world knew it as an aesthetic tradition. It was maintained during the baroque period, but the nineteenth and twentieth centuries have overthrown the classical aesthetics and in so-doing have caused a rupture between science and art, between the spirit and matter, each going its own way, one toward rationalism, the other toward a subjective emotionalism. But for us the spirit is reached only through matter, but sound, which is matter, touches the spirit directly. Saint Paul did say that "faith comes from hearing."

R.J.S.

WHAT MAKES MUSIC SACRED?

(This paper was given at the University of Wisconsin at Eau Claire, January 18, 1985.)

A great debate has been underway for sometime about the sacred and the secular. There are some who wish to deny the very existence of "sacred." Others say all things are sacred, confusing the notion of sacred with good, as used by the scriptures when God viewed His creation and "saw that it was good." This debate enters into all areas of life, including the field of art, and especially the art of music where the notion of "sacred music" has been almost a household term for years.

This debate between the sacred and the secular is felt, for example, in convents and monasteries by monks and nuns who are attempting to adjust their consecrated, dedicated lives to their position in a modern world. It is met in theology, and especially in ascetical theology, where the term "world" was long taken to be the equivalent of evil. We find it in architecture, where it is hard to distinguish a sacred building from a secular one; in dance, where one may be at a loss to say that what is being performed is sacred or not; in clothing and vestments, even when associated with liturgical actions.

The Oxford dictionary defines "sacred" as "consecrated, dedicated, set apart, made holy by association with a deity." It defines "secular" as "pertaining to the world as distinguished from the church and religion; with reference to music, not concerned with or devoted to the service of religion, not sacred, but profane."

What makes music sacred? What makes anything sacred? Things are not sacred in and of themselves. As the dictionary states, they are consecrated, dedicated, set apart; someone must do this for them. Here lies the key to determining what is sacred or not, but how this comes about involves the history of the human race; for us musicians, it involves the entire history of music, here in the west and in the east.

The question of the sacred and the profane concerned the fathers of the early Church, many of whom were convinced that the pagan influences so opposed to Christianity could creep into the Church through artistic and musical devices associated with the various pagan cults and lascivious practices. Instrumental music was particularly suspect and feared, as Clement of Alexandria (c.150-c.220), a very learned man with musical and poetical talents, warned. He rejected "the ancient psaltery, the trumpet, the timbrel and aulos, which those engaged in war and those who reject the fear of God make use of in the singing at their festivals."

In the Alexandrian tradition of allegorical interpretation of the scriptures, Eusebius of Caesarea (c.260-c.340), the church historian, disapproved of instruments and substituted various allegories for the realities to explain his position. He wrote: "We sing the praises of God with a living psaltery." He called the body the cithara and the lyre of ten strings the five bodily senses and the five virtues of the soul in trying to explain references to the use of such instruments in the Old Testament. Saint Athanasius (c.298-373) followed in the same Alexandrian viewpoint.

In the west, Saint Jerome (c.340-420) was opposed to the use of instruments in Christian worship and made his influence felt on his friend Pope Damasus, in a period when much of the organization of the Roman liturgy was taking place. Saint Augustine (354-430) did much to achieve a synthesis between the learning of pagan Greece and Rome and the Christian faith, but he still accepted an allegorical interpretation of the use of instruments in Christian worship, chiefly because of the fear of the association connected with their use in pagan cults. It was, of course, always Psalm 150 that caused the problem for the commentators, since it so distinctly calls for the praise of God with instruments: "Praise the Lord with the sound of the tuba; praise Him with psaltery and harp."

After Saint Augustine, as the Church grew and its influence extended, less is found

SACRED MUSIC

about the dangers inherent in the use of instrumental music or in the singing of women, because the association of these things with the pagan rites was gradually being forgotten as paganism waned and disappeared. At the same time, as the Church grew, it was able, little by little, to make use in its worship of those cultural, artistic and popular traditions of the Mediterranean basin that formerly had belonged in some part, at least, to pagan celebrations. The music itself was not pagan; it was the association it had with paganism that created the problem for the fathers of the Church. Once that connotation ceased to be attached to instrumental music, to the singing of women and certain harmonies and melodies, the problem no longer loomed large. After the time of Augustine, the old fears were beginning to be lessened and the writers and preachers no longer are opposed to music. In the period when the Church and Christian influence are small and struggling and the dangers of the secular engulfing the sacred are great, we hear cries of alarm from the religious writers. When the influence of the Church is great, the danger of secularization is less, and we often find secular things being brought into religious use without fear of profanation.

Let us examine several periods in the history of music with these two points in mind: 1) connotation, and 2) the absorption of the sacred by the secular and vice versa, in periods of greater or lesser Christian influence.

First, the question of connotation. By connotation we understand the meaning or significance attributed to something over a long period of time by the entire community. It does not change easily, but it can change. It is external to the thing itself, but use and tradition develop characteristic notions that seem to be inherent. In ancient Greece, the aulos and the cithara were instruments employed in the worship of Dionysius and Appollo, and for the converts to Christianity in Greek lands these sounds recalled all the rites of pagan worship in their past lives and endangered their attachment to the newly embraced Christian faith. As paganism declined, generations grew up who had never experienced pagan rites and for whom the association of instruments with sinful festivities did not exist. In time, these instruments came to be used in Christian life and even in Christian worship. In a sense they ceased to be pagan and secular and even became sacred, because the secular and pagan associations were no longer present.

One can see a similar pattern in much of the music that came to be the great corpus of Roman chant. A considerable bulk of it was derived from the folk music of the Mediterranean regions. These melodies lost their secular associations and acquired religious ones as the Church grew in influence on the lives of the people of the fifth and sixth centuries. We can see a similar thing happening in other artistic and cultural areas during those centuries also, when the Roman Empire was changing into the new medieval order. For example, the old garments of the Roman patricians were retained as the vestments of the clergy; the very shape and structure of the Christian church building was borrowed from the ancient basilica which was originally a secular edifice, a law court or market; the political nomenclature of the ancient empire was accepted by the Church as she organized her dioceses, provinces, and prefectures, or sent out her legates and nuncios; the faldstool, the chalice itself, the bishop's garb, the use of the statues, mosaics and painting, were all found in pagan and secular culture. But as the Church spread and grew, connections that many things had with paganism and secular uses were forgotten, and they became fitting aids to Christian living and worship.

Through the middle ages there seems to have been little concern for a distinction between the sacred and the secular. Today, we cannot easily detect the difference between the melodies of the troubadours and the trouveres and those melodies employed as hymns and sequences unless we examine the text, which we will see is a

most important factor in determining if a piece is to be labeled as sacred or not. Even when Pope John XXII spoke out so strongly in the constitution, *Docta sanctorum*, in 1324, he was not so concerned about secular influences as he was with the proper use of the church modes, the intelligibility of the texts, and the general dignity of the service which he felt had been endangered by the novelties of the *Ars Nova*.

The early renaissance period found no problem in employing profane sources—chansons, madrigals, lieder—for a *cantus prius factus* of a Mass composition, and even in entitling the work from the secular sources to identify its origins. These were not exceptionally profane or secular times. On the contrary, in addition to the fact that the secular connotations of a chanson or a madrigal *cantus* were lost in the complexities of contrapuntal treatment, we must remember that the times were such that religion was still strong in its influence on life and thus the sacred was able to absorb the secular. Only when the Catholic faith began to weaken under the stress of the Protestant reformation do we have this device of using a secular *cantus* for a religious composition forbidden by the Council of Trent. The composers indeed continued to write a *Missa sine nomine* where the secular *cantus* was still used but not identified, but no one objected because the association of the melodies with secular sources was not made.

The second point of our consideration is that when the Catholic faith and religion are strong, the danger of the secular engulfing the sacred is much less, and thus we experience little outcry against the secular. Without repeating the history of each age, it should suffice to say that this was true in the early middle ages as instrumental music came to be adopted into the liturgy. The pipe organ, for example, was in its origin a secular instrument, but in the high middle ages it was so regularly found as a part of the church furniture that it became *the* sacred instrument *par excellence*. In the fourth, fifth and sixth centuries the chant absorbed a great bulk of the Mediterranean folk music, as Christianity became an all powerful element in European life. Throughout the middle ages the sacred pervaded all life and dominated its secular aspects in every sphere. What we possess of medieval music, painting, sculpture, and architecture demonstrates this again and again.

In music, the serious and lasting dichotomy between the sacred and the secular that we know today dates from the beginning of the baroque era, the early seventeenth century. It was then that the split in musical style between sacred and secular began, which led to the gradual decay of church music, a decline that musicians for the past one hundred years have been trying to arrest. The baroque era was very concerned with and conscious of style. The unity of style that had characterized the music of the middle ages and the renaissance was lost when the new devices for the expression of the affections of the baroque were applied to the music of the Church as soon as they appeared in secular forms, particularly opera. They were judged by some to be unfitting for the music of worship. These new techniques were essentially devices for displaying the so-called affections through music. They were thought to be undignified and unworthy in connection with the sacred texts of the liturgy. Thus began the creation of a particular sacred style after the manner of Palestrina's compositions, a style of writing set aside as a sacred music. The new developments in composition were generally relegated to non-church music and were therefore considered all the more secular and unfitting for church use. The Church herself was on the defensive against the reformers, and the sacred was under attack also. It could no longer absorb and assimilate the secular. Thus, in the early 17th century, the very problem that afflicts us today was born, and we live to a great degree under the influences of the 17th century. We cannot easily push aside in a short time what has grown and become ingrained for nearly four hundred years.

To repeat, then, we can say that in times of great Christian strength and influ-

ences, secular music has been absorbed into the Church's life and worship without fear of secularization or profanation, but when the faith declined in influence, great concern is shown for the dangers involved in such a process.

But is there any real distinction between sacred and secular in music? Is there something essentially sacred in a church style? Are certain melodies, rhythms or harmonies by their very nature holy or sacred and others secular and profane? Music is music; of itself it is neither sacred or secular, just as mathematics is neither sacred nor secular. But by association, by connotation, the consent of society, or the practice of the community, certain devices, harmonies, or rhythms—in a word, a certain style of composition and performance—has come to be called secular and another style sacred. In studies on the psychology of music this is referred to by the term "connotation" or the "result of associations made between some aspect of the musical organization and extra musical experience."

Training and experience are necessary to establish such connotations, and once established they are hard to overcome. They are not merely individual, personal associations, but the common experience of a whole cultural group. We all know the difficulties involved in determining the emotions expressed by most oriental music that we hear; we are unconditioned by experience or study to know if it is sad or joyous, religious or secular. Music in itself is not a language of absolute terms of communication. It differs from spoken language where sounds have absolute meanings agreed upon by the whole community. To express descriptive ideas, music must be dependent on outside means—words, pictures or onomatopoeic effects. Of itself it can convey only what experience and training have come to associate with certain sounds or devices. Thus we arrive at certain notions of what music for church should be by association and experience from our very earliest days. Some associations are entirely traditional. The pipe organ, for example, for the peoples of western culture is associated with church and evokes attitudes of piety, religion and faith. This is not true of the oriental who lacks such experience. For him the gong, on the other hand, is a common sound lacking the westerners' connotation of the mysterious and the exotic.

Associations can develop and can cease to exist also. Life is constantly forming new connotations in everyone. Some ages have consciously developed a system of elaborate connotative devices in their music. By means of melodic, rhythmic or harmonic techniques certain emotional states or even symbolic ideas have been expressed. The *Leitmotiv* of Wagner or his pseudo-religious atmosphere created by shimmering strings and modal melodies are examples of such efforts. The baroque era, also, cultivated the use of dissonance to express the emotions contained in words such as "sigh" or "suffer" or "die." We today also have connotative music as the score of any film will demonstrate. We easily recognize the associations achieved by military music, by cowboy music, by the soap-opera theme played on an electronic organ, or the night at sea or a storm or a hundred other well-established musical devices that depict a scene or evoke an idea. And we have some ideas also about what we think is sacred music and what is not.

For times of great religious faith we tend to say that the secular music of that age sounds like religious music, but for times of lesser faith and religious influence we tend to say that the religious music sounds secular. For example, the 16th century madrigals, performed without their texts, approach so closely to the motet writing of the same period that we might think of them as sacred. But the Mozart Masses remind us of his operas, only because the operas are better known to us. Had it been a different age, we would say that the operas sounded like Masses and the motets like madrigals.

Thus, there is nothing in the music itself—even in complicated rhythms—that by nature is sacred or secular. It is the connotation that makes the difference, and in a

secular-dominated society, church music must beware of being submerged by these secular connotations.

But, to ask the question again, how do we determine a sacred composition from a secular one? There is a certain priority to be followed in judging. First, if the composition has a text, and if the text is sacred, coming from biblical, liturgical or pious sources, then one can say that it is a sacred piece. That does not mean that it is a good piece. Plenty of compositions with sacred texts are junk, unworthy of performance for any purpose. They are not good art and thus they have no place in God's worship or even for man's entertainment. They offend both.

If the composition has no text, then it is the style and the form that will help make a determination. What is the form employed by the composer? Is it a march or a dance? Or is it a symphony or perhaps a church sonata? Mozart's epistle sonatas are surely church music, even though the style employed is the same as he uses for his other works. *Dove sono* from the *Marriage of Figaro* is the same melody as Mozart used for the *Agnus Dei* in the *Coronation Mass*. One is considered a secular aria and the other a sacred, liturgical piece. Here the text is basic for the judgment. In the epistle sonatas, intended to be played during the silent reading of the epistle at Mass in the old Tridentine rite, the purpose of the composer determined the decision to create a sacred composition.

Thus, the purpose of the composer is important in making a judgment. So is the experience of the audience. What does it connote to them? The famous hymn, *O esca viatorum*, is set to the melody harmonized by Heinrich Isaac as a German lied, *Innsbruck, ich muss dich lassen*, written as the composer was forced to leave that beautiful Alpine city when the court of Maximilian whom he served was departing for Vienna. Or the very religious tune that is so often sung as an *Ave Maria*, Jacob Arcadelt wrote as a chanson, *Nous coyons que les hommes*. Liszt produced the *contrafactum*. He put the sacred words to the chanson. And there are many more pieces that one age used and loved as secular chansons, lieder or ballads that today we sing and love as religious hymns or motets. Thus the purpose is important, but so is the connotation.

How about style? We are conscious of this element today, a remnant of the baroque era when the break occurred and the *stile antiqua* and the *stile moderna* came into existence. The *prima prattica* and the *secunda prattica* set up a distinction between what was for church and what was for the theater and concert hall. It did not take long for the composers to grasp that the new devices in which they were especially interested could be used only in the theater, if they were to adhere to the distinction. As a result, the greater composers wrote very little for church, since they were not interested in merely imitating an earlier style. Those great composers who did write rather extensively for the Church wrote in their own style, making no distinction between the two. Thus Mozart wrote in a unified style: opera, symphony or Mass. Haydn, Beethoven and Schubert too. They distinguished the sacred and the secular through the purpose and by the sacred text. As we can look back at those years, it is only the music of those who practiced a unified technique that is considered today to be great art. The imitators, who used only the *stile antiqua* and the *prima prattica*, are not known today because of their church works. Both the great and the not-so-great wrote "sacred" music, but while "style" may have set it aside as "sacred," it was usually not of artistic significance, since it was too much of an imitation of the past. The greater composers used the style of their time, a unified style of their own, and determined a piece to be sacred by the text or by the purpose for which it was composed.

Another interesting point in the problem of sacred and secular is the question of performance. It is true that much sacred music was written for concert performance.

Surely all non-Latin texts were excluded from Roman Catholic liturgical use until the Second Vatican Council. The oratorio, the religious opera, *laudi*, and spiritual madrigals, for example, were intended for concert performance. But what about the Masses, vespers, passions and spiritual concertos, church sonatas, trios and other choral and instrumental compositions? If their purpose was to adorn the liturgy, then in moving them to the secular setting of the concert hall are we not violating their very nature, the very purpose of the composer? Is not doing that, to some extent similar to moving the opera or the symphonic poem into the church service? We seem to have the problem of the sacred and the secular, but in a reverse arrangement.

Connected closely with the place of performance is the very reason for composing or performing sacred music. Haydn wrote for the glory of God, *Ad majorem Dei gloriam*. Liturgical music must be performed for that purpose. Secular music exists for the glory of man, his entertainment, his adulation and exaltation. That is why we can applaud for a concert, but applause in church for a liturgical performance is totally out of place. The distinction remains between sacred and secular: in composition, in performance, in purpose, in the very place in which it is done and in the manner in which it is received. Even in the manner of performance. A Haydn Mass sung in a concert crowds all the movements together in a short half-hour, the *Kyrie*, *Gloria*, *Credo*, *Sanctus-Benedictus* and *Agnus Dei* all following immediately on each other. In a performance within the Mass, in the manner intended by the composer, the parts are separated by time and by other music. It is not a concert piece, but an integral part of a liturgical action.

Still another area in which the distinction between sacred and secular impinges on the musician is the debate today about the use of sacred music in concerts in the public school, particularly around Christmas time. Surely it is the text that most often determines the sacred nature of a composition. Still, even an orchestra or band director has programming problems if he or she considers a medley of pieces that have become closely associated with certain sacred texts. Further, there are pieces written not for religious or liturgical use, but rather as a part of the secular observance of Christmas, for which the purpose of the composer should determine the nature of the piece; but can one truly separate the secular and the sacred nature of Christmas? In fact, can one really separate the secular and sacred parts of life? Of history? Of music?

The answer is, of course, no. It is, in fact, the very reason for the debate between sacred and secular. It has gone on from the beginning and will continue until the end. Some try to secularize our society, but our history and culture point the other way. Our very nature, created in God's image as the Book of Genesis says, is both spiritual and material, religious and worldly, sacred and secular. Thus we always express that in every facet of life. and not least, it is shown in our art, that expression of life that Dante called "God's grandchild," since He made us His children and art is our child.

The most that we can do is to recognize that music can be both sacred or secular. To deny that fact is failure to cope with reality. Then we must find means to determine which is which, not an easy task. Our tools for the decision rest first on the text, if there is one; secondly, on the purpose of the composer; thirdly, on the style of composition employed; fourthly, on the place in which it is to be performed and the musical forces to be employed.

Finally, we must never confuse the issue of sacred and artistic. Not all sacred music is, by any measure, artistic. Because a piece has a sacred text it is not necessarily good music or worthy of performance. As musicians we must choose only those compositions that are good music. Then we may proceed to judge if they are sacred or secular. As church musicians we must then choose the sacred and truly fulfill the two requirements requested by the Vatican Council: sacred and artistic.



Fresco. Church of St. Urban, Rome. *Cecilia exhorts Valerian, who is taught and baptized by Pope Urban.*

PAPAL MUSICAL KNIGHTS

Testimony of the benevolence of the popes toward musicians and their art is the number of musicians over the centuries honored by the popes with various tokens of papal esteem. The most important of these tokens of papal esteem, from a Christian perspective, is the honor of knighthood. Following a short precis of the history and significance of this honor, this article will survey several musicians who have over the centuries received the knight's cross at the pope's hands.

The Christian view of knighthood is rooted in the Christian doctrine of man. Man, as the Second Council of the Vatican reminds us in its pastoral constitution, *Gaudium et spes*, is created in the image of God. As the creation and very image of Goodness personified, man must perforce be good. Of course, man did not remain in that primeval state described by the psalmist as "little less than God" (Ps. 8:5). Through sin, he "upset the relationship which should link him to his last end" and at the same time broke "the right order that should reign within himself as well as between himself and other men and all creatures."

But man was not left hopeless. Christ, the Son of the eternal Father, was pleased to redeem him by taking on human flesh. Moreover, Christ was pleased to carry on the work of salvation after His resurrection and ascension through created instruments. He left to the world the sacraments and the Church. Water, bread, wine, the confession of a contrite human heart, the laying on of human hands, the anointing with oil, and the free exchange of consents of human wills became the stuff out of which divine grace issued. His Church He left as "a visible organization to communicate truth and grace to all men."

Equipped with this Christian vision of man, one can eschew Manicheism and see the value of human activity. Man, of course, is a composite of body and soul. Man's very dignity requires that "he should glorify God in his body." But besides his body man is endowed with a mind by which to "rule over creation and subdue it." Thus both the physical and mental activity of the composite body-soul creature, for the Christian, have religious value. As the council said of man, "when he works, not only does he transform matter and society but he fulfills himself." Not only does man by work fulfill himself, however. As Pope Paul VI said in *Octogesima adveniens* in 1971: "God who has endowed man with intelligence, imagination and sensitivity, has also given him the means of completing His work."¹

Though recent in formulation, this appreciation for the value of human activity was not unknown in the Church before the appearance of the council's constitution on the Church in the modern world. The Church in the middle ages had a similar appreciation. It was this appreciation, in fact, that enabled her to transform the secular institution of knighthood into a religious institute in the service of Christendom and the Christian Church. This transformation was one of the protean developments that accompanied the Gregorian reforms of the eleventh century.

During most of her first millenium, the Church used the word *militare* (soldiering) and its cognates *militia* (soldiery) and *miles* (soldier) in a restricted and spiritual sense meaning to struggle with evil. With Cassian the word became a synonym for the monastic life, the life of those brave souls who sallied forth into deserted places to give combat to evil and seek a "white martyrdom" after the peace of Constantine. Other Christian writers, however, continued to use the word in the more general spiritual sense to denote the pilgrimage which life on earth is for the Christian. The *Rule* of Saint Benedict brought a further development by using the word to denote the service in obedience of the monk. Monks united under obedience to their abbot were said to serve in the *militia Christi* (and thus combat evil) by subjecting their individual wills to the will of another. In short in the *Rule* obedience made the monk a soldier or *miles*.

This primitive Christian view endured through most of the Church's first millennium. But even by the tenth century there were signs of a shift. The Romano-German pontifical of the tenth century contains a blessing for the arms of soldiers. In that blessing the Church prayed that those military weapons "might be a defense and protection of churches, widows, orphans, and all servants of God against the savagery of pagans."

The idea of weapons in the defense of Christendom fructified in the Gregorian reform period of the next century. The Gregorian reformers took their text from Saint Paul's notion of a "variety of gifts" (I Cor. 12: 4-11) and this informed their view of man and Christian society. They saw in the human activity of the various orders of society the harmonious service of Christ. In other words it was no longer necessary to join a monastery (or found one) to become part of the *militia Christi*. Human activity when joined with right conduct and right intention were now more clearly seen as the road to salvation. The upshot of this new vision of man and of society was to vault the knight into a lofty place among Christians. Knighthood ceased to be merely a secular occupation. Indeed, besides kingship, it was to be the only secular, lay vocation for which the Church would provide a liturgical ceremony for its initiation. Not surprisingly that liturgical ceremony found its way into the *Pontificale* in the eleventh century and remained there until our own time.

The primitive notion of *miles* as monk was not, however, entirely eclipsed. In the crucible of the poverty movement of the eleventh and twelfth centuries (which crystalized into Cistercians, Franciscans, Dominicans), the old notion was transformed. The result was a new religious institute, in fact a new species of religious

institute, which would have been unthinkable centuries before—the military religious order. This new kind of religious, who was knight as well as monk, made its appearance shortly after the first crusade. Its great propagator was Saint Bernard of Clairvaux. His tract, *De laude novae militiae*, sounded the clarion call which produced a stampede of vocations to the new religious institute. Saint Bernard's military religious provided a competing vision to that of the secular Christian knight of the Gregorian reformers. Nevertheless, though rooted in distinct traditions, their history is not easily separated. In practice, each vision influenced the other.² Hence, it is helpful to sketch briefly the history of the military religious orders.

The first military religious order was the Order of the Temple of Jerusalem, named after its first permanent home in a wing of the Latin king's palace near Solomon's temple. The order began quite humbly in 1118 as a confraternity of knights organized to protect pilgrims from bandits along the pilgrimage route from Jaffa to Jerusalem. But after Saint Bernard's tract, they adopted a version of the Cistercian rule and became an overnight success. In the two centuries of their existence before the greed of Philip the Fair procured their suppression in 1312 as a canonical religious order, they recruited some 20,000 members and were one of the largest and wealthiest multi-national corporations in Europe.

Their example was soon followed by the Order of Saint John of Jerusalem, previously organized as an order of nursing brothers. Joining the military to its erstwhile hospitaller apostolate, the Knights of Saint John became as successful as the Templars. They were also more enduring. They remain today a lay, religious order in the Catholic Church with some 13,000 professed religious (otherwise called knights of justice) headed by a grand master who, like a cardinal, enjoys the title "eminence." Associated with them are some 8,000 knights of obedience, honor and grace (secular lay people) whose resources support the manifold caritative works of the order. In a sense, the order, usually called the Order of Malta, is the Roman Catholic Red Cross.

The third military religious order was purely English and had origins similar to those of the Knights of Saint John. An English priest assembled some colleagues and undertook to nurse the sick and wounded English crusaders fighting under Richard the Lion-Hearted at Acre. After the fall of Acre, Richard built a chapel for them and founded a hospital and nursing brotherhood under the Templar rule, dedicated to Saint Thomas of Canterbury. Like the Templars, they wore a white mantle ensigned with a red cross but differenced with a white shell. Their headquarters was the hospital of Saint Thomas Acon in London and they survived until the reformation.

The next military religious order was the Teutonic Order or more exactly, the Order of Saint Mary the German. It began like the Knights of Saint Thomas as a hospitaller order, staffed in this case by Germans. Patterned also on the Templars, they wore a white mantle ensigned with a black cross. After the loss of the Holy Land in 1291, they centered their apostolate in the Baltic region and became rulers of vast lands there—the region which until World War II was called East Prussia. They survived the reformation but fell victim to President Wilson after the First World War because of their long-standing connections with the Habsburgs. To save their properties from Allied confiscation, Pope Pius XI in 1929 transformed the order into an order of mendicant priests, which still exists today.

The last of the military religious orders was the Order of Saint Lazarus of Jerusalem. It seems to have grown out of a leper hospital for knights of the other orders. During the thirteenth century it was regularly contributing a small contingent to the Latin forces in the Holy Land. After the fall of the Latin kingdom in 1291, it retreated to Europe and there opened leprosaria in France, Italy and England. Its headquarters became Boigny, given it by King Louis VII of France. During the Great Schism it

effectively dissolved into autonomous French, Italian and English branches. The English branch was suppressed at the reformation; the French branch was secularized shortly before the French revolution; and the Italian branch was secularized shortly after the revolution, having been joined with the Savoyard royal order of Saint Maurice.

Some older authors would also add to the list of military religious orders founded in the Holy Land the *Sacra ordo militaris crucigerorum cum stella rubea*. Founded about 1217 in Prague by the Blessed Princess Agnes of Bohemia as an order of nursing brothers, in the baroque period some creative history transformed it into a military religious order with considerable privileges. Its grand master acquired then the right to pontifical vestments and the abbatial blessing and its members obtained the use of the rochet (the episcopal surplice). It survives today as a clerical religious order (in fact, the *only* Czech religious order) with some thirty members.³

The military religious were always a model for their secular comrades. Nevertheless, the image of the secular Christian knight retained the autonomy gained for it by the Gregorian reformers and it remained firmly rooted in the hierarchical society of the day. Christian knighthood was exalted in fact by medieval theologians as a "sacrament." Baptism was a *sine qua non* for knighthood. It was noted by the middle ages that however chivalrous he might be, Saladin, as a muslim, lacked a constitutive element needed to become a knight. In fact, knighthood was seen as a solemn reaffirmation of the baptismal vows—much like religious profession. Like the religious, the Christian knight was at the service of the Church. Not without reason was it said *ubi ecclesia, ibi miles*.

Knighthood and priesthood in fact were seen as coordinate institutes of Christian society. For this reason the liturgical initiation to knighthood was made to parallel priestly ordination. Not surprisingly there are medieval references to being "ordained a knight." Many medieval theologians from the time of Saint Thomas Aquinas on saw the matter of the sacrament of holy orders in the *traditio instrumentorum*, the delivery of the patten and chalice, the instruments of priestly sacrifice. By analogy, knighthood was conferred by the *traditio instrumentorum*, the girding on of the sword, the instrument of knightly service. A further vestiary analogy might be mentioned. The priest is clothed with a stole and the knight with the mantle, both to remind the wearer of the sweet yoke of his vocation.⁴

With the advent of the renaissance, the military religious orders collapsed. Predicated on a societal model of fraternal equality, living in obedience and poverty, they quickly went into eclipse in that new age, choked in its hierarchical and nationalistic atmosphere. Moreover, in an age of rising individualism and secularity, they appeared as *de trop* as dinosaurs in an ice age. The new and successful religious institutes of that age were the Society of Jesus and its copiers. The Society of Jesus succeeded by embracing the tendencies of the age. It abolished solemn vows, choir duty, the equal voice in chapter, and the requirement of community life. If the military religious orders were once the papal janissaries, that title now belonged to the Jesuits. The Jesuits, in fact, contributed a whole new chapter in the history of the taxonomy of religious institutes, giving rise to the "cleric regular."

There were attempts to adapt the military religious orders to the new age. The Order of Saint Stephen, established in 1560 by the grand duke of Tuscany, was one such attempt. Its members were knights with vows of obedience, charity and conjugal chastity who had as their apostolate the maritime defense of Christendom. Patterned on the Order of Malta, it endured as a Tuscan shadow of that great order until the unification of Italy in the nineteenth century. More hopeful was the Militia Jesus Christi, established in 1603 by Spanish royal decree and approved two years later by a Dominican general chapter. Its members were to be auxiliaries of the

inquisition, then staffed largely by the Order of Preachers. Hence, members of the Militia could wear as an emblem the black and white cross fleury of the Dominicans. In accordance with renaissance sensibilities members could be noble by their education as well as by birth. Their apostolate was the combat of heresy either by arms or by legal process or by the printed word. This new equestrian order proved short-lived.

The genius of the renaissance brought about the demise of the military religious orders. At the same time it fostered the growth of secular Christian knighthood. It also began its transformation. Under the influence of the renaissance accent on individual achievement, secular Christian knighthood tended to become a reward for a life of service rather than a vocation to a life of service. The individualism and respect for individual human dignity and creativity of the renaissance also gave a fillip to artistic consciousness. Artists now became distinguished from artisans and craftsmen. Artists were now held to be practitioners of the liberal or noble arts. The stage was now set for artists to be coopted into secular Christian knighthood.

The popes were quick to pour the new wine of the renaissance musical artists into the old wineskins of Christian knighthood. One of the first musicians to be the subject of papal honors was the Spanish renaissance musician, Christobal de Morales (1500-1553). An exponent of the Andalusian school of Spanish music, his distinguished music is noted for its austerity and dramatic mysticism. Monsignor Anglès has said that "aesthetically speaking" Morales, Saint Teresa of Avila and Saint John of the Cross are brothers. For ten years a singer and composer in the papal Sistine chapel, in 1536 Pope Paul III created Morales count of the sacred palace and of Saint John Lateran.

Orlando di Lasso (1532-1594), the distinguished and well-known Flemish composer, was one of the first musicians to receive the honor of papal knighthood. Born in Mons in 1532, he spent much of his youth in Italy becoming in 1553 *maestro di cappella* at Saint John Lateran. In 1556, he joined the chapel of Duke Albrecht V of Bavaria and spent the rest of his career in the service of the Wittelsbachs in Munich. In 1574, while on a tour of Italy recruiting musicians for the ducal chapel, Pope Gregory XIII created him a knight of the Golden Spur. Lasso died in Munich twenty years later.

Another papal musical knight was Christoph Willibald Gluck (1714-1787). Born in Germany, he studied in Italy under Sammartini. In 1756, his opera, *Antigone*, opened in Rome and received an enthusiastic reception. Shortly thereafter Pope Benedict XIV made him a knight of the Golden Spur. Henceforth, Gluck styled himself, *Ritter von Gluck*.

Also to receive papal knighthood was Gluck's near-contemporary, Karl Ditters von Dittersdorf (1739-1799). Ditters' career centered in Germany rather than Italy and until quite recently he has been a somewhat obscure musician. Through the influence of his patron, Count Schofgotsch, prince bishop of Breslau, he was created a knight of the Golden Spur in 1770. Three years later he received an imperial patent of nobility and as a result added *von Dittersdorf* to his name. Violinist and composer, he began the orchestra at the Stefansdom in Vienna.

Perhaps the most famous papal musical knight is Mozart (1756-1791). Baptized Johan Chrisotomos Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, he spent the early part of his musical career in the service of the prince archbishop of Salzburg. While on a tour of Italy intended to free the fourteen-year old *wunderkind* from dependency on his archepiscopal patron, Pope Clement XIV created him a knight of the Golden Spur. The patent, dated July 4, 1770, is worth quoting in part. It begins:

Inasmuch as it behoves the beneficence of the Roman pontiff and the Apostolic See that those who have shown no small signs of faith and devotion. . . shall be decorated with

the honors and favors of the Roman pontiff,. . .we hereby make and create thee—whom we understand to have excelled since thine earliest youth in the sweetest playing of the harpsicord—knight of the Golden Spur, by the apostolic authority.

The patent went on to bestow on Mozart all the honors and privileges of membership in that order except those abolished by the Council of Trent. Since papal knighthood was still conceived of as a sacramental, the reception of which required that the recipient have no obstacle in the internal or external forum, the document first absolved Mozart from any sentence of excommunication, suspension, and interdict, or other censures and penalties of the Church imposed *a jure* or *ab homine* for whatever occasion or cause.

Another opera composer to be honored with papal knighthood was Gaspare Spontini (1774-1851). Born near Naples, he composed a number of Masses in his youth before moving to Paris and achieving success as an opera composer to the Empress Josephine. The bulk of his career, however, he spent in Berlin as court musician to the king of Prussia. In 1838, he made a tour of his native land and there became disturbed at the decayed state of sacred music. In Rome he presented Pope Gregory XVI with a number of proposals for the reform of sacred music. These included the establishment of a school of sacred music and the publication of good church music by the old masters. His projects foundered but the pope was nevertheless impressed and created him a knight of Saint Gregory.

Worthy of being counted among the papal musical knights is Frederick Pustet (1798-1882), even though he was a publisher rather than a composer or maker of music. In Regensburg he founded one of the leading church music publishing houses and was largely responsible for publication of liturgical books in the early years of the liturgical revival. From his Regensburg printing house he published the Medicean text of the Gregorian chant which began the process of revival of the ancient music of the Church. The firm also published the journal of the Caecilien-Verein. Upon the appearance of the folio edition of the breviary, the delighted Pope Pius IX created him a knight of the Order of Pius.

Two Americans closely connected with the founding of the two journals, *Caecilia* and *The Catholic Choirmaster*, which are the forerunners of *Sacred Music*, can be numbered among the circle of papal musical knights. The first, John Baptist Singenberger (1848-1924), was born in Kirchenberg, Switzerland, and studied at the University of Innsbruck and the church music school in Regensburg. He there came under the influence of the Caecilian movement which he would soon export to the United States. In 1873, Bishop Henni of Milwaukee appointed him to the chair of music at Saint Francis Seminary, a position he held for half a century. The same year, Singenberger began the American Caecilia Society and its journal *Caecilia* and through them he started the task of reforming Catholic church music in the United States. His 1875 concert performance of Palestrina's *Missa Papae Marcelli* in Dayton, Ohio, set the standard for the revival. In 1882, Pope Leo XIII created him a knight of Saint Gregory. Pope Pius X in 1908 also created him a knight of Saint Sylvester. It only remained for Pope Pius XI in 1923 to create him a knight commander of Saint Gregory, the highest papal honor that is conferred on a Catholic layman not a head of state or government.

Also honored by the pope was Nicola Aloysius Montani (1880-1948). Studying in Rome under the leading church music reformers in the days of Pope Pius X, he also had the benefit of the learning of Solesmes. His task became the implementation of Pius X's famous *motu proprio* on sacred music, *Inter pastoralis officii*. He founded and edited *The Catholic Choirmaster* and in 1914 with others he founded the Society of Saint Gregory of America to promote Catholic church music reform. To a large

degree Montani's group tended to work with Irish-American Catholics, whereas Singenberger's organization operated among German-American Catholics. Exponent of a then little-known practice in the Irish-American church, viz., congregational singing, Montani is without question one of the deserving pioneers of the liturgical revival. His lasting monument will probably be the *Saint Gregory Hymnal*, for decades the only church music many American Catholics knew. In 1928, Pope Pius XI created him a knight commander of Saint Sylvester.

DUANE L.C.M. GALLES

NOTES

1. Pastoral constitution, *Gaudium et spes*, in Flannery (ed), *Documents of Vatican II*, 11, 12, 14, 15, 34, 35; *Lumen gentium*, 1, 6; apostolic letter, *Octogesima adveniens*, A.A.S. (1971).

2. Christine Thouzellier, "Ecclesia militans," in *Etudes d'histoire du Droit Canonique dédiées à Gabriel Le Bras*. 2 vols. (1965) pp. 1408-1414; Cyrille Vogel and Reinhard Elze, *Le Pontifical Germanique du Dixième Siècle* (1963) II, p. 379; Collin Morris, "Equestris Ordo: Chivalry as a vocation in the twelfth century," in *Religious Motivation* (1975) pp. 93-95; Pierre de Puniet, *Le Pontifical Romain*, 2 vols. (1931) II, p. 220.

3. Desmond Seward, *The Monks of War: The Military Religious Orders* (1972) on which this account is based. On the Order of Malta see also Arthur C. Brycha-Vauthier, "The Order of St. John in international law: A forerunner of the Red Cross," 48 *American Journal of International Law* (1954) 556, 561. On the Red Star Crossiers see Theodore Rupprecht, *Notae Historiae in Universorum Jus Canonicum* (1764) p. 311; Willy Lorenz, *Die Kreuzherren mit dem roten Stern* (1964) pp. 72-74.

4. Jaroslav Pelikan, *The Growth of Mediaeval Theology* (1978) p. 213; Leon Gauthier, *Chivalry* (New York, 1959) pp. 6, 15; Morris, *op. cit.*, 88; Walter B. Clancy, *The Rites and Ceremonies of Sacred Ordination* (1962) pp. 35, 38. Only in 1947 did Pius XII define the essential matter of priests orders as the (first) imposition of hands, not the *traditio instrumentorum*. *Ibid.*, p. 56. It should be recalled that the number of sacraments was not determined to be seven until Peter Lombard's *Sentences*, ca. 1145, and not dogmatically defined as such until Trent. *Enchiridion*.

5. Rudolph Wittkower, *Sculpture Processes and Principles* (1977) p. 79. Francis Haskell, *Patrons and Painters* (1980) p. 117 dates the practice of giving titles to artists to the sixteenth century and adds that it is "directly related to the new awareness of their social value." He notes as early creations that the Emperor Frederick III made Gentile Bellini a count palatine and that the Emperor Charles V in 1533 created Titian a Lateran count.

6. *New Groves Dictionary of Music and Musicians*; Otto Erich Deutsch, *Mozart, a Documentary Biography* (1965) p. 123; *The Catholic Choirmaster*, 27 (1941) 101-104, 34 (1948) 6-8. The Order of the Golden Spur was established in 1539 by Pope Paul III. Gregory XVI in 1841 merged the decayed order into his new Order of Saint Sylvester. In 1905 Pope Pius X separated the two orders, making that of Saint Sylvester the lowest ranking papal order. The Order of Pius was founded by Pope Pius IV in 1559 and was reestablished in 1847 by Pius IX. Until 1939 bestowal of the Order of Pius conferred personal nobility; it seems never to have been conferred on a U.S.A. citizen. The Order of Saint Gregory was established in 1831 by Pope Gregory XVI to honor Austrians and subjects of the Papal States who helped suppress the revolution of 1830. James Van der Veldt, *The Ecclesiastical Orders of Knighthood* (1956) pp. 49-52.



St. Cecilia. St. Cecilia playing the Virginal.

REVIEWS

Organ

A Christmas Album. H. W. Gray Publications. 128 pp. \$12.50.

With the abundance of Christmas music available, it is surprising how few good collections actually exist. This is one of them. This album contains twenty-eight pieces which include the most popular carols in well-written, innovative settings. The works vary in length and difficulty, although all require solid organ technique. The book is spiral-bound, which is enormously helpful for an album of this size, and registration, expression, dynamic markings, and some fingerings are provided in the score. This is an outstanding collection, deserving of consideration by anyone in search of good Christmas arrangements.

MARY GORMLEY

Basic Organ Techniques and Repertoire by J. J. Keeler and E. Donnell Blockman. Universe Publishers (Theo. Presser Co., agents). Paper, \$10.95.

This book is a comprehensive guide to the study of organ performance. It would be extremely valuable to both organ teachers and students. The book is divided into three sections: 1) basic pedal and manual exercises; 2) a written description of the instrument, registration, and methods of performance; and 3) sixty pages of short, baroque organ pieces. It has, in addition, an excellent bibliography on organ music suitable for study, technical exercises, texts on organ registration, and materials for organ improvisation. The exhaustive approach taken by the authors permits use of this book as a reference tool, teaching source, and performing edition.

MARY GORMLEY

1) *What God Ordains is always Good.* 2) *Lord Jesus Christ, Thou Prince of Peace.* 3) *O Quench Us with Thy Goodness* by J. S. Bach, arr. by Hal H. Hopson. H. W. Gray Publications. Published separately, \$2.50 ea.

All three arrangements place the chorale melody in the pedal under two-part counterpoint in the manuals. These settings are easy to read and to perform. They represent valuable additions to church music repertoire, particularly for the Sundays associated with the respective chorales.

MARY GORMLEY

The Organ Music of Alexandre Guilmant. Volumes I-VI, edited by Wayne Leupold. McAfee Music Publications. Paper, \$14.95 for first four volumes; \$19.95 for the last two.

These six volumes represent the complete works of Guilmant. In addition to the music, each volume

contains an extensive preface which addresses the chronology of Guilmant's life, his biography, the specifications of organs on which he performed, an essay on organ playing written by Guilmant, and an essay on Guilmant's contribution to organ music.

Volumes I-IV contain pieces in various styles. Although different, they nevertheless all require a substantial degree of technical skill. Basically, they belong in the concert repertoire.

Volume V is titled *The Practical Organist*, and it contains shorter, somewhat easier pieces in different styles which would function well as service music. Volume VI, *The Liturgical Organist*, contains a diverse selection of pieces which vary in length and difficulty. Many of them are based on Gregorian chant. Volume VI also has numerous hymn variations, "Amens," and interludes.

In all volumes, the scores contain extensive editorial markings and registrations. The publication of this set of complete works should promote the appreciation and recognition of Guilmant as a composer, whose accomplishments as a recitalist and teacher have already been widely acknowledged.

MARY GORMLEY

Christmas Music, compiled by John Holler. H. W. Gray Publications. 71 pages. \$7.95.

The contents of this collection had been formerly issued in the two-volume edition of the *St. Cecilia Series* of Christmas music. This new edition contains sixteen pieces of moderate length and difficulty. With the exception of Brahms' *Lo, How a Rose 'ere Blooming* and J. S. Bach's *In dulci jubilo*, these works are largely unfamiliar. All, however, reflect the Christmas spirit, and many are pastoral in nature. The score is heavily edited with extensive registration markings. Organists searching for unusual Christmas music should find this album interesting and worthwhile.

MARY GORMLEY

Brass Ensemble

Eight Fanfares for Brass Ensemble by Arthur Bliss. Trumpets, trombones, timpani, drums and bells. Novello (Theo. Presser, agents). \$13.00.

These eight, very useful fanfares are scored for a variety of combinations, with as little as two trumpets and as many as four trumpets and four trombones, timpani, side drum, cymbal and bells. Also, they include short and longer pieces, one of which introduces the anthem we know as "My Country 'Tis of Thee." With a greater use of brass within liturgical ceremonies, these pieces can find a valuable place in the repertoire. They have no particular problems of performance and can be played by an ensemble of reasonable proficiency.

R.J.S.

Christmas Carols for Brass Quintet ar. by Richard Price. 2 trumpets, horn, trombone and tuba. Merion Music, Inc. (Theo. Presser, agents). \$18.00.

This collection has nine well-known carols set in traditional harmony with imaginative and interesting arrangement. The carols include: "We Wish You a Merry Christmas," "Angels We Have Heard on High," "We Three Kings," "I Saw Three Ships," "Carol of the Bells," "What Child is This?" "O Come, O Come Emmanuel," "The Holly and the Ivy," and "Silent Night." These can be useful not only as solo ensemble performances, but they might be incorporated into the accompaniment of congregational carol singing. Of course, as in the use of any brass ensemble music, the performers must be capable of a good rendition. A poor performance is better omitted.

R.J.S.

J. S. Bach, Three Chorales from the St. John Passion ar. by Arthur Bliss. 3 trumpets, 3 trombones and optional tuba. Novello (Theo. Presser, agents). \$11.00.

Originally performed as tower music at the Worcester cathedral in England, these are most useful for any festival occasion, including processions organized within the church and also outside. They are good for interludes, preludes or postludes for Mass, especially on festive occasions.

R.J.S.

Choral

Alleluia-Magnificat by Heinrich Isaac, ed. by James D. Feiszli. SATB. The Motet Press, P.O. Box 5570, Athens, Ohio 45701. \$5.00.

This was composed for the feast of the Visitation and comes from Book II of the *Choralis Constantinus* of the famous sixteenth century contrapuntalist. The editor points out that the motet may be performed with instrumental doubling of the parts or *a cappella*. A keyboard reduction is given for rehearsals. The text can be used on any feast of the Blessed Virgin.

Eight Carols for Christmas by Sydney Hodkinson. SATB, keyboard. Merion Music Co. (Theo. Presser, agents). Published separately. c. \$75.

While the texts are traditional the settings are in a contemporary style. The texts include: "Come all you Faithful Christians," "Now every Child that dwells on Earth," "Lully, lulla," "On Christmas Night," "If Ye would hear," "Christ, Saviour of the World to Come," "While Shepherds Watched," "Sweet was the Song." The instrumental parts are independent of the voices and may include the use of bells. These will fill a need for those interested in new music for Christmas.

Christmas, a Carol Cantata by Janice Kapp Perry and Joy Saunders Lundberg. SATB, soloists and two

readers, keyboard. Universe Publishers (Theo. Presser, agents). \$2.95.

Six carols form the main part of this twenty-five minute work, together with selections assigned to readers. The choral writing is traditional and easy, and the soloists parts are not demanding. It may be a useful piece for high school Christmas concert performance.

A Song of St. Francis by Michael Hurd. SSA, *a cappella*. Novello (Theo. Presser, agents). \$95.

A contemporary setting of the old prayer of St. Francis, this piece for three treble voices has interesting choral sounds. It demands a good ensemble that does not have pitch problems. There is an alto solo against a hummed part for the choir.

My God and King by Joseph Roff. Thomas House Publications, P.O. Box 6023, Concord, California 94524. SATB, organ. \$80.

A good piece for the feast of Christ the King or for any other festival, this composition ends with a triumphal *fortissimo*. The text is from the seventeenth century. The choral writing is traditional, using polyphonic as well as homophonic devices. It is not difficult and could be very appealing to the choir and the congregation both.

R.J.S.

Magazines

SINGENDE KIRCHE. Volume 31, No. 2, 1984. *Quarterly of the Church Music Commission of the Austrian Bishops*.

It is rare in the history of these reviews of *Singende Kirche* which have appeared in *Sacred Music* that we have taken issue with the points made in the Austrian church music journal. However, in the second number of the thirty-first volume, Rudolf Pacik (who seems to be a new contributor) has an article which questions the usefulness of the division of the Mass musically into the ordinary and proper parts. His major thesis is that in the new, reformed liturgy, it is useless to divide texts simply by whether they change or not. Texts must be judged on their structure and function. Although the *Kyrie*, *Gloria*, *Credo*, *Sanctus* and *Agnus Dei* all remain the same from Sunday to Sunday, they function in completely different ways and are part of totally different liturgical structures. The *Kyrie* is part of the penitential rite. The *Credo* is the people's response to the proclaimed word of God. The structure and function of these liturgical texts should determine their musical setting. Further, in each of the liturgical structures of the Mass, *e.g.*, the entrance rite, the penitential rite, the preparation of the gifts, *etc.*, the changeable texts (the old "proper") should be integrated with the unchangeable texts (the

old "ordinary") so that these structures are clearly delineated. Of course, as Pacik readily admits, this division means the end of the "high Mass" in the usual sense. It also means that the classics of Austrian church music, e.g., the settings of the ordinary by Mozart, Haydn, Beethoven and Schubert, are no longer appropriate within the new liturgy. Pacik will allow portions of Haydn and Mozart to be sung, but he would hold that it is impossible to sing the entire ordinary and still preserve the structures of the reformed liturgy.

There is no doubt that Pacik makes some valid points. The worship of the Church does not exist to serve music. Rather, church music should always be at the service of the liturgy. It is, in fact, an integral part of the liturgy. Thus, music must adapt itself to the reforms of the Church. Further, it is true that the division by changeable and unchangeable texts is not the only possible division of the liturgy, although from the very practical point of view, it is a useful fact for the choirmaster to know if he might use the piece often or only once a year. Still, it is certainly questionable whether or not the reforms of the sacred liturgy were intended to be as far-reaching as Pacik believes. In the notes to his article, one does not see the constitution on the sacred liturgy quoted. In that document, the fathers of the council asked that the treasury of sacred music be preserved. They did not mean that this treasure should be preserved in archives. Music is preserved when it is sung and played. Clearly, the bishops asked that the classics of church music be used in church.

Secondly, Pacik asks that musicians write and sing new music for the reformed liturgy. No one would argue against this challenge. But if the liturgists will not permit the art music of the past to be sung, how do they expect new composers to be inspired to write new music? We all stand on the shoulders of past generations. Few would want to try to re-invent the wheel. New music will grow from the old, *if it is sung!* It is disconcerting to see the somewhat extreme views of liturgists reflected in the Austrian church music magazine. In the past, it was always a defender of the treasure of sacred music.

Peter Planyavsky has an interesting contribution to this issue. His thesis is that the current debate between "classical" church music and "pop" music sung in church should be placed in an historical context. Planyavsky suggests that similar struggles have gone on in the past and that what we are experiencing today is the fruit of a long development. In fact, the pendulum of church music may have in our time reached one extreme. Herbert Vogg has a most interesting article on the preparation of music for publication. Among other things he notes (no pun intended) that the advanced technology of the computer age has yet to solve the problem of making all the notes

and musical signs found in a composition. Most of the music is still hand-written and then photographed for printing. It is amazing that music still must be hand-written!

R.M.H.

SINGENDE KIRCHE. Volume 31, No. 3, 1984. *Quarterly of the Church Music Commission of the Austrian Bishops.*

In this issue, Peter Planyavsky concludes his article on the use of "pop" music in the sacred liturgy. Ferdinand Haberl contributes an essay on Pius XII and church music. Among many other things, Haberl lists all the documents, some thirty-two of them, which Pius XII issued in regard to liturgy or church music. Of course, the ones of crucial importance are his encyclicals on the liturgy, *Mediator Dei* and *Musicae sacrae disciplina*. Dr. Wolfgang Guhsward has an article on the restoration of the largest pipe organ in the world, the organ in the cathedral in Passau, Germany.

Worthy of some notice is the response to Herbert Vogg's article in the last issue on the preparation of music for publication. A publisher from Frankfurt, West Germany, takes exception to Vogg's contention that there are no machines which can reproduce notes. There is a machine called the music-writer which is available in the United States and in Europe. It is not simply a re-worked typewriter, but a machine designed exclusively to reproduce music on paper. Of course, with such a machine in place, it will not be long before someone discovers a way to adapt the computer to reproducing music and maybe even for composing music. (Cf. *Sacred Music*, Vol. 112, No. 1, in which examples of Gregorian chant produced on computer were printed.)

The Austrians have the custom of noting important birthdays. Usually *Sacred Music* has not reported these articles in *Singende Kirche* because most Americans do not know the people who are honored. However, in this issue, there is an article commemorating the 90th birthday of Monsignor Franz Kosch of Vienna who has been active in church music circles for many years. He was general chairman of the Second International Church Music Congress held in Vienna in 1954, and many will remember him from the Fifth International Church Music Congress in Chicago-Milwaukee in 1966. We surely wish Monsignor Kosch *ad multos annos!*

R.M.H.

UNA VOCE (France). Number 121, March-April 1985.

An article on the Church in Holland is especially pertinent because of the rude and shocking reception given the Holy Father there recently. In assessing the situation, Professor J. P. M. van de Ploeg, O.P. asserts that while the Church in Holland is not dead, its

condition is so bad that for most Catholics true faith probably no longer exists and that it is unlikely that current trends can be stopped. The bishop of Roermond is having some success in trying to re-establish the Catholic faith, but he is vilified in the media and by those who call themselves Catholics. The author believes that the steady mutation going on is similar to what happened in the so-called reformation of the sixteenth century, the difference being that then the Church made it clear that those who had denied their faith were no longer Catholics. Currently no one asks the question in such a clear way and it seems possible to be Catholic on one's own terms. The aberrations in the Dutch Church as detailed in this article are a diabolical litany of horrors. According to the author the only response for a good Catholic is to do his duty to the best of his ability, remembering that the early Christians also lived in a hostile world.

A report is made on the Tridentine Masses that have been celebrated in France since the Holy Father's action made them possible with special permission of the ordinary. Although the number is not great and the bureaucracy is frustrating, there has been a steady stream of traditional Masses that have attracted huge crowds in spite of the ban on all publicity. The situation in other countries is also reported. It ranges from Ottawa in Canada, where the archbishop loaned \$60,000 to match what was raised by the Latin Congregation of Ottawa to buy a church for the celebration of the Tridentine Mass, to Bologna, Italy, where the bishop will only allow the Tridentine Mass on Saturdays because the celebration of Mass for special groups is not allowed on Sundays.

V.A.S.

CAECILIA. Numbers 3-4. March-April 1985.

Lovers of the pipe organ and Francophiles will be especially interested in the list of restored new organs in Alsace. They include: a) a Stiehr organ in the town of Willgottheim built in 1835 and restored in 1984 (It had been invaded by cobwebs, oily dust and the pipes had been eaten away by worms.); b) an organ built by Claude Ignace Callinet in 1844 in Wolxheim whose first stage of restoration was finished in 1984; c) a new organ by Steinmetz placed in a 1790 organ case in Valf; d) in Vendenheim an organ built by Wegmann in the early nineteenth century and newly restored by Gaston Kern; e) a newly restored 1851 Stiehr organ in Bernardvillé; f) a new organ for the chapel of the major seminary in Strasbourg. From my limited observation I would conclude that the tradition of the pipe organ is alive and well in Alsace, at least by comparison to what is happening in the United States. Most of this issue is devoted to the usual features of sample music, suggestions for the liturgy of seasonal feasts and reviews.

V.A.S.

NOVA REVISTA DE MUSICA SACRA. Vol. 11, Series 2, No. 32, 1984. *Trimester periodical of the Sacred Music Commission of Braga, Portugal.*

In an article on the penitential acts at the beginning of Mass, Sebastiao Faria discusses the various options given in the missal and the place of music in the words of the celebrant, the congregation and the choir. The singing of the *Kyrie* and the *Gloria* in relation to the penitential rite is discussed from a practical viewpoint. The issue is made up substantially of examples of music, mostly in Portuguese but also some Latin pieces, intended both for choir use and for congregation. All of it is in a traditional idiom.

R.J.S.

JUBILUS REVIEW. Vol. 2, No. 1, Spring 1985.

With the beginning of its second year of publication, *Jubilus* has an interesting variety of articles. Dr. Thaddeus Chao writes about his membership in a parish choir, and F. T. Magennis and T. Rafferty, both divinity students at Maynooth, tell how they have encouraged congregational singing in a practical description of their experimentation in an Irish parish church. A. R. Bevin gives an account of the situation of church music in England, and Harold Hughesdon writes about vespers in a parish church. The editor has published the Gregorian chants needed by the celebrant for a Latin Mass celebrated with full musical embellishment, the notation coming from the Solesmes edition of the *Ordo Missae in Cantu*. Dom Jean Claire, O.S.B., of Solesmes tells about his associations with Dom Joseph Gajard, the famous choirmaster at Solesmes. Book reviews and news items conclude the issue.

R.J.S.

Books

North Italian Church Music in the Age of Monteverdi by Jerome Roche. New York: Oxford University Press, 1984. 178 pp. \$42.00

The period covered in this volume is one much like the present age. It studies the troubled times following the Council of Trent, when experimentation in church music was prevalent and the new monody was introducing the solo motet, and at the same time the poly-choral compositions of the colossal baroque were still very much in style. The counter-reformation was underway leading to the great developments that had their roots in the conciliar reforms. In many ways the "age of Monteverdi" reflects the picture today and gives hope that out of present confusion a new artistic church music may emerge.

Two fine chapters cover the history of the first half of the seventeenth century, the Council of Trent, the Jesuits, the Oratorians and the counter-reformation

as well as the geographical and social influences on church music. They make good reading even for one not professionally trained as a musician. The impact of the liturgical reforms of the sixteenth century on musical composition and performance is well treated, and the spread of the new music across Europe provides information about areas far distant from Italy and Venice, which formerly had been the places almost exclusively connected with the developments of this era. The very title given the period, "the age of Monteverdi," shows this.

Of interest is the information given about composers whose names have been until now relatively unknown. Much of the music studied in the volume was written for small groups. If today the Latin language would be given the use that the Vatican Council ordered, then much of this music would have a great use and it would fulfill the council's decree that music of the Church's treasury be fostered and used. Hopefully it will be, when the great flowering of the II Vatican Council produces its fruits, as this scholarly book shows happened after the Council of Trent.

There are many musical examples, a fine bibliography and an extensive index.

R.J.S.

Cantus Selecti. Abbaye Saint-Pierre de Solesmes, F-72300 Sablé-sur-Sarthe, France. 292 pp., cloth. 42F.

Cantus Selecti is an extremely useful little book. It contains antiphons, hymns, litanies, responsories and much more, all arranged according to the seasons of the liturgical year.

This book is one of the numerous reprints published by Solesmes during the last decade or so, and its contents are, with a few exceptions, those of the 1949 edition. All of the old instructions for benediction have been omitted, as have several other minor things, and the revised litany of the saints from the new *Graduale* has been added to the appendix.

It is most disappointing that the annotations, which listed a date, source, and short explanation for each of the more than 230 entries, were omitted. Nevertheless, this reprint of *Cantus Selecti*, with its seven settings of the *O Salutaris* and the fifteen of the *Tantum ergo*, remains a must for Mass and benediction of the Blessed Sacrament.

PAUL W. LE VOIR

Graduale Romanum Comitante Organo, Vol. 1, by Abbè Ferdinand Portier. Abbaye Saint-Pierre de Solesmes, F-72330 Sablé-sur-Sarthe, France. 169 pp., cloth. 1984. 100F.

Organ accompaniment for the complex Gregorian chant Mass propers is a bold step for Solesmes to take, but this volume has been produced with their customary class and style. Its 12" x 9" deep blue cover

with gold lettering makes the book handsome and distinctively Solesmes. Not only is it attractive, but it stays open easily.

This is the first of a proposed three-volume set which will eventually provide organ accompaniment for the chant propers of all the Sundays, solemnities and major feasts of the church year. Volume I contains all the solemnities and major feasts including the Christmas midnight Mass and Mass during the day, Epiphany, Easter, Pentecost, Sts. Peter and Paul, All Saints, Immaculate Conception and sixteen more. Volume II will contain the Sundays of advent and lent, and Volume III will have the ordinary Sundays (one hopes there will be room for the Sundays of Easter, too).

Abbè Portier's harmonizations are excellent. Each setting is easy to read, and the beaming of notes is very well one. One does not get lost with repeated notes. The holds placed on some of the eighth notes are not hard to follow, but many are included where they should no longer be. This minor problem, however, can be eliminated with a pencil during rehearsal.

Any organist could play all of these arrangements and accompany the chant with little or no rehearsal.

This is a splendid book which, at the very least, would be an excellent starting point for the study of Gregorian chant accompaniment.

MARY E. GORMLEY

Liber Concelebrantium: Sanctus et Preces Eucharisticae in Cantu. Abbaye Saint-Pierre de Solesmes, F-72300 Sablé-sur-Sarthe, France. 61 pp., paper. 1983. 32F.

With the growing popularity of concelebrated liturgies in recent years, the *Liber Concelebrantium* should remove all the impediments to singing them in Latin. Light, small and flexible, it could never get in the way during a sung, concelebrated Latin high Mass.

The *Liber Concelebrantium* contains all 18 Gregorian settings of the *Sanctus* (the *ad libitum* settings are excluded), followed by the four Eucharistic prayers. Each prayer is fully rubricated, so there should be no confusion, even with minimal rehearsal, about which celebrants sing in Gregorian (square-note) notation, while the parts reserved to the principal celebrant alone (which he would sing from the *Ordo Missae in Cantu*) are simply printed out.

Its content and arrangement make the *Liber Concelebrantium* attractive and highly useful. In other words, it is a typically fine addition to the distinguished Solesmes catalog.

PAUL W. LE VOIR

NEWS

Father John Buchanan's seventy-fifth birthday celebration was a great musical feast as well as a parish observance of the anniversary of its founding pastor. On May 5, 1985, the combined choirs of Holy Childhood Parish in Saint Paul, Minnesota, sang Giacomo Puccini's *Messa di Gloria* with symphonic orchestra and soloists under the direction of Bruce Larsen. Other music performed included *Solemn Melody* by Walford Davies, *Let us now Praise Famous Men* by Vaughan-Williams, *Psalm 97, Sing a Joyous Song* by Antonin Dvorak, *Fanfare Alleluia* by James Hartway and Puccini's *Crisantemi*. The soloists were Stephen Schmall, John Jagoe and Lee Green. Robert Vikery and Mary Downey were organists. Monsignor John O'Sullivan preached, and Father George Welzbacher assisted the jubilarian. The musical program, which dates from the founding of the parish in 1946, includes a boys choir, a women's chorale and a men's schola. Although a small parish, the musical program at Holy Childhood has attracted wide acclaim and makes the Sunday worship truly a model of the directives of the Vatican Council in its fostering of the musical art and the participation of the congregation. ■

Holy Family of Nazareth Parish in Irving, Texas, celebrated Easter with Joseph Haydn's *Missa Brevis (Kleine Orgel-solo Messe)*. In addition to the Gregorian chants for Easter, music by Gerhard Track, Richard Biggs, Joseph Roff and S. Drummond Wolff completed the program. Handel's *Hallelujah* from *Judas Maccabaeus* was the offertory piece. The choir and the instrumentalists were under the direction of Rita Pilgrim. Carl Green was organist. Soloists were Dick Johnston, Mike Sullivan, Karen Fontenot, Eva Simacek, Richard Treat and Ed Flaspoepler. Rev. Thomas P. O'Connor is pastor and Rev. Richard T. Brown is assistant. ■

Mary Elizabeth Gormley, organist at the Church of Saint Agnes, Saint Paul, Minnesota, and a frequent contributor to *Sacred Music*, played a recital of baroque and contemporary compositions at University Baptist Church, Minneapolis, May 12, 1985. Works by Georg Muffat, Heinrich Scheidemann, Girolamo Frescobaldi, J. S. Bach and Jehan Alain made up the program. ■

The first San Anselmo Organ Festival brought many famous performers to San Anselmo, California, July 8 to 12, 1985. Among those participating were Peters Williams, Marilyn Mason, Thomas Harmon, Paul Manz, Sandra Soderlund and the Philharmonia Chamber Soloists. Recitals, lectures and master classes were scheduled and the finals in a national improvisation competition were held. ■

The office of *Tenebrae* was sung at Saint Mary's Cathedral, Portland, Oregon, April 3, 1985, with the Most Reverend Paul E. Waldschmidt, C.S.C., presiding. Music included Thomas Tallis' *Lamentations of Jeremiah*, Tomas Luis de Victoria's *Tenebrae Responsories* and Gregorian chant. The Cantores in Ecclesia sang under the direction of Dean Applegate. The office consists of the hours of matins and lauds, during which the candles and lights in the church are gradually extinguished until darkness (*tenebrae*) results, except for the one remaining candle which represents Christ and remains burning. ■

The Cantores in Ecclesia of Portland, Oregon, under the direction of Dean Applegate have performed an extensive repertory of renaissance music at various liturgical events. On February 2, 1985, for the feast of Candlemas, they sang William Byrd's *Mass for Four Voices* and his *Senex Puerum* and *Diffusa est gratia* together with the Gregorian settings of the proper texts, at the Church of St. Philip Neri in Portland. On February 20, Ash Wednesday, they sang Palestrina's *Missa Aeterna Christi Munera* and his *Peccantem me quotidie* and *Super Flumina Babylonis* and the Gregorian chants for the proper at the Church of St. Michael the Archangel, also in Portland. On May 1, 1985, the Cantores in Ecclesia sang Andrea Gabrieli's *Missa Brevis* and Claudio Monteverdi's *Cantate Domino* and *Adoramus Te, Christe* at St. Andrew's Church, Portland, Oregon, for the feast of St. Joseph the Worker. ■

William Jenner played a concert of organ works at the Church of Saint Rose of Lima in Chelsea, Massachusetts, May 19, 1985. The program included Charles Marie Widor's *Symphony III*, first movement, Charles Arnould Tournemire's *Communion for the Feast of the Assumption* from *L'Orgue Mystique*, and Jean-Jacques Grunenwald's *Messe du Saint-Sacrement*. After the organ recital, the Schola Amicorum sang vespers and the event concluded with benediction of the Blessed Sacrament. Members of the schola are Richard Kitch, Francis Kulash, Constance Mitchell, Mary Steffes and Coleman Terrell. ■

Valerian Fox of Portland, Oregon, died suddenly at his home on May 13, 1985, after suffering a heart attack as he was mowing the lawn. For the past twenty-five years he has been organist and choirmaster at St. Mary's Cathedral in Portland. Born in Sandusky, Ohio, April 30, 1921, he came from a family long engaged in church music. He studied at DeSales College in Toledo, Toledo University and Northwestern University in Evanston, Illinois. He is survived by his wife, Marian, four sons and three daughters. The funeral was held at the cathedral on May 17. The Very Reverend Alan J. Kennedy, pastor, preached. Burial was in Mount Calvary Cemetery in Portland. R.I.P. R.J.S.

EDITORIAL NOTES

Papal Honors

In his article on papal knights, printed elsewhere in this issue, Dr. Galles makes reference to two Americans who received special recognition from the Holy See for their work in church music. He mentions John Singenberger, founder of *Caecilia*, the forerunner of *Sacred Music*, and Nicola A. Montani, one of the founders of *The Catholic Chormaster*, which merged with *Caecilia* to become *Sacred Music* in 1964.

There are many other Americans who have also been honored by papal decorations and appointments. Among those who come to mind are Roger Wagner, Justine Ward, Paul Salamunovich, Pietro Yon, Arthur Reilly, Marie Roy, J. Vincent Higginson, Frank Campbell-Watson, Noel Goemanne and Clara Schroepfer. Some have received knighthood and others have received medals.

There are more. It would be a laudable thing to preserve the names of these great musicians who did so much for the Church in our country through the art of music. If you will send us their names and the order or decoration that they have received from the Holy See, we will publish the list in one of the forthcoming issues of *Sacred Music*.

R.J.S.

Choirs

Although the Second Vatican Council ordered that choirs be fostered and have a place of importance in our liturgy, many cathedral and parish choirs were swept away following the close of the council through a misunderstanding of the council's directives. Many, however, must have survived the confusion of those years and are now flourishing, singing good and artistic sacred music, both in Latin and in the vernacular.

Sacred Music is interested in publishing accounts of those groups. A brief history of their origins and their accomplishments, before and after the council, their programs and the persons responsible for the existence and progress of the choirs, would be most welcome, and many would be happy to learn about the achievements in other parishes and dioceses.

An example of what has happened at one parish can be found at the Church of the Holy Childhood in Saint Paul, Minnesota, where Father John Buchanan has directed his parish musical life through the turmoil and helped it to develop and flower, serving the parish in full accord with the conciliar liturgical reforms. There are others, and the various accounts would provide strength, joy and encouragement to everyone. *Sacred Music* will welcome your accounts. Send them to the editor.

R.J.S.

OPEN FORUM

Strident Cries

In the article entitled "The Tridentine Mass" (*Sacred Music*, Vol. 111, No. 4, Winter 1984), you spoke of the "strident cries" of the liturgical establishmentarians upon the publication of the recent indult regarding the Tridentine Mass. I was reminded of the reaction of my canon law classmates last winter to canon 928 of the revised code of canon law (RCIC).

The class covered the sacraments of initiation—baptism, confirmation and the holy Eucharist—and studied canons 840 to 958. It was one of several classes required for the pontifical degree of licentiate in canon law at Saint Paul University, Ottawa, Canada. Despite the intrinsic importance of the subject matter, most of the hundred or so students in the class sat through it mute and apathetic. The instructor was frankly poor and was often inaudible. The more enterprising of my classmates reacted by reading *Time* or *Newsweek*. Class participation was only a stroke above zero on a scale of zero to a thousand.

But then came canon 928. There was an explosion of class participation. A group of Ottawa Catholics, known as "The Latin Community of Ottawa," had maintained the tradition of the Latin liturgy for a decade and a half, never ceasing the while to implore the Jesuit Martyrs of North America for the restoration of the peace, order and beauty of the Tridentine Mass. When the indult was announced, they immediately sought permission for a Tridentine Latin Mass. It was granted. At the same time they took the big step that every young married couple dreams of. They ceased to be renters and became "homeowners," buying their own chapel. They celebrated the double miracle (as they called it) with a Tridentine Latin Mass in their very own modest chapel on the fourth Sunday of advent. Since then it has been the scene of a Latin Tridentine Mass daily, except Mondays.

The would-be canonists saw no cause for joy, however. Canon 928 proclaims: "The eucharistic celebration is to be carried out either in the Latin language or in another language, provided the liturgical texts have been lawfully approved." It is a magnificent canon, a sort of liturgical bill of rights. It guarantees the right of Latin to exist as a liturgical language in the Latin rite of the Roman Catholic Church. It proclaims in clear terms that in the Latin Church the Latin language is at least a legitimate option and that it exists as such by leave of no episcopal conference or local ordinary. Indeed, it ensures that the Latin liturgy can only be lawfully suppressed by the supreme authority in the Church. My classmates were not amused.

The canon, in the light of the recent indult, was seen as giving aid and comfort to groups like the Latin Community of Ottawa. One priest objected that the Latin Community was a "parish in all but name." He feared the Community would baptize their young and propagate their peculiar views. He saw the Latin Community as "devisive." (James Conant as president of Harvard College charged Roman Catholic schools with the same offense some forty years ago.) Indeed, his worst fears have been proved correct. The Latin Community includes many young people and the sacraments of baptism and confirmation have been celebrated in their chapel.

Needless to say, among my canonical classmates there was little concern for *all* God's children, except the concern that certain of them and their unwelcome views die quietly, lest the cancer spread.

DUANE L.C.M. GALLES

CONTRIBUTORS

Duane L.C.M. Galles is a lawyer. He studied at Saint John's University in Collegeville, Minnesota, and at the University of Minnesota in Minneapolis. He holds a bachelor's degree from George Washington University and a master's degree from the University of Minnesota, as well as the J.D. degree from William Mitchell College of Law in Saint Paul, Minnesota. At present he is a student of canon law at Saint Paul University in Ottawa, Canada.



Copies of articles from this publication are now available from the UMI Article Clearinghouse.

For more information about the Clearinghouse, please fill out and mail back the coupon below.

UMI Article Clearinghouse

Yes! I would like to know more about UMI Article Clearinghouse. I am interested in electronic ordering through the following system(s):

- DIALOG/Dialorder ITT Dialcom
 OnTyme OCLC ILL Subsystem
 Other (please specify) _____
 I am interested in sending my order by mail.
 Please send me your current catalog and user instructions for the system(s) I checked above.

Name _____

Title _____

Institution/Company _____

Department _____

Address _____

City _____ State _____ Zip _____

Phone (____) _____

Mail to: University Microfilms International
300 North Zeeb Road, Box 91 Ann Arbor, MI 48106