SACRED MUSIC
Volume 102, Number 4, Winter 1975

THE CHRIST PRINCIPLE IN THE LITURGY
Rev. Edward Holloway 3

SOLESMES IN THE 1970’S
Joseph O’Connor 7

HOW TO BUY A PIPE ORGAN
Anna Marie Ettel 11

THE MUSICAL SHAPE OF THE LITURGY
Part II: The Interpolation of Polyphonic Music
William Peter Mahrt 16

NATIVE MUSIC FOR THE MISSIONS
Monsignor Richard J. Schuler 27

MUSICAL SUPPLEMENT 31

REVIEWS 35

CONTRIBUTORS 40

MEMBERS IN PROFILE 40

NEWS 42

FROM THE EDITORS 43

INDEX 47
SACRED MUSIC

Continuation of Caecilia, published by the Society of St. Caecilia since 1874, and The Catholic Choirmaster, published by the Society of St. Gregory of America since 1915. Published quarterly by the Church Music Association of America. Office of publication: 548 Lafond Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55103.

Editorial Board:
Rev. Msgr. Richard J. Schuler, Editor
Rev. John Buchanan
Mother C. A. Carroll, R.S.C.J.
Harold Hughesdon
William P. Mahrt
William F. Pohl
Virginia A. Schubert
Cal Stepan
B. Allen Young

News:
Rev. Msgr. Richard J. Schuler
548 Lafond Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55103

Music for Review:
Mother C. A. Carroll, R.S.C.J., Manhattanville College of the Sacred Heart, Purchase, New York 10577
Paul Salamunovich, 10828 Valley Spring Lane, N. Hollywood, Calif. 91602
Cal Stepan, 18928 Winslow Rd., Shaker Heights, Ohio 44122
Rev. Ralph S. March, S.O.Cist., Route 2, Box 1, Irving, Texas 75062

Membership, Circulation and Advertising:
B. Allen Young, 373 Stinson Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55117

CHURCH MUSIC ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

Officers and Board of Directors
President
Gerhard Track
Vice-President
Rev. Robert Skens
General Secretary
Rev. Msgr. Richard J. Schuler
Treasurer
Mrs. Richard H. Dres
Directors
Mrs. Richard K. Biggs
Dr. John McManemin
Noel Goemanne
Mrs. Donald G. Vellek

Membership in the CMAA includes a subscription to SACRED MUSIC. Voting membership, $12.50 annually; subscription membership, $7.50 annually; student membership, $4.00 annually. Single copies, $2.00. Send membership applications and changes of address to B. Allen Young, 373 Stinson Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55117. Make all checks payable to Church Music Association of America.

Second class postage paid at St. Paul, Minnesota.
Library of Congress catalog card number: 62-6712/MN
Sacred Music is indexed in the Catholic Periodical and Literature Index.

Cover: The National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception, Washington, D.C.

Copyright, Church Music Association of America, 1976
THE CHRIST PRINCIPLE IN THE LITURGY

The Catholic principle in the liturgy of the Church is no different from the Christ principle in dogma, or in the inspiration and interpretation of the scriptures. The personal God, living Wisdom and Truth, not only reveals doctrine, but through great, prophetic souls prompts also its apt liturgical expression. The great soul so raised, whether priest, or prophet, or both in one person, understands the full and sacred expression, and the mystical meaning of this sacred thing, in communion with God. This understanding is effected through the seer's higher sanctity, a sanctity which accompanies the charism of his prophetic office from God, to the people of God. The revelation does not proceed from man, nor does the recognition of its liturgical expression, or the authority for that liturgy derive by democratic sanction from the people. The liturgy derives through the sanction of the doctrine, through revelation. The prophet himself is not self-justified, his message has to be accepted by the official, God-instituted structure of monarchical religious authority over the people of God, and that authority alone has power to erect the liturgy of this way of life. These rulers of faith may well take much from prophet, and from saintly, gifted souls. The
authority however is theirs, directly from God. Read the liturgical enactments of the liturgical books of the Old Testament — they speak for themselves. The liturgy is "decided" by God, through Moses. So even earlier Enoch the Just, who "walked with God as Adam did," first began, from his authority, "to call upon the name of the Lord."

This God-directed liturgy had to be of this type, because the whole faith of Israel, its doctrine, and its liturgy was prophetic and manifestive of the Messiah to come. The Passover prefigures both the Cross and the Eucharist. It could not have come from the parish council. When this process comes to a climax in Jesus Christ, and the gospel of the new and eternal covenant is promulgated, the same type and process continues in a higher, fuller magisterium within the Church. The Christian liturgy does not take over the incidentals of the temple worship, and pharisaic disciplines. It does take over the essentials of God-directed type, of prophecy fulfilled and manifested, of majestic wisdom, truth revealed, and God, not man, communicated. It takes over the whole Bible, Old and New Testament alike. The beginning of that Christian liturgy is expressed by Christ himself, in the Last Supper and its sacerdotal prayer. It is committed to the Twelve alone for keeping, for authority, and through the Spirit, for development down the ages.

In the development of the Christian liturgy there must be the eduction of deep meaning, sacred communion, and reverent awe in relation to the deposit of the Faith. This is given to the Church through the vision of unique and holy souls. It is communicated to beautiful expression by themselves or by others. The "imprimatur" and the "fiat" to this recognition and its enactment rests with the Apostles, not with the community. For the life revealed and living in the liturgy is still the Divine Fulness, not the gimmicks of trendy men and women. The long, slow, organic process cannot derive from parish or diocesan council, nor from committee men, and certainly not from fashionable liturgical centres, not even French. This genuine, slow, enriching degree of change derives from Fathers of the Church, or from saints like Aquinas, who not only wrote a Mass for the Body and Blood of Christ, and its lovely octave (now destroyed by liturgical vandals), but put it to magnificent music into the bargain. It was the pope however, who approved and accepted his Mass.

In this way, slowly and organically, through the magisterium of the Church, not through commissions who must change everything all the time to justify their existence, the magnificent vision of God, and of Christ the Priest and Holy Sacrifice, deepens in continuity of liturgical type, in the life of the Church. Continuity of type means that there will not be a flux of options, nor sudden, discontinuous change in the celebration of the liturgy, nor in its impact on the people. Sudden, discontinuous change destroys the meaning of the faith as lived in liturgy, as much as sudden and discontinuous doctrinal opinions destroy the faith as believed and passed on.

Continuity of type means that development will retain what is recognizably the same essential liturgical structure, and the same hierarchical subordination of people to priest. It is a law of natural bodily development, quite opposed to the law of neo-modernism. The law of Christ-guided development in doctrine draws out a wider vision, a richer perspective of God in His works, whether Father, Son, or Holy Spirit. This development is always through the same configuration of doctrine and life. Modernism disintegrates the unique type, and
organic configuration of doctrine, and liturgical life, and replaces it with a man-oriented, culturally dated new type. Compare the liturgy of the Greek and Latin rites, as types of living unto God, with the Baptist worship, the free Evangelical conventicle, the Salvation Army. Here there is a difference of liturgy which parallels exactly a difference of doctrine and magisterium. Then ask yourself where the new, "spontaneous" trends in a very impoverished, very un-beautiful liturgy are going. Are they true to the historic type, or to the man-made churches, doctrines, and liturgies? However much the Christian liturgy is adapted to the genius of individual nations and cultures, the essential type common to the great liturgies of East and West must remain. This is because human nature is identical in all cultures.

Through the Old Testament and the New Testament in Christ, God has given a Church, a Church built on men, to be the unique trustee of the communication of God in person to all nations, tongues, and tribes. There is therefore a unity of type, of structure, and of relationship to God in beauty and reverent awe, which must be common to every Christian liturgy which is true to Christ, Who is the sacrament of the world. Cultural differences will make only incidental differences to this, as we find when we study the classical liturgy of the Roman Latin Church, and of the Greek Church, or the ancient Arab liturgies. We find the same unity of manner and approach, the same basic structure of going to God in the liturgy, in saints as diverse as Ambrose of Milan and Ephraem the Syrian. In much the same way human beings, of every race and color, love and marry across their cultural boundaries. For human nature is the same in all of us. In this matter the apostles, including Paul, teacher of the nations, made no concessions at all to the cultures they evangelized, as Pope Paul reminded certain missionary bishops at the end of the last synod of Rome. In Christian liturgy, as in doctrine, there is a giving of God to man through Christ, there is monarchical and transcendent giving: the type, the unity, the worship, and the relationship to God is from Him downwards; it is not from the conventicle upwards.

There is every sign that this monarchical principle, this reverence for the type and structure of the Christian liturgy, itself guaranteed by the unique power and character of the sacerdotal office in the liturgy, is being lost sight of and eroded. The erosion is coming from Rome herself. We are losing sight of the law of slow, reverent, tradition-based change. This is occurring because the personal rule of holy men, the rule of the apostles, has been too completely delegated and dissolved in large, impersonal, international commissions and councils. These commissions are now out of the control of the bishops, and they are also, in the present state of the Church, in the hands very largely of men confused, perhaps unconsciously, by false principles and trends deriving from the current wave of virulent neo-modernism.

We have the situation of the Arian heresy upon us again. The error and the confusion is worse at the top than down at the bottom. The remedy is for the pope and the bishops truly loyal to Him in faith, and not merely in the saying of Lord, Lord, to take over as apostles with a personal mandate and a personal charism of status, from the confusion of their own committee men. Let them work into the future, through the structure of the past. Let them work from their own personal love of that holiness with meaning and beauty, which lives in the classic liturgy of the Church. This is our inheritance as God's household of the Old Covenant.
and the New. This would reinstate the familial and hierarchical principle by which the Church lives, in the area of liturgy, where it needs to be reaffirmed, as it does also in doctrine, and structures.

Even in the liturgy there is room for a distinction between the Ecclesia docens and the Ecclesia discens (the Church teaching, and the Church learning). There is always room for sincere consultation, for listening humbly to every rank of God’s people — not excluding bishops. We are though more likely to get that which brings forth God’s perfect praise from the “little ones” of the parishes, than from sophisticated leaders of liturgical pressure groups. In the last analysis, it is not the principal consumers of liturgy, carefully brainwashed by “experts” who guide and construct the liturgy of the Church. The liturgy is the apt expression, guided by God, of the divine, of the Christlike, as it lives incarnate in the Church’s prayer and praise. This is mediated to the people of God through the apostolic and sacerdotal priesthood. A fulness of this sort awaits saints, not committees. In making change and renewal we must invoke the witness, the type, and the tradition of all the ages gone before, not the “insights” of a few, confused years. St. Thomas More reminded his judges of that, when against the men of trend in the universities, he invoked the witness to the Faith, of all the saints and doctors, martyrs and confessors who had gone before his own age of confused error. Let us bear that witness of Thomas More in mind today. There is a visible type, and unit in the liturgy of God revealing, all the way from Abel the Just to the parousia of the Son of God. Constant change, expressive of human whim, distraction, and man-centred vanity, destroys the unity and dignity of the liturgy of Christ, as the expression of God Incarnate, Emmanuel, God with us, ever living, teaching, and communing with us in the Church. Let the liturgy make us listen to Him, in a deep sense of the sacred, not to our noisy selves. This is the deepest sense of the adage Lex orandi, Lex credendi, “The liturgy is the Faith, as it rises to God in prayer.”

REV. EDWARD HOLLOWAY
SOLESMES IN THE 1970’S

L’Abbaye St. Pierre de Solesmes, two miles from Sablé sur Sarthe and thirty minutes by train from LeMans, needs no introduction to the church musician or the liturgist. It traces its history back to the high Middle Ages and possesses a church and priory building which outline the community’s prayer life down to the eighteenth century. Like all French religious houses, St. Pierre watched the persecution of her sons in the Revolution. The church lay open to the elements, and with “bare ruined choirs” boasted at least of being abandoned rather than endure the deistic rites that desecrated Notre Dame in Paris.

The well-known story of the abbey’s revival in the nineteenth century by Prosper Guéranger has served as a tenor for its life ever since: contemplative prayer, quiet affirmation of faith, the maintenance of tradition. Guéranger had to go to Rome to bring not only monasticism but the Roman liturgy back to France. The French were using their Gallican missals at that time and in some quarters were even keeping August 16 as the feast of St. Napoleon. The tumult caused by what Solesmes stood for then and now has grown in proportion to the strength of the community itself, which now numbers about one hundred monks includ-
ing those away at various priories. The original community has founded twenty-two houses on four continents. The nuns across the road at Ste. Cécile have been equally far-reaching.

Fidelity to the Holy See is the hallmark of Solesmes. It is more important than even the chant or Latin. Rome has entrusted the monks with any number of tasks and has frequently sent its apostolic benediction to the monastery. It is this fidelity that has perhaps been the one real source of stability through the civil tumult in France at the turn of this century as well as the ecclesiastic tumult of the last ten years. What has happened at Solesmes during these years? How have the monks borne the sudden shift from popularity to deprecation in some quarters? Are they even singing chant at all any more?

Solesmes has not only accepted the liturgical changes, it was responsible for some of them (the official changes, that is). Abbot Jean Prou sat on one of the committees which shaped Sacrosanctum concilium, the constitution on the sacred liturgy. When the new missal of Paul VI came in Advent of 1969, the monks embraced it at the request of the Holy Father so that an exemplary way of celebration would be worked out for the rest of the world to draw upon. The offices have been pared down to exactly what St. Benedict sets forth in his rule, no more, no less. The usual arrangement of choir monks and lay brothers is gradually being phased out, not swept away at a stroke. It is almost certain that for this reason Solesmes remains a vital community of monks eager to serve one another, rather than a wasteland of buildings with few members left as has been the fate of any number of monasteries which attempted total and immediate adjustment of their social structures. Lay brothers now sit in choir with the monks in holy orders and participate as fully in the office as they can. The novitiate has been merged for both groups as far as studies are concerned. The candidates live apart and have different spiritual directors but the same novice master.

Solesmes remains in the forefront in the preparation of chant books for the new rites. The 1974 edition of the Graduale Romanum was done at Solesmes and it has served to squelch the argument that “there are no books for the new rites.” The Antiphonale Romanum is almost finished and will shortly appear providing the music for the celebration of the renewed hours of the office in Latin. The books are available directly from the monastery.

The abbey church in which the monks pray and celebrate the sacred liturgy is the oldest portion of the monastery. Parts of the church date from the eleventh century. The transepts were added in the Renaissance period and house some of the finest statuary in France. One transept was built to enshrine a relic of the crown of thorns which is still exposed there on Easter Monday. The other transept is adorned with a portrayal of Our Lord returned to give communion to the Virgin Mary, a sculpture of the dormition and assumption of Mary reaching from the floor to the vault, and an interesting rendition of the finding of Christ in the temple in which a caricature of Martin Luther is used as one of the priests in the temple looking very confounded. Dom Guéranger added a long neo-gothic choir in the nineteenth century which contains choir stalls from the Renaissance. The area of the altar has undergone some rather radical changes since the erection of the choir. A detailed recitation of the changes would convince almost any American that the last ten years in this country have been only a wink of the eye.
compared to what Solesmes has experienced in the last one hundred. They have, in fact, changed altars no less than five times since 1870!

Vestments used by the celebrant and the deacon at Mass are those from the solemn sets. Concelebrants wear identical chasubles designed by the late sacristan, Père Delaborde. Others assisting with the rites wear albs, from the master of ceremonies to the candle bearers. The four cantors who sit in front of the cantoris side of the stalls for solemnities each wear a cope to match the celebrant's chasuble (or at vespers, his cope), and the premier chantre carries a staff, symbol of his authority and responsibility. The rest of the community is dressed simply in monastic habit, which is worn on the abbey grounds as well as on trips away from the monastery whether they are long or short. The abbot travels to all four continents in his habit, complete with the red zucchetto.

A description of the celebration of Mass at Solesmes is interesting. The community enters the choir to organ music on Sundays, solemnities and feasts. On other days there is silence. When they are in their stalls, the abbot signals the beginning of Mass with his gavel (just as St. Benedict instructs), and after a bow from each side of the choir, the introit is begun. The offices begin with the same rap of the gavel and bow. This was always one of the most comforting moments to a displaced American — as familiar a sound as the beginning of a New England town meeting.

When the celebrant, deacon, lector and ceremony assistants hear the first notes of the introit, they emerge from the sacristy and come to the altar where they genuflect before the Blessed Sacrament. Everyone finds his place and the celebrant and deacon incense the altar. The celebrant’s chair is a kind of Roman legate’s piece located to the south of the altar at the edge of the choir stalls. From there he conducts the liturgia verbi turning toward the east to sing the oration.

After the celebrant’s greeting, the psalms of Terce are sung, and then the Kyrie and Gloria follow except on Sunday when the Asperges or Vidi aquam is inserted between the greeting and the psalms. The procession for the gospel is performed with candles and incense. The deacon also reads the petitions of the oratio fidelium. Homilies are rare, perhaps four times a year when the abbot gives them. The offertory is begun by two of the community who go to the sacristy for the gifts and present them to the deacon and celebrant. The organist has an opportunity to play if the antiphon is short or if the celebrant is slow. Dom Claude Gay, the organist, is the world’s champion at anticipating any and every celebrant.

Before the preface, the concelebrants come from the stalls and stand in a semi-circle around the altar, leaving the front open to view from the nave. All of the priests sing the words of consecration as the bell in the tower tolls. After communion, the concelebrants return to their stalls and the celebrant to his chair. The Mass closes with the same Ite missa est being used for all seasons except Easter. The celebrant leads the community out with the organ playing a postlude or on some days in silence.

Vespers and lauds of a great solemnity are most interesting offices to attend. Since the monks at Solesmes had always done what St. Benedict’s rule ordered, there was little to change in the renewed offices besides removing some of the extras that had been added at the beginning and the end of the office. Otherwise, vespers and lauds are the breathtaking prayers that they always have been

O’CONNOR: SOLESMES

9
for the Benedictines. Anyone who is not moved by Sunday vespers and benediction of the Blessed Sacrament cannot be moved.

The abbey at Fontgombault was the last of the monasteries of the Congregation of France to adopt the new missal. Fontgombault had received permission from Rome to compose a special missal for use in the Benedictine order. But practices in other monasteries throughout the world are so diverse that the project of a common missal was abandoned, and the new Roman missal was put into use at Fontgombault too.

Solesmes is today the head of not just a French group of monasteries; it is a worldwide congregation as is Subiaco. Solesmes represents a certain point of view within monastic life as well. It emphasizes contemplation as it always has; it uses the Latin language and Gregorian chant as tools of worship as it always has; it has a special devotion to the Virgin Mary as it always has had; and finally it is singular in its devotion to the successor of St. Peter as it will remain so. Dom Guéranger had a figure of St. Peter removed from a statuary group in the transept and placed on a pedestal in the nave. Peter holds the keys and wears the tiara. His foot has been tipped with gold. It is a local custom to offer prayers at the foot of the statue and to conclude by kissing the foot of St. Peter. Ça, c'est Solesmes.

JOSEPH O’CONNOR

Sanctuary, Abbey St. Pierre of Solesmes

Tabernacle, Abbey St. Pierre of Solesmes
HOW TO BUY A PIPE ORGAN

It was a jubilant morning for the choir the day the news came that we had the pastor’s permission to explore the purchase of an organ. We had long dreamed of a beautiful pipe organ for our fine church but with the many changes in liturgical music since Vatican II we had held little hope of attaining that dream. The good news seemed to our small choir a miracle in these musically unsettled times.

Maternity of Mary Parish in St. Paul was established in 1949. From a modest surplus army barrack, which housed our first church, and a reed organ, it has come a remarkable distance. Today the parish is a debt-free complex consisting of the rectory, a large school, an income-producing ex-convent and a very handsome church with a seating capacity of 1,000. Acoustically, it is outstanding with a reverberation period of 3 seconds. Whether the elongated hexagonal shape with unbroken interior space, the use of Mankato stone for both exterior and interior, or the four plane roof design accounts for this near acoustical perfection, no one knows. It may be a combination of all of them, one of those lucky acoustical accidents architects hope for but cannot guarantee in their designs.

In the 1950’s the army barrack was abandoned. The church was moved to a basement structure which was to be the foundation of a new church and a $3,500 Conn electric organ was donated to the parish. It soon became evident the parish would outgrow the size of the church originally planned and a completely new structure was designed and completed in 1962. The Conn organ was transferred to the spacious balcony of the church and another speaker for the organ was added. It was completely inadequate and doubly so since the speakers were underpowered for the space and concealed in pipe chambers. The choir has had constant difficulty in hearing the organ.

That jubilant morning was in April, 1973, and the Conn is still in use. Our plans are for a new pipe organ in the spring of 1976, but the period between that April morning and our final decision provided the organ committee members
with an experience none of us ever anticipated. There were days in our first year when it seemed that our indecisiveness would be interminable. We had chosen at the start not to engage a consultant as the committee members preferred first to seek for themselves a consensus of the tonal qualities we desired before settling on a builder.

As chairman of the organ committee, I chose a small group which I felt had special talents to offer. One of the problems which other organ committees had encountered was finding time when committee members could get together to visit churches and to listen to various organs. In some instances these committees agonized years before making a decision. It was for this reason that we deliberately kept our committee small. Many committees are constituted mainly of businessmen, but unless they are also musicians, it seemed unwise to depend on their musical sensibilities to choose a builder. Four members of the choir, a businessman and three homemakers, were chosen. All have fine voices, sensitive ears and years of musical experience. The fifth member of the committee is a successful businessman of special talents, a trustee of the parish, a building contractor who worked closely with the pastor, contractor and architect at the time the church was built and is intimate with its every detail. He insisted he did not know anything about music and chose to leave the selection of a builder to the balance of the committee, but we know his contribution will be very valuable at the time of installation when mechanical assistance and advice are required. In his own way, he is a very important committee member. Besides musical abilities, the second important thing the committee member had was time — time to visit various organs, check installations and above all, time to listen to them.

In retrospect, the initial blitheness of the committee quickly vanished when we realized the serious responsibility we had in choosing an organ. It is not like purchasing a new car which can be traded in if it is unsatisfactory. We had had absolutely no concept of the time which would be involved. But for each of us, the time has been well spent because each of us has been personally enriched with new knowledge and a great appreciation of the complexities of custom organ design and building.

Since we had chosen to make our own determination of the quality of sound we hoped to achieve, the first months were spent in self-education. We went to the library, checked out records, books and magazines on organs. We studied and listened to recent installations, most of which were in Protestant churches. One of the first things we found was that in setting a budget for an instrument, in some Lutheran churches it is not uncommon to use a figure of 10% of the building cost as a suitable cost for an organ. The second thing we found was that for the kind of an organ the committee desired our original budget was inadequate. Inflation was wreaking havoc with prices and our budget sights were raised.

We were happy that ecumenism had taken hold. Since there have been so few Catholic church installations of new organs in recent years, we visited Protestant installations where staffs and organists were most helpful. Our self-education was assisted by various organ manufacturers' representatives we contacted. They met us at churches to demonstrate and explain the virtues of their particular installations. It was a frustrating year because at no time did we hear an organ of a size we could afford which prompted us to say, "Let's try for one like that."
When we thought the sound was tubby or muddy, we were told the acoustics of the building were poor. Other instruments had excessive chiff or were overscaled for the space. Certain stops on otherwise pleasing instruments were strident and harsh. The nadir of our first year's listening was during the gas shortage when, to conserve gas, we drove slowly 250 miles on a Sunday night to listen to a dedication recital on the dullest instrument we had heard. Its manufacturer lost us that evening.

At that time we began to wonder if we were being unduly critical, but we did feel we were half-way to a decision. At least we knew what we didn't want and were in complete agreement that we didn't want an electronic organ for a number of reasons. We felt that the trackers we had heard had a clarity lacking in other types. And over the months we had heard that a number of churches had spent considerable sums establishing organ funds to rehabilitate or replace instruments which were really not old because the leathers in the electro-pneumatic action had deteriorated. Because of this problem it seemed illogical to us to buy an instrument with a potentially short life for placement in a stone church which should stand for centuries.

For a number of years we had been listening to the music from KSJN in Collegeville, Minnesota. This is an FM station which devotes a good deal of its programming to classical music, including organ repertory. We decided to contact Michael Barone, the station's music director, and ask him for advice in finding the kind of instrument we wanted. He invited us to spend several afternoons at the station, listening to recordings of various organs, and it was here that we decided that a tracker sound was what we sought. It was like a beautiful lake in the summer, shimmering on the surface and with great clarity in its depth. In this sound there was neither inner murkiness nor muddy bottoms. Impressed by the work of a small builder in Ohio, we contacted him only to be disappointed. He was booked four years ahead, his costs were higher than our budget, and he wanted an escalation clause to protect himself from further inflation. We had to forget about this builder.

Mr. Barone suggested that Randolph Bourne, also on the KSJN staff, could be of great assistance to us. He had studied organ in Europe and had played extensively on trackers. With him as a most helpful advisor, we contacted a local tracker organ designer whose instruments were fabricated in Europe. We listened to his recent installations, spoke with representatives of churches which had purchased his organs and found them to be completely satisfied with his work. Knowing that small builders are sometimes undercapitalized and have difficult periods between large contracts, we checked his financial status and found it to be satisfactory.

After many consultations, specifications were drawn, a bid was submitted and accepted. Once we made our recommendation, we felt our work was done and the organ could be ordered. Our pastor, however, had other ideas. Initially he had gotten permission from the Archbishop to buy an organ, but the parish had never voted on it. He now decided that the idea of the purchase of an organ should be presented to the entire parish. A meeting was called which the pastor opened with a prayer to the Holy Ghost for divine guidance. He explained that financial resources of the parish would permit buying an organ at this time, and called on the committee chairman to present the committee's report and recom-
mendations. He then excused himself and never returned to the meeting. I was left surprised and in charge of the meeting, prepared to present the report and answer questions about our choice, but not to conduct a potentially controversial meeting. There were a few dissident voices within the group; they inquired what musical plans would be forthcoming in the future and questioned why the financial resources of the parish were being spent on an organ rather than on social action programs. The builder and Mr. Bourne were introduced and both spoke on the proposed installation. A vote was finally taken and the majority did approve the purchase of the organ by accepting the committee's recommendations.

While the committee had no control of this sequence of events, it would seem that should a parish consensus have been desired, it would have been more logical to have taken it even before a committee was formed. If the project had been vetoed at this meeting, many months of the committee's time would have been completely wasted.

With the parishioners' approval for the organ, we asked the builder for his contract and encountered further difficulties. There were clauses in the contract which the builder had never mentioned. One called for the church to assume ownership of the organ at the point of European shipment. Having once bought a car in Germany which was battered about in a Great Lakes gale, I had had first-hand experience with the troubles of a marine insurance adjustment and knew what trouble in transit could mean. And there were still the hazards of transit from the U.S. port of entry to the church to be considered. In addition, the contract called for an 85% payment at the time the organ was shipped. Such a contract was completely unacceptable; the committee was flabbergasted, not only by the contract terms but by the builder's late disclosure. Other builders' contract terms were all very similar as to percentages of payment at certain completion points of the fabrication and we had unfortunately presumed this builder's contract would be of the same pattern. We felt we had been led up the garden path to the point of an unacceptable contract by his failure to inform us that he had such a contract in mind. Upon legal advice, we requested a performance bond. The builder attempted to modify the contract slightly, but because he was unable to furnish the bond, the contract was rejected. About two weeks later he called and said he could get the necessary financing but it was too late. We had lost faith.

It is most unfortunate that some builders find themselves in this kind of a predicament of undercapitalization because it results in a predicament for the potential purchaser too. The committee did not question the wisdom of the parish lawyer but at this point we had no builder. There are certain hazards when one chooses a small builder and depends upon the talents of one man for the design, installation and voicing of an instrument. Only recently in St. Paul, a Protestant church had made a substantial payment on a contract to an eastern builder only to lose its money as the builder defaulted. There is an element of insecurity in dealing with some small builders but we still feel that if they are properly financed they could provide small churches with affordable organs. They do not have to advertise nationally or have a sales staff or manufacturer's representatives to skim a percentage off the top of the contract price. They could also provide a closer, more personal contact with the committee than a far-
distant, larger builder. But it’s the sad story of the marketplace: the little-moneyed people get squeezed and big businesses get bigger.

Other small builders of merit had been considered by the committee but because we had been through a particularly difficult experience, we did not care to chance repeating it with another small builder. The committee remained firm in its desire to have a tracker instrument so we turned to one of the large, long-established firms we had considered earlier. We knew this company was headed by a man of prestige with many years of experience building trackers here and abroad. He came to St. Paul to see the church and within six weeks we had agreed upon specifications and signed a contract. Prices continued to escalate and it seemed prudent to delay no further. The craftsmanship of this company is superior, borne out by its fine reputation, and the committee has every confidence that its organ will be a product of its best abilities.

This all may seem a study in frustration and at times misdirected energies. But what are the options? We initially could have engaged one consultant who would have specified his desires in an organ, or engaged another, equally qualified, who would have preferred a quite different instrument. Who is to say which would have been better, or if either would have provided the kind of sound we hope to achieve? In addition, consultants sometimes have favorite builders whom they tend to promote. Granted that consultants supposedly are more knowledgeable than the people who hire them. In that case, is there any use for the existence of a committee except to rubber stamp with approval the consultant’s choice? Is an organ selection committee’s function only to seek out a consultant?

Another option is to succumb to the blandishments of certain builders. They offer free plane trips for the committee to visit their plants or to listen to their installations in Atlanta and elsewhere. But what does a committee do after such favors? We thought it would be difficult not to succumb to such high-pressured enticements and we stayed home.

The individual dedication of each committee member to our common endeavor has been outstanding and it resulted in a cohesiveness not often found within committees. Mr. Bourne’s expert counsel was equally outstanding and of great assistance to the committee.

For the committee and the choir members, gratitude does not begin to cover the feelings we have for the opportunity to choose and have a true pipe organ. We are indebted to Father Joseph O’Donnell, the founding pastor of Maternity of Mary Church, who with great frugality and inspiration shepherded the parish through its building stages to its debt-free status. We are especially grateful to Father John J. O’Neill, whose love of music recognized the need of a fine organ to complete our beautiful church and who has so enthusiastically endorsed the project. But without thousands of loyal, generous parishioners over the years many things would have been impossible. Without them, the parish would not be in a position today to maintain a parochial school or to purchase an organ. Ours is a middle-class neighborhood. We don’t have any mansions in the area, no millionaire to donate an organ. The parishioners, guided by two fine pastors, have achieved many things with their unstinted generosity and we thank them, too, for making this impossible dream possible.

ANNA MARIE ETTEL
THE MUSICAL SHAPE OF THE LITURGY
PART II: THE INTERPOLATION OF
POLYPHONIC MUSIC

The Second Vatican Council acknowledged the integral role of music in the liturgy. In the debate on the schema for the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, the familiar designations of music as *ancilla or administrare* were laid aside in favor of a stronger formulation; "a necessary and integral component of the solemn liturgy" was approved on the floor of the council by a vote of 2087 to 5. According to Jungmann, "music is not merely addition to and adornment of the liturgy; it is itself liturgy, an integrating element, which belongs to the complete form of the liturgy." 

While the council required that new forms introduced into the liturgy must somehow grow organically out of the existing ones, it admitted all forms of true art provided they possess characteristics suitable to the liturgy. It encouraged composers to contribute new works to the treasury of sacred music.

The purpose of the following article is to show that historically the interpolation of polyphonic music into the Gregorian Mass has realized these principles: at one and the same time, 1) it was an organic outgrowth of already existing...
practices; 2) it shaped and formed the progress of the sacred action; and 3) of the
best artistic principles of its own time it used those which were suited to con-
tributing to the overall musical shape of the liturgy. Two particular high points
in the history of polyphonic music will be discussed, the organa of the Notre
Dame school, ca. 1200, and the cyclic ordinary of the Mass, ca. 1500.

The presence of some kind of polyphonic elaboration of Gregorian chant is a
consistent feature of the history of the liturgy from almost as early as the first
notation of the chant melodies themselves. While the first additions to the chant
were simply parallel fourths or fifths, a practice of counterpoint evolved, and a
wide spectrum of means of elaboration has existed ever since. In churches with
modest means, this may have been quite simple music, which did little more
than provide a harmonic context to some of the chants; organ accompaniments
in recent times have served a similar function. This sort of amplification alters
the overall shape of the liturgy very little. However, churches with well-
established and well-supported musical organizations were the location of more
extensive developments. They fostered musical works of genius, and they built
great repertories which now take their place beside Gregorian chant as timeless
and permanent parts of the treasury of sacred music, repertories which made
their own contribution to the musical shape of the liturgy. Such are the Notre
Dame organa and the cyclic Mass.

The organa of Leonin realize some basic principles of order and shape already
present in the Gregorian Mass. They constitute a polyphonic elaboration of the
chants for the gradual and alleluia, an elaboration made on the basis of the
responsorial division of the chant between cantors and choir. The performance
of a Gregorian gradual — for example, Haec dies — began with the intonation by
the cantors, after which the choir continued and completed the responsory; the
cantors then sang the verse, and the choir joined the singing of the last words of
the verse with its melisma:

Responsor

  Cantors - - - Choir
  Haec dies * quam fecit Dominus, exsultemus et laetemur in ea.
  Verse
  Cantors ------------------------- Choir
  Confitemini Domino quoniam bonus: quoniam in saeculum
  misericordia ejus.

It was a natural development for two cantors, presumably the most accom-
plished singers, to elaborate their prescribed parts; one would continue to sing
the Gregorian melody while the other would sing a counterpoint to it. They were
free to arrange their own elaborate versions of the chants assigned to them,
while the choir sang its chant in the accustomed manner. This practice formed
the basis for the alternation of polyphony and chant in the Notre Dame reper-
tory.

Yet another feature of the Notre Dame organa derives directly from the chant.
These elaborate pieces alternate two separate and contrasting polyphonic styles
which derive from a stylistic distinction in the chants themselves. The Gregorian
graduals are characterized by a distinction between nearly syllabic and melismatic
passages. Several syllables of the text are set to only a few notes after which a
single word receives a long melisma. The relative independence of melisma is a

MAHRT: POLYPHONIC MUSIC
17
mark of the highly musical purpose of these chants. In the polyphonic elaboration, separate and contrasting styles are composed for each of these Gregorian styles. Those parts of the original chant which are nearly syllabic receive a style known as organum purum; over a single note of the chant is placed a whole phrase of melody in the duplum. Those parts of the original chant which are the melismas receive a style known as discant; the several notes of the tenor are sung rhythmically while the duplum moves in a style congruent with them.\(^9\)

Organum purum:

Discant:

Leonin’s organum for *Haec dies* thus takes the following shape, showing relative lengths of the sections:

- organum purum (soloists)
- *Haec dies*
- chant (choir)
- *quam fecit Dominus: exsultemus et laetemur in ea.*
- organum purum (s.) - discant (s.)
- *Confitemini Domino quo niam bonus: quoniam*
- organum purum (s.)
- *discant (s.) chant (ch.)*
- *in saeculum - misericordia ejus.*

Something intrinsic to the basic Gregorian melody has provided a point of departure for a piece which greatly amplifies the total dimensions of the original chant.

Leonin’s organa are based upon the fundamental chant melody; they are, however, thoroughly Gothic pieces. The chant serves as a point of departure for the projection of a large piece whose basic means of organization belong to Leonin’s own time. He is thought to have composed at Paris, ca. 1160–1170;\(^{10}\) the choir of the Abbey of St. Denis, generally acknowledged to be the first Gothic church, was consecrated in 1140, and the first extensive *Summa theologica* was probably composed sometime before 1190.\(^{11}\) Thus his work falls directly into
that period and location dominated by the birth and growth of Gothic architecture and scholastic philosophy. What elements of the Gothic aesthetic are embodied in Leonin’s organa? I suggest that Leonin based his works upon a Gothic sense of order which was 1) hierarchical, 2) systematically rational, and 3) highly elaborated.

The Gothic sense of the order of things was strongly hierarchical; civil and ecclesiastical society were both arranged in well-developed hierarchies with higher and lower nobilities and commoners, higher and lower clergy and laity, each person having a clearly defined position and function in the society. The organization of bodies of knowledge was classified hierarchically in books, chapters, sections, and subsections, each in its proper place within the overall scheme of things. For Leonin and for composers of the entire Middle Ages, a clear hierarchical relationship between the voices of a composition existed. Usually the tenor was the prior voice; being derived from a Gregorian melody, it represented a traditional *datum* which bore the weight of authority and resided in the weightier long notes upon which the style was based. It was analogous to the statements of the fathers and doctors at the beginning of a disputation or to the texts of the scripture which were the subjects of extensive glossing.

The Gothic sense of the order of things was highly reasonable and reasoned. While faith remained largely unquestioned, the relationship of faith and reason was newly defined. There was a greater confidence in the ability of reason in attaining to the knowledge of truth and in the capability of human intelligence in the ordering of divine knowledge. The highly organized upper parts of the organa show the increased role of the developed use of reason in musical compositions. Even the Gregorian tenor itself, the traditional *datum*, was now given a rationalized organization.

The Gothic exercise of reason was highly organized and systematic. The process of reasoning was organized by the syllogism, a three-member sequence of propositions whose conventions and restrictions precisely articulated the development of a proof. The rhythm of a musical piece was also based upon a schematic and rationalized organization, the system of mode and ordo. Mode designated one of six individual rhythmic patterns, analogous to the foot of poetry, and resolved to a triple organization; for example, mode one (trochaic): \( \frac{f}{e} \); mode three (dactylic): \( \frac{f}{e} \frac{f}{f} \). Ordo described the grouping of these patterns into phrase units; for example, in mode one, ordo one: \( \frac{f}{e} \frac{f}{e} \); ordo two: \( \frac{f}{e} \frac{f}{e} \frac{f}{f} \); ordo three: \( \frac{f}{f} \frac{f}{f} \frac{f}{f} \). While this system of modal rhythms became more rigorously organized in the thirteenth century, it was already present in Leonin’s organa, particularly in the discant sections.

The medieval mind was concerned with elaboration. It was indeed the function of reason to develop extensive commentaries upon a circumscribed and well-known text. The text was a point of departure for a work of reason of immense proportions. Consider the sermons on the *Song of Songs* by St. Bernard of Clairvaux; his expositions run to eighty-six sermons, some of them lengthy, and he reached only the third chapter of his text. Analogously, the extended clause of duplum over each tenor note represents such an elaboration.

If the organa were constructed in a Gothic way, they also gave a characteristically Gothic shape to the liturgy. Elaboration functioned to emphasize a hierarchical order among the parts of the liturgy. In the Mass of the catechumens, the
singing of the gospel was the liturgical high point; this was prepared by the musical high points of the gradual and alleluia, and extended by the sequence. There is a directional ordering of movement in the liturgy which is accelerated and heightened by the elaboration of gradual and alleluia in organum. This typically Gothic shape might be expressed as follows:

The cyclic Mass of the Renaissance provides a contrasting example. Setting the five movements of the ordinary of the Mass each to similar music creates quite a different musical shape. Yet this was also an outgrowth of certain principles of order already to be found in the developed Gregorian Mass. It has already been noted that the Gregorian settings of the ordinary tended toward an equalization of the lengths of movements. But can the five Gregorian movements be said to bear some unity among themselves which constitutes a precedent for cyclic treatment in polyphonic music?

The basic unity among the movements of the Gregorian ordinary is one of liturgical association; just as the propers for one feast belong together, so do those chants for the ordinary which bear a common rubric which provides that they be sung on a day of a particular sort.

There is also some musical unity among chants of the Gregorian ordinary, especially between Sanctus and Agnus Dei movements. The chants of the modern Roman Kyriale illustrate this: in ten of the eighteen cycles, the Sanctus and Agnus Dei are in the same mode; in addition, some of these pairs show the use of the same melodic material, particularly those of Masses I, IX, and XVII.

The pairing of Sanctus and Agnus Dei chants may have suggested a pairing of polyphonic movements; however, the development of an integrated five-movement cycle progressed in several further stages. These stages have been chronicled by Manfred Bukofzer as a prelude to his study of the Masses based upon the “Caput” tenor. On the one hand, pairs of movements were based upon a unifying motto beginning, and such pairs were grouped together to form superficial cycles. On the other hand, individual movements and the pairs were composed upon a borrowed melody placed in the tenor. Because the organization of the tenor integrated the shape of the movement strongly, these pairs showed a more pervasive unity, and lead more strongly to the unification of all five movements. The first extant complete five-movement cycles were written by Leonel Power and possibly John Dunstable, both Englishmen.

While the cyclic treatment of the movements of the ordinary is based to some extent upon already existing precedents, it is thoroughly a creation of the Renaissance. Several elements of Renaissance aesthetics contribute to the cyclic Mass: 1) the sense of proportions, 2) the juxtaposition of differences, 3) the function of commonplaces, and 4) the integration of a symmetrical form as a whole.
A hallmark of the Renaissance art and architecture is that it is based upon pleasing proportions. Medieval works, to be sure, used proportional structures, but these were often complex and hidden. For something to be pleasing it must be seen, and the Renaissance treatment of proportion was to make its perceptibility an objective. Thus, the proportions used tended to be the simpler proportions, especially the duple, the triple, and the sesquialtera (2:3). The pleasing proportions of a room might be that it is half again as long as it is wide (sesquialtera). A general application of the theory of proportions was seen in the theory of harmony, and may have resulted in the adoption of a normative four-voice style. However, a more specific application is found, especially in cyclic Masses, in proportions of tempo. Mensurations, the signs which prescribed meter, also indicated a proportional relationship one to another, a relationship which was measured by a common unit of time called a tactus. This resulted in the creation of different, but proportional tempi. Each movement of a particular Mass might begin with a mensuration which called for a slow triple meter, move to a fast duple, and conclude with a fast triple or sesquialtera. Since these tempi were measured against a common beat, they were truly proportional, and they created within each movement a progression of tempi, a clearly audible proportionality.

The Renaissance artist was interested in the meaningful juxtaposition of diverse ideas. For example, a painter might express the stature of a contemporary by depicting him as an ancient. Cranach's painting "Cardinal Albrecht von Brandenburg as St. Jerome," is a typical depiction of St. Jerome, showing him in his study, sitting before a book, vested in the cardinal's scarlet, with the lion and other animals at his side; but this figure of St. Jerome has the features of the Cardinal von Brandenburg. All of the attributes of St. Jerome are thereby applied to the artist's patron. The use of a cantus firmus in a Mass may be seen to be similar. Dufay's Missa Ave regina coelorum is based upon the Marian antiphon; each movement uses the melody of this antiphon in the tenor. It has recently been suggested that this Mass was written for the consecration of the Cambrai cathedral to Our Lady. Thus, while each movement of the Mass served to set its respective texts, the whole Mass expressed, in addition, the devotion to the Queen of Heaven, just as did the church built in her honor.

The Renaissance was a time when the art of rhetoric was cultivated by every learned man. An important rhetorical concept was that of the commonplace. A commonplace was an idea expressed by a saying which was well known to knowledgeable men, and which implied a context of values and meanings. A speaker had but to mention the commonplace and it called to mind for his hearers the whole complex of ideas; he had something in common with them, a basis for a sophisticated argument. Often the cantus firmus of a cyclic Mass served as a commonplace. It was a tune that had been used before, and was used again because the composer could assume that his listeners had heard it before, that it would be heard intelligently. The tune L'homme armé served as such a commonplace, being the cantus firmus for over thirty cyclic Masses.

The Renaissance artist was concerned that his work be unified by a form which in some respect projected a sense of balance and symmetry. Although the surface of the work might be a proliferation of detail, the detail was organized by an underlying shape. In many works of the visual arts the development of
perspective provided a basis for this shape. Each object was shown larger or smaller depending upon how far it was from the viewer. Perhaps the organization of the tenor of a cantus firmus Mass represents an analogy to perspective. Consider the tenor of Obrecht's Missa super Maria zart; it creates a kind of perspective by placing the same basic motive under different mensurations, each statement being progressively shorter. For example, the section Et resurrexit is based upon the following notation of the tenor part:

```
\begin{align*}
\text{Et resurrexit} & \quad \text{\begin{music}
   \times \quad i \quad o \quad o \\
i \quad o \\
i \quad o \\
i \quad i \\
o \quad o \\
i \quad o \\
o \quad o \\
\end{music}}
\end{align*}
```

This prescribes the following succession of rhythms:

```
\begin{align*}
i \quad o \quad o \\
i \quad o \\
i \quad i \\
o \quad o \\
i \quad o \\
o \quad o \\
\end{align*}
```

Such schemes of progressive diminution create a strongly unified movement.

The basic process of placing five somewhat equal polyphonic movements within the context of the Gregorian Mass creates a certain liturgical structure:

```
\begin{align*}
\text{Int.} & \quad \text{Kyrie} & \quad \text{Gloria} & \quad \text{Ep. Grad.} & \quad \text{All. Gosp.} & \quad \text{Credo} & \quad \text{Off. Pref.} & \quad \text{Sanctus} & \quad \text{Pr. La.} & \quad \text{Agnus} & \quad \text{Comm.}
\end{align*}
```

The polyphonic parts are placed at intervals throughout the service, and with the exception of the Kyrie and Gloria, are interspersed with other elements of the service. This creates a kind of rondo effect, in which the same basic material recurs after contrasting elements. The movements of the polyphonic ordinary served as the pillars of the unification of the whole service. When the organization of the individual movements is a strong one, such as in a scheme of progressive diminution of the tenor, or in the repetition of the same sequence of tempi in each movement, a clearly repetitive structure is projected. This unification can take the form of movements whose durations are proportionate. For example Josquin's Missa D'ung aultre amer, including the elevation motet, has the following measure lengths:

- Kyrie: 49
- Gloria: 48
- Credo: 108
- Sanctus: 48
- Tu solus: 70
- Agnus Dei: 53

Whatever the theorists of recondite proportionality may say about these numbers, the approximate durations of the movements are evident: the unit of 48 measures is basic; the Kyrie, Gloria, and Sanctus are quite alike in duration; the Agnus Dei is just a little longer. The Credo is approximately double the length of these movements, and the motet bears a proportion of just a little less than 3:2.
While the Renaissance sense for balance and unification may result in a certain equalization of the movements of the Mass, there is also a subtle progression of emphasis through the five movements. The Kyrie is a movement with a relatively short text; it can set forth in a clear manner the materials of the cycle. The Gloria and Credo both have extended texts, and their setting involves the composing of the basic materials to suit the extensive texts. By the completion of the Credo, the basic musical materials have been used three times; the hearers have become sufficiently familiar with them to comprehend some subtle differences of treatment in the Sanctus and Agnus Dei, which place a special emphasis on these movements. These differences of treatment take several forms; a few examples will illustrate the principle.

Pierre de La Rue’s Missa Cum jucunditate is a Mass based upon a cantus firmus consisting of a small figure stated at two different pitch levels:

![Cantus Firmus Example](image)

Its total range of notes consists of only a pentatonic scale and is marked by the absence of any half-steps. This is the basis of a certain bright-sounding harmony which characterizes the first three movements. The cantus firmus is then given for the Sanctus by a canon over the five note figure:

Canon: descende gradatim

![Canon Example](image)

It calls upon the tenor to state the subject on successively lower scale degrees:

![Canon Example](image)

While this sort of canon may seem obscure from the point of view of the singer, it is most effective and perceptible for the listener, since it permits the introduction of harmonies not yet heard in the three previous movements. Based upon material already familiar, this canonic treatment casts a new light upon this simple melody and places a profound emphasis on that movement sung during the canon of the Mass.

Jean Mouton’s Missa Alleluia is typical of a number of Renaissance Masses in which proportionate tempi do not organize each movement. Rather the Kyrie, Gloria and Credo are written in the common tempus imperfectum diminutum throughout. Only in the Sanctus does the undiminished mensuration appear; the half-tempo which this prescribes places an emphasis on that movement, an emphasis created by a slow and majestic tempo.

Yet another sort of treatment of the Sanctus sets it off from the rest of the
movements: it was sometimes the occasion for the interpolation of an elevation motet. 

The Missa de Sancta Anna of Pierre de La Rue has such a motet in its Sanctus. The first Osanna is simply replaced by a homophonic motet, O salutaris hostia:

\[
a_4 \quad a_3 \quad a_4 \quad a_2 \quad a_4 \\
Sanctus. \quad Pleni. \quad O \text{ salutaris.} \quad Benedictus. \quad Osanna
\]

It occurs in a symmetrical position, at the exact center of the movement, which coincides with the time of the elevation. The juxtaposition of its lauda-like familiar style with the contrapuntal style of the rest of the movement underscores its devotional character and the symmetrical construction of the movement, and thereby sets the Sanctus off from the rest of the movements of the Mass. Josquin's Tu solus qui facis mirabilia is a similar lauda-like elevation motet which replaces the entire Benedictus and Osanna, and creates a less symmetrical, more directional kind of emphasis.

Yet another way to emphasize one of the final movements is to introduce certain contrapuntal intricacies. It is a characteristic of many of the Masses of the later sixteenth century that the Agnus Dei has an additional voice, and that the additional voice is in strict canon with another voice. The cumulative effect of the addition of a voice is intensified by the fact that upon the fifth statement of the material of the Mass, the hearers are familiar enough with it that they can hear and appreciate this special treatment.

Thus the cyclic Mass in the Renaissance sets up five similar movements serving as pillars of a balanced and proportional structure, but in addition it uses special devices to underscore the liturgical importance of either the Sanctus or Agnus Dei, the former more in the period around 1500, the latter more toward the end of the sixteenth century. In this way it can be said to be intimately connected with the liturgical action.

It has been argued that the Renaissance cyclic Mass, while growing out of existing practices makes use of several elements of an aesthetic characteristic of the Renaissance to give the liturgy a particular musical shape. Does this argue against its use in sung Masses today? I think to the contrary. At least those elements which have to do with the internal organization of the work, proportion, unification of structure, symmetry, and emphasis, are desirable characteristics of any work of art. The council admitted all works of art which were suited to the demands of the liturgy, and so it seems they are particularly appropriate.

As with any fine work of art, the Renaissance Mass is the product of a culture — to be a living thing, it must take its place in a context of other fine things. Dare one suggest today that this context must be that of the devoted care of the liturgy and of the spiritual life as a whole? Dare one ask that as much care go into preaching as into the preparation of music? Dare one ask that ceremonial be the object of rehearsal as is singing? In order to be a living thing it must also take its place as something regularly practiced. One performance a year of a polyphonic Mass, while a laudable endeavor and an enrichment of the liturgy, risks being removed from the context of a familiar practice, and being seen as an exceptional or even esoteric happening. For this reason, large city and university churches whose liturgies can be devoted to the special polyphonic repertories are an essential aspect of our religious culture, to be fostered as the council directed, in order that great works of the polyphonic art remain available as intrinsically connected with the sacred action.

WILLIAM PETER MAHRT
NOTES

1. Article 112.
3. Ibid.
4. Article 23.
5. Article 112.
6. The writers of music history have tended to emphasize the history of musical innovation, and sometimes have left the impression that successive new styles completely replaced older ones. On the contrary, while in some places new works for the liturgy prevailed, in other places, the older works formed the staples of the repertory. German manuscripts of the fifteenth century show pieces in a thirteenth century style; manuscript choirbooks copied in the late eighteenth century in Munich contain polyphonic works of the sixteenth century; Palestrina's music has been consistently sung at the Sistine Chapel, and certain works of Palestina and his contemporaries have remained a part of a living repertory sung on quite a wide-spread basis.
10. Waite, op. cit., p. 5.
12. Panofsky, op. cit., has shown that parallels between Gothic architecture and the methods of scholastic philosophy in the area around Paris in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries demonstrate a unified aesthetic that can be called Gothic.
13. Cf. Panofsky, op. cit., p. 32; he points out that this method of outlining was the invention of scholasticism.
14. There is a curious parallel between two senses of the word organum. Etymologically the connection seems rather remote, but the analogy which the two senses suggest could hardly have been overlooked in the scholastic age. The Greek (οργανόν) means basically an instrument of the work a man does. For a musician, it is a musical instrument, for a thinker it is a system of logic. Aristotle's treatise on logic is named Organon; in its complete form it was introduced into the West precisely in the twelfth century. Among other things, it treated of the syllogism. The elaborate musical compositions of the Notre Dame school were called organum by the application of an already traditional term for two-part polyphony, probably because it imitated the sound of the musical instrument, the organ, which may have been played in two parts. Yet in contrast to the old style of two-part pieces, these new, highly structured pieces suggest something of the sense of a method of logic.
17. Cf. the present article, Part I, Sacred Music, Vol. 102, No. 3 (Fall, 1975), p. 10.
18. Ibid.
19. E.g., de Apostolis, de Martyribus, etc. The fact that these chants were not placed together in the manuscripts has caused scholars to overlook their basic association with each other by being prescribed for use on the same day.
21. These first tenors, although liturgical melodies, did not belong to the Mass, but were antiphons from the Office. Such use of a Gregorian melody, however, was nothing unusual, since it was clearly adopted from the well-established practice of the
isorhythmic motet, a form which ultimately traces its history back to the discant sections of the organa of Leonin.


24. The Renaissance practice is sometimes criticized in which Masses were written upon secular compositions; lately it is rather cited as a precedent for the introduction of certain base styles of music into the liturgy. It must be emphasized that while the function of such incorporation into a Renaissance Mass may have been to ground the work in something familiar, the process of incorporating it was to transform it thoroughly by the context of the contrapuntal sacred style. Thus a Renaissance cantus firmus Mass properly makes sacred a secular element. The current practice reverses the priorities; the introduction of thoroughly secular styles untransformed secularizes the sacred action.


29. Although it is not found frequently, this elevation motet is undoubtedly the result of a liturgical tradition rather than the choice of the composer. Jungmann, *Mass of the Roman Rite* (tr. Francis A. Brunner; New York: Benziger, 1955), Vol. II, p. 216, cites a decree of 1512 issued by Louis XII, that at the daily high Mass in Notre Dame in Paris, the *O salutaris hostia* be sung at the elevation of the host between the *Sanctus* and *Benedictus*; he cites many other instances as well. The *Kyriale* of the modern Cistercian order contains three chants for the elevation, *O salutaris hostia*, *Ave verum corpus* for Marian feasts, and *Pie Jesu* for Requiem Masses, each in exactly the same position as the Eucharistic acclamation of the *Novus Ordo Missae*; *Kyriale seu Ordinarium Missae* (ex Graduali Cisterciensi) (Westmalle: Typis Cisterciensibus, 1933). All of these practices, of course, derive from the medieval *Sanctus* tropes, such as that found in Guillaume Dufay’s *Sanctus Ave verum*, *Opera Omnia*, Tomus IV, *Fragmenta Missarum*, ed. Heinrich Besseler (Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1962), p. 45–48. The *Pie Jesu* of the Fauré *Requiem* follows this practice also, replacing the *Benedictus* and *Osanna*; in the absence of a sequence, it is sometimes sung in the place of the *Dies irae*, of which it forms the final verse; but it is clearly an elevation here.

31. These two kinds of emphasis realize the two possible shapes of the canon described in the first part of this article, *Sacred Music*, Vol. 102, No. 3 (Fall, 1975), p. 11. It is likely that the *Agnus Dei* was sung well into the communion time, so that in a polyphonic Mass it would underscore the final element of the second diagram.
32. On this ground, revival of the singing of Notre Dame organa in the liturgy might be ill-advised, given the uncertainty of the transcriptions, and, as yet, the unfamiliarity of the style. I would not categorically rule out their use for special congregations with the proper preparation.
33. I am reminded of the liturgical music culture of the city of Munich, Germany, which I experienced during the year 1966–67 as a foreign exchange student. I believe the pattern there has not changed much since then. The downtown Jesuit church had a Sunday high Mass with orchestra using the repertory of Haydn through Gounod. The Dominican church sang an a capella Mass of the generation of Palestrina and Lassus. Once a month the Capella Antiqua sang a Mass from the repertory before the high Renaissance. A chant Mass was always sung at the Benedictine abbey. At the cathedral, the high Mass included works from most of these categories from time to time, as well as Latin and German Masses of the twentieth century. All of these were sung in the context of more or less complete singing of Gregorian proper and congregational responses.

MAHRT: POLYPHONIC MUSIC
NATIVE MUSIC FOR THE MISSIONS

Scholars and practicing musicians from eighteen countries on five continents assembled in Rome, November 14–18, at the beautiful pilgrimage house, Domus Mariae, under the auspices of the Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae to discuss the use of the native musical heritage of various peoples in missionary areas both for their liturgical worship and for the work of evangelization. The symposium was organized to consider the implementation of Article 119 of the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy of the Second Vatican Council which says:

“...In certain parts of the world, especially mission lands, there are peoples who have their own musical traditions, and these play a great part in their religious and social life. For that reason due importance is to be attached to their music, and a suitable place is to be given to it, not only in forming their attitude towards religion, but also in adapting worship to their native genius, as indicated in Articles 39 and 40. Therefore, when missionaries are being given training in music, every effort should be made to see that they become competent in promoting the traditional music of these peoples, both in schools and in sacred services, as far as may be practicable.”

Among the scholars present were two internationally recognized American ethnomusicologists, Prof. Bruno Nettl of the University of Illinois and Prof. Klaus P. Wachsmann of Evanston, Illinois. Other musicologists present were
Prof. Joseph Kuckertz of Cologne, Germany, who served as chairman of the sessions, Prof. Andrew McCreddie of Adelaide, Australia, Prof. Karl G. Fellerer of Cologne, and Prof. René Lenaerts of the University of Louvain in Belgium.

Practicing musicians, both performers and composers, included Reverend R. Ouedraogho of Upper Volta, Reverend Stephan Mbunga of Tanzania and Reverend Walter Albuquerque, S.J., of Mangalore, India, who described the present efforts in Africa and India to use native languages, music and rites within the framework of the Roman liturgy. Others in attendance came from Korea, Kenya, Uganda and various European countries including Poland, Bulgaria, Roumania and Yugoslavia. Choirs composed of students from African and Indian areas resident in Rome provided music for Masses celebrated during the conference.

As an introduction to the discussions, Prof. Nettl explained the methodology employed by ethnomusicologists who are interested chiefly in recording the facts of a given cultural situation without entering into value judgments concerning the quality of the music experienced. This position became the basis for an underlying problem that gradually emerged as some felt that simply because music was in use in a certain cultural area it should then be accepted; but others thought that the Church should regulate and improve the quality of music used in divine worship even when native elements are employed.

This problem grew more evident as the examples of contemporary efforts to use native music were performed both on tape and by small ensembles during the liturgy. What the ethnomusicologists were describing as the classical music of Africa, Australia, Oceania and India proved to be rather far removed from some of the idioms employed by the practicing musicians. In fact, most observers from western countries felt that the examples of contemporary African and Indian music presented were little different from some western commercial songs. They used elementary devices of western harmonic construction and seemed very similar to commercial music heard on the radio and used in films. The use of the harmonium in the Indian music made this all the more obvious. The ethnomusicologists would not, of course, make a value judgment on the quality of the music, preferring only to register it as existing practice, and pointing out the processes of aculturization which are constantly in action. Many of the compositions seemed to be the attempts of amateurs who did not truly know the musica indigena of their own lands and were not adequately trained in western musical theory either. As a result, many of the examples were judged to be lacking in art and in the quality of authentic classical musica indigena as well. They were really pieces in the style of present-day "popular" songs heard widely in areas where western influences have been most greatly felt. It actually was much the same phenomenon as found in the United States where efforts have been made to introduce so-called folk music into worship. The music was not truly musica indigena, but rather a popular entertainment and commercial idiom to which sacred words had been set. It occurred to me that some of the ideas in Father Joseph Gelineau's book, *Voices and Instruments in Christian Worship*, were being put into practice: an erasing of the distinction between the sacred and the secular, and a denial of the need for professionally trained, first-rate composers and performers for church music. (Cf. Review of Gelineau's book in *Sacred Music*, Vol. 92, No. 3, Autumn 1965, p. 83-88.)
Something I noticed as the sessions continued was a certain stirring of nationalism that was associated with the native music, particularly that from Africa. In its most negative aspect this appeared to be anti-western, anti-Latin and anti-Gregorian. With somewhere between eight hundred and a thousand languages and dialects in current use in Africa, the possibility of an “African” Mass is obviously excluded, and the need for Latin as an expression of the universality of the Catholic Church was quickly recognized. All were in agreement that Gregorian chant with its intimate connection with Latin remains as one of the most positive unifying forces amid a pluralism that could become destructive of Catholic unity, breaking it up into many little national groups.

The culture of India is a far older and deeper civilization than that of Africa and different questions emerged with regard to the use of Indian music in the liturgy. Father Albuquerque pointed out that Indian Catholics are very reluctant to bring Indian rites into their worship because of the connection these ceremonial actions have with Hinduism. However, a similar hesitancy does not exist with regard to music. The value of Indian music as a means of catechetical instruction, particularly on the radio, was emphasized, since Catholic broadcasts daily reach into the homes of millions of Indians who are attracted by the sound of a familiar music and thus are more receptive to the Catholic message introduced. A film showed some efforts in the direction of using Indian rites in the liturgy, but one wonders if the great majority of Indian Catholics are that anxious for such innovations as a celebrant seated with legs crossed at a low altar, vestments that resemble Hindu ones, a great use of flowers and dancing in the Mass. That the native music is more practicable than the ritual innovations was the conclusion arrived at.

Still another question arose about the use of primitive aboriginal music in worship, as the subject of Australian ethnic forms was considered. Some expressed the fear that in adopting primitive music the Church in a sense would be “consecrating” it, instead of leading a primitive people on to further and higher development. What was heard of Australian attempts at using primitive music in the liturgy raised the question of how much cultural background is really needed for the true cultivation of the Christian message, a problem faced by the medieval Benedictines who undertook the conversion of the pagan Germanic tribes. Probably because he was very conscious of the need for catechesis as a primary foundation preceding even liturgy itself, Father Ouedraogho of Upper Volta seemed to associate the liturgy and its accompanying music with catechetical activity. For him, liturgy with its music was a form of teaching the gospel. Liturgy is not, of course, a mere teaching device, but rather primarily the worship of God. Yet the maintaining of a very primitive music seems to hinder even the catechetical efforts themselves, since it neglects the improvement of the very cultural foundations in which the Faith must be implanted.

A final problem that surfaced in the symposium sessions is one that we in the United States have in a certain sense also faced. The Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy speaks of the native music of a people (musica indigena). Some have mistaken this true folk music (music of the people) for what is really a “popular” music (music for the people). True folk music comes from centuries of nationhood, truly a musica indigena. Popular music is created for the present and reflects the dominant culture of the period. As a nation, the United States can
point to a mere two centuries of existence, with peoples from many parts of the globe bringing to us their cultural inheritances. But there is really no true American *musica indigena*. However, our popular music has caught the fancy of the whole world. Efforts to incorporate that music into our worship are as contrary to the sense of the council fathers as are those of the Africans or Indians to use it and call it their *music indigena* simply because it is heard at every turn of the radio dial in their lands. The aculturization that the dominance of American popular music has brought about over the whole world should not result in the loss of true native folk music. It is such music that the Church wishes to be preserved and used.

One important consideration that looms large in any discussion of music for use in liturgy is, of course, the distinction between sacred and profane, a concept that one can find in the early fathers of the Church when they wrote about Greek music. It unquestionably is true that music as such is not of itself sacred or profane. Sacred words can give a sacred character, but more important is the phenomenon of connotation, that quality in a piece of music that is recognized by a given society as being associated with some particular purpose or use. We are quick, for example, to recognize military music or funeral music; certain pieces bring a familiar experience to mind. But others outside our cultural experience may not readily recognize this connection. It is true that connotation may change or be forgotten, as with the many *contrafacta* now in use. But these changes occur slowly and must be experienced by a whole society, not only individuals, before they can be admitted as fact. It is a principle of sociology that when one changes a given symbol or sign one can thereby also alter the reality that lies beneath. Music is such a sign, a symbol of the Faith. It is for that reason that the council fathers were at pains to point out that any connotations of paganism and error must be carefully excluded from any music admitted in the name of being *musica indigena*.

All in all, the Roman meeting of CIMS was a very profitable and successful event. The opportunity of hearing ethnomusicologists as well as practicing musicians discuss the problems of their special areas provided much information and all present surely learned a great deal. The conclusions of the meeting were simple and practical. Education of native musicians in the music of their own countries as well as in Gregorian chant is most important. This is needed both to further the evangelical missionary activity through music and to embellish the liturgy with true *musica indigena*. Among the *vota* presented to the Holy See was the request for the establishment of a chair of missionary music at the Pontifical Institute of Sacred Music in Rome. A committee within the Consociatio was appointed under the chairmanship of Prof. Kuckertz to continue the study of the use of *musica indigena* in missionary lands, and plans were begun to establish a center for the preservation and study of native music to which missionaries can send examples of native music and from which they can expect to receive help in analysis and study of it. Such a center would probably be located in Germany.

Special mention in conclusion must be made of Monsignor Johannes Overath, president of CIMS, for his untiring work in organizing this symposium as well as the preceding ones which have turned the attention of experts to such problems as contemporary composition and the music being used in the lands of eastern Europe.
GRADUALE

SACROSANCTÆ ROMANÆ ECCLESIAE

DE TEMPORE ET DE SANCTIS

PRIMUM SANCTI PII X IUSSU
RESTITUTUM ET EDITUM

PAULI VI PONTIFICIS MAXIMI CURA
NUNC RECOGNITUM

AD EXEMPLAR « ORDINIS CANTUS MISSÆ »
DISPOSITUM

ET RHYTHMICIS SIGNIS A SOLESMENSIBUS MONACHIS
DILIGENTER ORNATUM

ABBATIA SANCTI PETRI DE SOLESMIS

1974

Reprinted in Sacred Music with permission of Desclée & Co., Tournai, Belgium.
I. MISSÆ IN EXSEQUIIS
IN ANNIVERSARIO ET IN DIVERSIS COMMEMORATIONIBUS

ANTIPHONÆ AD INTROITUM

I

IV Esdr. 2, 34. 35; Ps. 64, 2. 3. 4. 5

E-qui-em * ae-tér-nam do-na e-is

Dómi-ne: et lux perpè-tu-a lú-ce-at

e-is. Ps. Te de-cet hymnus, De-us, in Si-on; et ti-bi


Qui au-dis o-ra-ti-ó-nem, ad te omnis ca-ro vé-ni-et

propter in-i-qui-tá-tem. Ant. Réquiem.

Etsi præva-lu-é-runt su-per nos impi-e-tá-tes nostræ,
COMMUNE VIRGINUM

II

Optimam partem e-igit si-bi Ma-riva, quae non aufe-re-tur ab e-a in ae-ter-num.

T. P. Alleluia, VIII toni, 827. — Ps. 33*.

III

Unique prudentes vir-gi-nes acce-pe-runt ó-

le-um in va-sis su-is cum lam-pá-di-bus : mé-di-a

autem no-c-te clamor factus est : Ecce sponsus ve-

nit : ex-i-te ób-vi-am Chri-sto Dómi-no.

T. P. Al-le-

lú- ia.

Ps. 44*, 2 ab. 11. 12. 13. 14. 15. 16 (Differentia : g)

IV Unam pétii, 294.
CANTUS IN ORDINE MISSÆ OCCURRENTES

I

TEMPORE PASCHALI

(Lux et origo)

A

PRO DOMINICIS

(Te Christe rex supplices)
REVIEWS

Special


With the appearance of this attractively printed book, whose low price seems to indicate a subsidization, fears about the immediate future of Gregorian chant as well as various practical worries have been put to rest. In 1972 the Holy See, which has remained constant for more than a century in fostering, promoting, and demanding the use of Gregorian chant, promulgated the Ordo cantus missae (see review in Sacred Music, Vol. 100, Spring, 1973), which lists the places of the Gregorian pieces in the reformed Mass. The monks of Solesmes, noted for their fidelity to the Holy See, have carried out this arrangement in a practical book for the use of singers. Also, librarians and musicologists should note that this new Graduale contains a number of authentic Gregorian pieces not found in earlier modern books.

In order to understand certain aspects of the new Graduale we must recall a bit of history. Although the heyday of Gregorian composition had ended well before the beginning of the middle ages, the continuing introduction of new feasts created a need for new proper chants. In some cases chants composed originally for other feasts could be used; for instance, those composed originally for the feasts of Sts. Caecilia and Agnes were later used for feasts of other virgins, and thus came into existence the “common of the saints.” In other cases earlier chants were not found suitable and new chants were composed or arranged. This work was carried out very extensively by the monks of Solesmes toward the end of the last century, creating what is called the neo-Gregorian repertory, which makes up a large part of the material found in the “proper of the saints” in the old Graduale and Liber Usualis. The present general opinion of the neo-Gregorian repertory is that except for a few rare master strokes it is vastly inferior to the authentic repertory, and some of it is so poor as to be unusable.

The Ordo cantus Missae has sought to correct the situation by replacing most of the neo-Gregorian with authentic pieces. On the face of it this is an attractive solution to the problem. The propers of the weekdays of Lent provide a veritable mine, since many of their texts are taken in sequence from the Psalms in numerical order, and therefore furnish texts on almost any “topic” one might want; indeed, the new Graduale draws heavily on these for feasts of the saints. Now the old Graduale provides separate repertories for Sundays, lenten weekdays and feasts, and there is relatively little sharing of pieces by different repertories. Each of these has its own musical style: we might describe the chants for the feasts of the saints as elaborate and bright in color, those of the Sundays as elaborate but more somber, and those of the lenten weekdays as simple and somber. The choirmaster is apt to receive complaints if he follows the new Graduale in using lenten weekday chants on feasts celebrated in his church on Sunday or with special solemnity, such as patronal feasts.

Music for Lent and the Easter season:

The Passion and Resurrection of Our Lord by William Billings, edited by L. Van Camp. SATB a cappella, narrator. This is not a newly discovered manuscript by our early composer, but simply a compilation of pertinent hymns and anthems with connecting Scriptural readings. The music has not been arranged, only edited occasionally for practical reasons. Without the readings there is a good collection of Lenten and Easter pieces by Billings that will probably be useful in 1976. Concordia Publishing House @ $2.75.

Our Lord Is Risen with Flag Unfurled by Hugo Distler. SAB, organ. Distler has made one of his polyphonic settings for a 14th century Bohemian hymn. It should be a useful addition to the choir repertoire. Concordia Publishing House @ .25c.

Sing We All Now Alleluia edited by Walter Ehret. SA, optional two trumpets, piano. The Cologne tune, Tochter Sion, arranged by Ehret with his usual skill. GIA publications @ .40c.

Christ, Our Lord Is Arisen by Jacobus Gallus. SATB, a cappella. Elwyn A. Wienandt has edited and applied an English text to the original Latin, Ascendens Christus. There is interest in the rhythm. Not difficult. J. Fischer & Bro. @ .30c.

Be Filled with the Spirit by Ronald Nelson. SA. A simple setting of a text from Ephesians. Augsburg Publishing House @ .30c.

We Have Seen the Lord by Robert Wetzler. SATB, organ. A text from John set for appropriate dialogue in a combination of psalmodic recitative and choral commentary ending with a traditional chorale for SATB choir. Augsburg Publishing House @ .35c.
This Joyful Eastertide by S. Drummond Wolff. SATB choir, two trumpets, organ and congregation. Festival chorale concertato for the Easter season; not too difficult. Concordia Publishing House @ .50c.

Upon Easter Day by Joseph Roff. SATB, organ. Effective setting of a Crashaw text. GIA Publications @ .40c.

The Year of Jubilee Is Come by Noel Goemanne. SA (T) B or two voices and congregation, organ, one or two optional trumpets. A concertato setting for Edson's Lenox. GIA Publications @ .40c.

New arrangements of old tunes:
Awake, Our Souls by George Brandon. Two-part mixed voices, organ. A Watts text set to an anonymous American hymn tune. Concordia Publishing House @ .30c.

Thanksgiving Canticle by George Brandon. SATB, organ. Text a paraphrase from the Bay Psalm Book; tune, Gainsborough. Good use of American material. Ludwig Music Publishing Co. @ .40c.

For the Beauty of the Earth by Noel Goemanne. SATB, congregation, organ and two trumpets ad lib. Concertato setting of Dix. GIA Publications @ .40c.

What Shall I Render to the Lord? SATB a cappella. S. Drummond Wolff has edited the Jones work for current use. It is mildly polyphonic and not difficult. Concordia Publishing House @ .40c.

O Thou Great Friend by Andrew Law. SATB, a cappella. Law's tune, Bunker Hill, in an arrangement that preserves the original tune with its fugue section.

Arise, O God and Shine by Darwell. SATB, organ, solo trumpet ad lib. This is Darwell's 148th set by S. Drummond Wolff. It could be a lively piece for choir. Concordia Publishing House @ .55c.

All Glory Be to God on High by Nikolaus Decius. Unison voices, autoharp, guitar or organ. M. Rotermund preserves the original melody and provides a simple accompaniment. An easy piece. Concordia Publishing House @ .35c.

Four psalms:
This Is the Day by Richard Proulx. Cantor, congregation, soprano descant with 11 handbells, triangle, tambourine and organ. For the Gelineau setting of Give Thanks to the Lord, R. Proulx has composed an antiphon and supplied accompaniment. Throughout the harmony favors quintal and quartal chords. An interesting bell accompaniment serves as the background for the Gelineau psalm tune. All in all, a good Easter piece. GIA Publications @ .30c.

Alleluia and Psalm for Easter by Richard Proulx. Cantor, congregation, soprano descant with 10 handbells and organ. In this setting Proulx adds a descant to the traditional Alleluia melody, and to the Mode VI setting of Give Thanks to the Lord an accompaniment that consists merely of a bell punctuation at the cadences of each verse. Very effective. GIA Publications @ .30c.

Processional Psalm for Lent by Richard Proulx. Cantor, 2 mixed voices with 5 handbells. Although this is intended for 2 mixed voices the resources of an SATB choir are needed in performance. The cantor's opening melody is an original modal melody by Proulx answered by an SATB two-part statement that derives from the bell accompaniment. There are unison verses for SA, for TB, ending with the cantor's opening text and tune. Not too difficult and well worth doing. GIA Publications @ .30c.

Psalm 130 by John Carter. Two choirs. Very different from the Proulx settings is Carter's version which depends on choral techniques and choral speech for expression. For anyone willing to try and interested in this 20th century setting, the Carter composition has something to offer. The score has been carefully notated so that even beginners in the medium may follow and produce an interpretation of the psalm text. Augsburg Publishing House @ .10c.

Miscellaneous music:
7 Anthems for Treble Choirs by Theodore Beck. Set II; treble voices and optional instruments. A good set of hymns for the treble voices. Variety of sources represented as well as a choice of accompaniments. Concordia Publishing House @ $1.90.

Eight Folksongs and Spirituals by David N. Johnson. TBB, optional guitar. Some favorites in good settings for TBB. Augsburg Publishing House @ .45c.

Psalms for the Church Year by Paul Bunjes, F. S. Janzow and C. Schalk. Congregation and choir. An interesting approach to the singing of the psalms in English. The arrangement provides for the chanting of the prose text of the psalm interspersed with four-part settings of new poetic versions or paraphrases thereof. Bunjes has adapted the unison chant from the formulary tunes to which are added congregational melodies and choir settings by Janzow. Augsburg Publishing House: choir-organ edition @ $2.50; choir edition @ .60c.

Cherry Tree Carol by Jean Berger. SATB, keyboard, instruments. The Cherry Tree Carol serves as the main theme for a liturgical drama for singers, instrumentalists and dancers. Suggestions for performance and stage directions are included. Augsburg Publishing House @ $2.50.

Fourteen Plainsong Hymns in Latin and English by John Lee. Unison and organ. Applying an English translation of a Latin hymn to a Gregorian chant melody is not readily done and Mr. Lee has not achieved a perfect solution for all the verses of all the hymns. The organ accompaniment is too busy for the simple tunes and could easily impede the rhythm of the hymns. GIA Publications @ .40c.

Sing Joyfully to the Lord by S. Suzanne Toolan. SATB and
organ. A bright, cheerful piece with perky rhythms and an independent accompaniment. GIA Publications @ .40c.

A Feast of Joy by Walter L. Pelz. SATB, 3 trumpets, 2 trombones, timpani and organ. This is a festive piece with special interest in the instrumental accompaniment. The vocal lines illuminate the text. Meter changes accommodate the text and free it from the "tyranny of the barline." Augsburg Publishing House: complete score @ $1.75; vocal score @ .45c.

Two Songs of Faith by Alan Hovhaness. SATB a cappella. Psalm 11(10), verses 1 and 4 provide the text for the two songs. For those who know the composer's orchestral works these two pieces may sound colorless and different. The workmanship is undisputed; the color comes through occasionally in the harmony. The form resembles the Billings fuging tunes with an opening chordal section followed by a fugal section and ending with a well-designed climax. Belwin Mills @ .35c.

Go Ye Therefore by Gerre Hancock. SATB and unison chorus, 2 trumpets, 2 trombones and organ. A unison chorus introduces a chant-like setting of the text sung by Gerre Hancock. SATB and unison by Alan Hovhaness. SATB

The second section is marked with an increase of excitement and the exultant shouts are appropriately exciting, abounding in quarter note triplets, then shifting suddenly to duple divisions in quarter or eighth notes. Contrast to the rhythmic intensity is given in a lovely legato passage on the text: "O shepherd of Israel, hearken. / From your throne upon the cherubim shine forth." The work ends with suitable drive.

A Ballad of Christmas. SATB, organ, Concordia Publishing House @ .40c. Schrødt has provided gentle music for a lovely Christmas poem, "Who Are These That Earnest Knock," from the pen of Henry L. Letterman. Meter changes do not disturb the tranquility of the piece. Frequent use of ostinato patterns offers unity. In those places where the composer has written parts in unison or where one melody is doubled in octaves with tenor and soprano against another melody produced in octaves by the bass and alto, great care must be taken for the sound not to be too strong. The doubling automatically strengthens these lines and control is necessary or the tranquility is lost.

A La Ru. SATB, organ, guitar (optional). J. Fischer & Bro. @ .35c. This charmer is an arrangement which Mr. Schrødt has made of an Hispanic Christmas carol taken from Hispanic Folk Songs of New Mexico by John Donald Robb, published in 1954 by the University of New Mexico Press. Mary's lullaby to her Holy Child is given tender, swaying treatment in 6/8 meter which flows in soothing fashion. The last verse may be sung in either English or Spanish. An examination of this appealing piece should alert us in this bicentennial year that we will miss a great deal if we think that music in America began merely with the Bay Psalm Book and Billings! I wonder what other jewels are contained in John Robb's publication.

Angellic Bread of Heaven by Cesar A. Cui, arranged by Godfrey Schroth. SATB. GIA Publications @ .30c. Cui's Panis angelicus in English is given brief and simple treatment in this arrangement. It will be very useful to choirs (small or large) as a meditation after the distribution of the Eucharist.

RICHARD D. BYRNE
Magazines

SINGENDE KIRCHE, Volume 23, Number 1, 1975–76
Quarterly of the Church Music Commission of the Austrian Bishops

Fritz Bäbler concludes his article entitled “Die Zukunft der Kirchenmusik” (The Future of Church Music) in this issue. In this second half Babler attempts to explain why people have adopted the false attitude towards church music which he delineated in his first article. (See Sacred Music, vol. 102, no. 3, p. 28) The author begins his analysis with a discussion of modern theology which, he argues, has adopted a false method. The “new” method of the theologians of today is the old method of the scientists, i.e., theology has adopted the experimental method. In other terms, theology, essentially and necessarily a deductive science, has now attempted to use the scientific inductive method. Not only has experiment been introduced, but the concomitant structure of hypothesis and theory have also made their entry into the queen of the sciences. As Bäbler very trenchantly points out, there is no means of testing in an experimental way, the supernatural life, or as he puts it, an individual’s love for God. Theologians, using a deductive method are certainly able to discuss such love, perhaps even to delineate some of its characteristics, but they cannot explain the feelings of the individual who possesses this love. But those theologians who attempt to use the experimental method cannot even postulate the existence of such love since there is no way of proving its existence if they limit themselves to their chosen method. There are, therefore, certain errors which have developed within the Church because of this false methodology. Bäbler names eight; a couple of examples should suffice here: Christ is only a man and His other titles, Son of God or Son of Man, were added later by the Christians who followed Him; there is and cannot be a supernatural life just as there cannot be a heaven since we cannot prove its existence.

These theologians, then, have denied the personal relationship that every man in the state of grace has with God. But, and here lies the value of Bäbler’s entire article, this love that every man should have towards God is precisely what church music must speak to. Church musicians, as essentially all forms of prayer must be denied by them. After all, prayer is a personal conversation with God and as Bäbler has shown these theologians deny the personal love of an individual towards God. Peter Hofer points out that in our society there are many movements claiming to release men from the chains of this world. Men must have an interior life, and when it is denied, they will clamor for it and search for it. This phenomenon is happening today, has happened repeatedly in the past, and will happen again if the interior life is denied or laughed at. But many people who claim to offer the means to meditation are frauds and do not understand themselves what meditation is. Hofer outlines those qualities from which meditation must be built. The most interesting quality, for our purposes, is that the person who wishes to meditate must hear. Meditation is not the chattering of meaningless prayer after meaningless prayer, but it is listening to God speaking to you. It would seem to me that church music can establish the proper atmosphere for meditation when it is sung by the choir, since the congregation then listens and the possibility for meditation is certainly greater than if the congregation is forced to repeat or sing countless things during the Mass.

Much in this same vein is the short article by Karl Woschitz entitled “Cantare Amantis Est.” This quote from Augustine emphasizes that to sing is to love and to listen to singing is to be stimulated to love. In the light of the above, little comment is necessary on this point.

In a report on the eleventh annual study week for church musicians held in Graz, Austria, last summer, the reporter mentions that musicians at this symposium concluded that music sung exclusively by the choir is not opposed to the “active” participation of the people called for by the II Vatican Council. In fact, it is furthering the deepest kind of participation, the inner participation of the spirit in prayer and perhaps in meditation. The word used in the council documents, “actuosa,” is a somewhat rare Latin word which is not accurately rendered by the English active. It means just such inner participation that one has when one prays. It is therefore not necessary even to make bodily movements, not to mention singing or reciting long prayers at various times in the liturgy.

The same points are made in a report on the radio broadcasts of church music made every Sunday over Austrian radio. These have primarily the function of stimulating prayer and meditation, even though, in this instance, such prayer and meditation would be effected outside of the liturgy and in a somewhat artificial manner. One should not be surprised at such possibilities. The phonograph has made available to us a wide range of church music which can and perhaps should be used for private meditation in the home. Of course, this is not a substitute for the Holy Sacrifice of the Mass, but it is a legitimate form of private contemplation.

This issue of Singende Kirche is one of the finest issues they have published. Those readers who read German easily might well consider purchasing or ordering this issue.

RICHARD M. HOGAN
UNA VOCE (France), Number 62, May-June, 1975

This issue, devoted for the most part to an account of the eleventh annual conference of the French Una Voce society which took place at St. Brieuc in Brittany, is interesting for the details it gives about the state of affairs in France with regard to the Latin liturgy and Gregorian chant. I was especially impressed by the number of chant workshops that were given throughout the country during the year reported on. There seem to be more chant sung and more efforts to teach and promote it in France than in the United States. In fact, the French government announced a year ago the projects of establishing professorships of chant in national music conservatories and of creating a center for Gregorian chant in a renovated abbey. However, lest some American readers emigrate to France in the hopes of finding a sort of Utopia, we must note that the French government proposals were mentioned only because there has been no move to implement them yet and there seems to be as little support for the work of Una Voce among the hierarchy as in the United States — perhaps even less. The society received episcopal recognition of its annual meeting for the first time this year when Archbishop Keriveau of the diocese of St. Brieuc and Trégouer celebrated pontifical high Mass in Latin for the participants at a regularly scheduled Sunday Mass in the cathedral of Tréguier.

UNA VOCE (France), Number 63, July-August, 1975

In an article on the Mass facing God rather than the people the author presents the fact that from the earliest times Christian churches were built facing the east and that the most accurate way to describe the priest’s traditional position is not that he turns his back to the people, but rather that he stands at the head of the congregation facing east as it does, while leading it in prayer. The position is symbolic and mystical, expressing the passage from the human to the divine, from the visible to the invisible with the priest functioning as the intercessor-intermediary between God and man. The symbolic relationship between God and the east comes from the pagan worship of Apollo, the sun god, but it is evident from ancient liturgical texts that the symbolism became part of the Christian tradition very early. For example, the Christmas liturgy is full of comparisons between Christ and light. The author states that it is an error to say that in the ancient church the rule was to say Mass facing the people. Rather Mass was said facing the east. If some primitive Roman basilicas faced west rather than east, the priest said Mass facing the people only in order to face east. However, the orientation of a church toward the west was so unusual that in Paris a medieval church so oriented was called S. Benoit le Betourne (turned the right way). That the most accurate way to describe the priest’s traditional position vis a vis the people when saying Mass is not that he turns his back to the people, but rather that he stands at the head of the congregation facing east as it does, while leading it in prayer. The position is symbolic and mystical, expressing the passage from the human to the divine, from the visible to the invisible with the priest functioning as the intercessor-intermediary between God and man. The symbolic relationship between God and the east comes from the pagan worship of Apollo, the sun god, but it is evident from ancient liturgical texts that the symbolism became part of the Christian tradition very early. For example, the Christmas liturgy is full of comparisons between Christ and light. The author states that it is an error to say that in the ancient church the rule was to say Mass facing the people. Rather Mass was said facing the east. If some primitive Roman basilicas faced west rather than east, the priest said Mass facing the people only in order to face east. However, the orientation of a church toward the west was so unusual that in Paris a medieval church so oriented was called S. Benoit le Mal Tourné (turned the wrong way). In the sixteenth century when that church was rebuilt it was turned around to face east and then received the unusual name of S. Benoit le Betourne (turned the right way). That the people of the Middle Ages carried out a complicated symbolism in the construction of their churches we know from a study of the relationship between Chartres cathedral and the Speculum majus of Vincent of Beauvais, which is a sort of medieval encyclopedia. It is not therefore difficult to accept the idea that they would want to pray facing the east which represents the luminous promise of the everlasting kingdom. It is clear that J. Fournée, the author of this article, considers this mystical symbolism valid for twentieth century man.

The results of a survey taken by SOFRES-IT 1, a sort of French Gallup poll, reveal that there are 40% fewer practicing Catholics in France in 1975 than in 1971. Elsewhere in this issue it is reported that in a parish in Paris's seventeenth arrondissement only 1,000 of 40,000 inhabitants attend Mass on Sunday.

Records

As a sort of a footnote to the Bruckner year just past this short discography of the sacred works of the Austrian master is presented here. There are those who will argue that the whole of the Bruckner oeuvre is in a sense ‘sacred.’ Certainly no one else in the history of western music has spoken so consistently in the language of the transcendent. The thing about Bruckner is that he remained himself, uniquely himself, and dared to be himself. There is no one quite like him.

A catalogue of the extant sacred works runs somewhat as follows. There are, of course, the three numbered Masses, No. 1 in D minor of 1864, No. 2 in E minor of 1866-82, No. 3 in F minor 1867-90. Presently there is only one available recording of No. 1, that of Eugen Jochum and the Symphony Orchestra of the Bavarian Radio (DGG 2530 314). No. 2 Mass merits four available recordings, the Jochum as above (DGG 2530 139), Joachim Martini and the winds of the Vienna Symphony (BASF KMB 21336), Helmuth Rilling and Stuttgart Bach Collegium (Three Centuries of Music 3 C 320), and, having the benefit of being a live performance, the St. Agnes-Dallas Wanderer recording, No. 3 is represented by the Jochum, again as above, and also by the highly improbable Daniel Barenboim performance on Angel 5 36921, the improbability in this instance arising from the interest in this eminently Catholic statement, which the No. 3 Mass is, on the part of a South American gentleman of Jewish extraction working out of Protestant London. As one reviewer asked the question, “What is a nice boy like him doing in such company?”

The great Te Deum is currently to be had in four recordings; Jochum again on DGG 2707 024, Ormandy with the Philadelphia Orchestra on Columbia M2S 768, Haitink with the Concertgebouw on Philips 802 759 AY, and Lorenzo Bernardi on Orion ORS 6913 with the orchestra of the Leipzig Bach festival. Bruckner halfheartedly suggested that the Te Deum might be used as the finale of the unfinished 9th Symphony but few conductors have ever taken the suggestion seriously. The

v.s.
subtle mysticism of the 9th and the bold and forthright *cri de coeur* of simple Catholic faith in the *Te Deum* just are not artistically akin.

Various of the motets are used as fillers in the Jochum-Bavarian Radio complete symphony series discs — *Os justi*, *Vexilla regis*, *Christus factus est*, *Psalm 150*, *Locus iste*, *Ave Maria*, *Tota pulchra es*, *Virga Jesse*, *Ecce sacerdos*, *Afferentur regi*, *a Pange lingua*. The *Afferentur regi* and the *Ecce sacerdos*, plus an *Inveni David* appear on the BASF record of Martini with the Vienna winds. On the whole they are not very excitingly done.

This is not a considerable output. The *Mass in C* of 1842, the 1844 *Choral Mass in F major*, the 1848 *Requiem in D minor*, the 1850 *Missa pro Quadragesima*, the 1854 *Missa Solemnis in B flat minor* have never been fed into a mike. It might remain for some enterprising Catholic group to do something about the unrecorded Bruckner church music. It stands the chance of being a rewarding experience. It certainly would be a serviceable and appreciated one.

J.B.

**CONTRIBUTORS**

**Reverend Edward Holloway** is an English theologian and editor of *Faith*, a journal for priests published in London. He has lectured in the United States at thePontifical Institute of Catechetics at Gannon College, Erie, Pennsylvania.

**Joseph O'Connor** is a graduate student in musicology at Washington University, St. Louis, Missouri. Having lived at Solesmes Abbey for two years as a novice in the Benedictine order, he writes from first-hand experience. He is one of the organizers of the Latin Liturgy Association and directs a Gregorian chant choir that is very active in the St. Louis area.

**Anna Marie Ettel (Mrs. Michael F.)** is a graduate in music of the College of St. Catherine in St. Paul, Minnesota, and organist at the Church of the Maternity of Mary in St. Paul. A frequent lecturer on musical Americana, she has collected a significant number of nineteenth century songs, hymnals and sheet music editions.

**William Peter Mahrt**, a member of the editorial board of *Sacred Music*, is professor of musicology at Stanford University in Palo Alto, California, and a frequent contributor to these pages. He has his doctorate from Stanford University.

**MEMBERS IN PROFILE**

Although Sister C. A. Carroll, R.S.C.J., is well known to the readers of *Sacred Music* for the music reviews she provides so faithfully for each issue, we think it appropriate to make note of her many other accomplishments in the field of church music. At Manhattanville College she is professor of music, college organist, and is preparing a history of the Pius X School of Music. Her talents and expertise are much sought after as consultant for church music programs and lecturer at music workshops. She is also a member of the New York archdiocesan commission on sacred music.

Recently Mother Carroll has been training an adult choir in Gregorian chant. The group sings regularly at the Church of the Resurrection in Rye, New York, doing the Ordinary in Latin chant with other hymns and chants in English for congregational participation. In April Mother Carroll accompanied the choir to Rome for a Holy Year pilgrimage. While there they sang a Gregorian chant mass at St. Susanna and another at the North American College.

By invitation of the pastor, Monsignor John F. Davis, Father John M. Oates went to St. Michael's Church in Cranford, New Jersey, four years ago. His duties include implementing a musical and liturgical renewal in the parish.

Under his direction an enthusiastic music organization has become a reality. St. Michael's now has a choral society of 70 mixed voices and a full symphony orchestra of 60 pieces. Both perform with the organ at the Christmas and Easter Masses as well as at special sacred music concerts during the year. Long an advocate of bringing the world of Bach, Beethoven, Handel and Franck to the people, Father Oates has caused new interest in classic sacred music among his choir members and in many churches in the metropolitan New York area. His orchestra and choir are both completely volunteer with equal numbers of adults and teenagers.

Father Oates was formerly music director of Sacred Heart Cathedral, Newark. He has served on the archdiocesan music commission and on the executive council of the St. Gregory Society of America.

Dr. Peter La Manna will be busier than usual as the
August, 1976, opening of the Forty-first International Eucharistic Congress approaches, for as its director of music, he is charged with preparing a national choir and orchestra of 1200 to provide music for fifteen major liturgies to be celebrated at the congress. Dr. La Manna has also recently been appointed chairman of the Philadelphia archdiocesan liturgical music commission.

Dr. La Manna’s usual responsibilities are those of director of music at the Cathedral of SS. Peter and Paul in Philadelphia, chairman of the fine arts department of St. Charles Seminary, and musical director of the choral society of Reading, Pennsylvania.

In March of 1975, he sang the role of evangelist in the world premiere of Alberto Ginastera’s Turbae with the Philadelphia orchestra and the Mendelssohn club, a role which he repeated in November, 1975, with the Cleveland orchestra and chorus.

He is on the board of the Philadelphia chapter of CMAA and the secretary-treasurer of the National Association of Catholic Cathedral Choirmasters and Organists.

Ita (Mrs. Donald G.) Vellek, CMAA board member and author of music reviews for Sacred Music, is very active in the field of church music in the upper midwest.

Although her primary responsibility is that of organist and choir director at St. Patrick’s Church in Edina, a suburb of Minneapolis, she devotes a considerable amount of time as lecturer-clinician in church music and in lecture-demonstrations for elementary school children. In October, 1975, she presented an afternoon of demonstration lectures at a midwestern education congress at the request of the archdiocesan music commission.

Mrs. Vellek is interested in encouraging talented young musicians as she herself was encouraged. In 1950, she was designated the outstanding young musician in South Dakota, competing on the oboe against music students in all fields. She also plays the English horn, has taught piano and oboe, and has played with the Minnesota Orchestra, the St. Paul Chamber Orchestra and other musical groups.

A fellowship from the National Endowment for the Humanities has permitted Dr. Lavern Wagner to take a year’s leave of absence from Quincy College (Illinois) where he is chairman of the music department, to do extensive research in his area of specialization, the Flemish composers active at the court of Philip II of Spain in the sixteenth century. His specific research project includes transcribing the nineteen Masses of Pierre de Manchicourt. Dr. Wagner has already edited numerous volumes of sixteenth century music published by A-R Editions of Madison, Wisconsin, and the American Institute of Musicology.

He is co-editor of a music appreciation textbook, Music, published by Holt, Rinehart, and Winston. Since 1970, he has been music editor for the missalette, Pray Together, and has recently co-edited the Pray Together Hymnal, both publications of the Sunday Missal Service in Quincy.

Dr. Wagner’s family, which includes eleven natural children and three legally adopted mixed-race children, joins in his musical endeavors. Together they have made several recordings of original music from the missalette and Christmas songs.

As president of the American Federation of Pueri Cantores and vice-president of the international federation, Monsignor Charles N. Meter is now planning both the national congress of Pueri Cantores which will be held in Philadelphia during the month of April, 1976, and the international congress scheduled for London in July. Msgr. Meter is director of St. Joseph Boys Choir and pastor of St. Joseph Church, Wilmette, Illinois.

A graduate of the Pontifical Institute of Sacred Music in Rome, he also studied at Solesmes under Dom Gajard. He has taught music at Quigley Seminary in Chicago and Gregorian chant at DePaul School of Music from which he received the honorary degree of Doctor of Music. He has been director of the Quigley Seminary choir and the Cardinal’s Choristers of Holy Name Cathedral, Chicago. A member of CIMS, Msgr. Meter has attended several of its international congresses and served on the committee for the Chicago-Milwaukee meetings in 1966.
NEWS

The Schola Cantorum of the Church of the Holy Childhood, Saint Paul, Minnesota, began its autumn season with the Missa "Et in terra pax" by Alexander Gretchaninoff, October 19, 1975. Other music included his Great Litany, used as the prayer of the faithful, O plena gratia, and two organ pieces. On November 2, All Souls' Day, the men and boys' choir sang Gabriel Fauré's Requiem with members of the Minnesota Orchestra. Bruce Larsen is conductor and Merritt Nequette, organist.

Plans are being made for two congresses of Pueri Cantores. The first is scheduled for Philadelphia, April 19–20 of the bicentennial year, 1976. Main event of the meeting will be pontifical Mass in the Cathedral of SS. Peter and Paul. The second congress is the international meeting to be held in London, England, July 7–11, 1976. Westminster Cathedral Choir and the Little Singers of the Wooden Cross of Paris will sing a concert. Information on both conventions may be obtained from Monsignor Charles N. Meter, 1747 Lake Avenue, Wilmette, Illinois 60091.

In a letter from Cardinal Villiot, papal secretary of state, the Holy Father has approved the election of the praesidium of the Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae for the coming five years. According to the statutes given to CIMS by the Holy See papal confirmation of the officers is required. Monsignor Johannes Overath of Cologne, Germany, is president; Monsignor Richard J. Schuler of Saint Paul, Minnesota, is first vice-president; and Canon René B. Lenaerts of Louvain, Belgium is second vice-president. Elected as members of the council are Prof. Joseph Lennards of Roermond, The Netherlands, Prof. Jean-Pierre Schmit of Luxembourg, Monsignor Gerard Mizgalski of Poznán, Poland, and Edouard Souberbielle of Meudon, France.

Father Lawrence Miech, C.Ss.R., has published a short monograph on his teacher and colleague, Father Francis Joseph Brunner (1911–1965). Part of a series entitled “Let us now praise great men,” the article is written as a centenary observance of the Saint Louis Province of the Redemptorists. Father Brunner was a founding member of the Church Music Association of America and a frequent contributor to Caecilia, The Catholic Chorister and Sacred Music. He translated Joseph Jungmann’s Missarum solemnia and other works from German into English. He received the Boys' Town Cecilia medal and was one of the regular members of the summer workshops there. To his many friends this little tribute is a most welcome recollection of a special man of God, as Father Miech has called him.

James Herbert Sheehan has retired as organist and choirmaster of the Church of Saint John the Evangelist in Winthrop, Massachusetts. He had filled that position for over fifty years. The parish extended to him a tribute, saying that his contribution to the liturgical life of the community had been truly outstanding.

In a letter to the Italian National Congress on Sacred Music, held in Genoa, September 26, 1975, Cardinal Villiot wrote the delegates in the name of the Holy Father. Among other points he said: “If sacred music is a necessary and integral part of the liturgy and has the same identical purposes: the glorification of God and the sanctification of the faithful, it must also be based on the same theological principles ... It will therefore be necessary to avoid and prevent secular musical forms being admitted to liturgical celebrations, particularly singing which is too frenetic, aggressive and noisy in style, which disturbs the serene quietness of liturgical action and cannot be reconciled with its spiritual and sanctifying aims. A wide field is open for effective pastoral action which, while it endeavors to educate the faithful to take part in the liturgical rites also with voice and song, must at the same time preserve them from the offensiveness of noise, bad taste and desacralization. It must promote, on the other hand, that sacred music which helps souls to rise to God and gives them, in the devout singing of divine praises, a foretaste, almost an anticipation, of the heavenly liturgy.”

Christmas was celebrated at the Church of Saint Agnes in Saint Paul, Minnesota, with a full program of Masses and the hours of the Office. On the eve of Christmas the schola of men sang first vespers followed by the Mass of the vigil in Gregorian chant. Later in the evening the hour of matins was sung followed by the midnight Mass at which the Twin Cities Catholic Chorale sang Joseph Haydn’s Heiligmesse assisted by members of the Minnesota Orchestra. At the solemn Mass during the day the parish choir sang Ernst Tittel’s Muttergottesmesse, and in the afternoon of Christmas day the schola chanted the second vespers of the feast. On each of the days of the Christmas octave, vespers and Mass were sung in full Gregorian settings by the schola, while on the Sunday after Christmas the Chorale sang Joseph Haydn’s Paukensmesse and on the Epiphany his Mariazellermesse with orchestra.

The seventh annual Christmas concert of the Pueblo Symphony Association was performed in Memorial Hall in Pueblo, Colorado, December 7, 1975, for a capacity audience. Music included Franz Xaver Brixi's Pastores, Anton Bruckner's Virga Jesse, Max di Julio's Lumen Christi, a Christmas cantata, and several medleys of Christmas carols arranged by Gerhard Track and Arthur Harris. The major work on the program was Gerhard...
The 450th anniversary of the birth of Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina was commemorated by the Congregatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae at the Cathedral of S. Agapito in the city of Palestrina, some thirty miles south of Rome, November 21, 1975. Canon René B. Lenaerts of the University of Louvain in Belgium was celebrant of the solemn Mass, assisted by Prof. Jean-Pierre Schmit and Monsignor Richard J. Schuler. The choir of the cathedral of Augsburg, Germany, sang Palestrina’s Missa Lauda Sion and the Palestrina Motet Choir of Tegernsee in Germany sang his Ave Maria. The proper was sung by a choir of students from the Pontifical Institute of Sacred Music in Rome in Gregorian chant. Among the other activities of CIMS in connection with the bicentennial we feature the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception on the cover of this issue. We also include photographs of some historic churches of the east coast and Spanish missions from San Antonio, Texas. It was in 1914 that Bishop Thomas Shahan, rector of the Catholic University, interested the Catholic hierarchy of the United States in erecting a shrine in the nation’s capital to the Blessed Virgin Mary under the title of the Immaculate Conception, the country’s official patron since 1847. The cornerstone of the shrine was laid in 1920, but it was not until 1954 that the Shrine of the Immaculate Conception was completed. The church, built in a modified Byzantine, Romanesque style, contains shrines of the saints especially honored by the various nationality groups that came to the United States and also those saints connected with the growth and development of the Catholic Church in America.

Old St. Stephen’s Church in Boston as it now stands was designed by Charles Bulfinch, America’s first native born architect, and completed in 1804 for the New North Congregational Society. Bulfinch’s design was inspired by the Italian Renaissance style. In 1862 the church was acquired by the Boston archdiocese and renamed in honor of St. Stephen. Twice swept by fire it was restored to its original Bulfinch design by Richard Cardinal Cushing in 1965. The church is now the international headquarters of the Society of St. James the Apostle, an organization of diocesan priests who volunteer to serve the people of Latin America.

The Mission of San Antonio de Valero is probably the most famous mission church in San Antonio, Texas, because of its association with the battle of the Alamo which took place there in 1836. The name Alamo refers to the place of origin of the Mexican cavalry stationed in the secularized mission from the year 1801. The mission itself was founded in 1718 by Father Antonio de Olivares under the authorization of the Spanish viceroy of Mexico to christianize and educate the Indians. The church structure, standing today in downtown San Antonio, was begun about 1755.

The Mission Nuestra Señora de la Purisima Concepcion, established in San Antonio in 1731, is the oldest unrestored stone church in the United States. Above the door in Spanish are these words: “This mission serves with these arms its patroness and princess, and defends the doctrine of her purity.” The arms are three Franciscan emblems, along with the knotted scourge of the Franciscan order, and the date 1754.

The Mission San Jose y San Miguel de Aguayo is known as the queen of the missions. The rich façade of the domed church and the exquisitely carved “rose” window are especially to be admired. The window, carved by Pedro Huizar, is not a rose window in the strict architectural sense, but rather probably takes its name from the carved floral decoration surrounding it.
church itself is in a compound of mission buildings including Indian dwellings, granary and workshops, all completely restored.

St. Ignatius Church at Chapel Point, Maryland, built in 1798, commands a magnificent view of the Port Tobacco and Potomac Rivers. It is one of the nation's oldest active Catholic parishes, having been founded in 1641 by Father White as a mission to the Indians. St. Thomas Manor, which is adjacent to the church, was the early home of the Jesuits in America.

V.S.

In the Fall and Winter, 1975, issues of AIM, published by the J. S. Paluch Company, appears an article in two parts entitled "The Priestly Ministry of Music," by Reverend Willard F. Jabusch, which seeks to instruct parish priests in dealing with the music in their churches. Widely circulated and touching on the fundamental principles of church music, it requires consideration here.

Father's opposition to choirs, except possibly for leading congregational singing, is quite plain. "A Sanctus by Palestrina would be far more impressive to the visitor behind the pillar than congregational singing, perhaps. But its intricate polyphony would rule out participation by the people even after they had learned the Latin. Palestrina's musical masterpiece does not 'work.' It does not do what music at this moment in the Mass should do." Moreover, he is against fine music. "As long as we approach church music with the mentality of a Carnegie Hall music critic, as long as we judge the music, which supports the words, with the perfectionism of a Julliard Conservatory professor of composition, as long as we think of the congregation, the choir, and the soloist as people merely performing rather than as people involved in praying, in witnessing, in preaching the word, we continue to be concerned about the wrong things and the 'ministry of music' is crippled." Here he betray's nearly inconsistent opinions: on the one hand he insists on the ministerial function of church music, and on the other hand he denies the choir its proper ministerial role. Father is at odds with the mind of the Church. "Choirs must be diligently promoted . . . ", says the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy of the Second Vatican Council (Article 114), and adds an endorsement of polyphony (Article 116). The Church teaches that active participation must be both exterior and interior, the latter being fostered very effectively by good choir music. Moreover, Father disregards human experience. In the sixteenth century the Calvinists threw out choirs and organs, but later saw that this was a mistake and brought them back, so that now, chances are, the local Presbyterian church has music of a higher level than the Catholic.

Further on we find the following: 'There is no sacred tune, no sacred musical style, no especially holy instrument. The organ may be the 'king of instruments' but it can claim no greater privileges in the liturgy than the flute or the piano, the drums or the glockenspiel.' On the contrary, the Constitution contains a whole chapter entitled "Sacred Music." It indicates clearly that there is a difference between secular and sacred music and singles out the pipe organ as especially suitable for sacred use. Everyone knows that there is a difference, even though it might be difficult to define and is not absolute, since certain secular pieces and styles have been adapted for sacred use, while sacred pieces have a limited use in secular concerts. It is notable that even in the present liturgical free-for-all hardly anyone thinks of bringing the piano into church, and the reason is precisely this, that the development of piano playing, of the greatest refinement and beauty in itself, has been wholly along secular lines.

The words, says Father Jabusch, are of the greatest importance in church music. It seems that for him melody, harmony, and the rest are of no importance except as a vehicle for congregational recitation of the texts. And this is not the end of the errors of this article, of which we have singled out only the grossest and most obvious.

The article is full of rude and derogatory remarks about musicians. If a pastor adopts the attitudes of Father Jabusch he will quickly drive away any musician of even the slightest ability, whether he be an organist with years of conservatory training or a teen-aged guitar player with little more than a natural sense of rhythm. We had thought that such clerical bad manners had gone out at the time of Vatican II.

Father gives no real arguments for his opinions; he merely recites dogmatically his personal prejudices, which are patently contrary to common sense, musical wisdom, and the teaching of the Church. If he is a pastor and has imposed these prejudices on his parish liturgy, we can only pity the poor parishioners, who are subjected to the resulting dreariness.

W.F.P.

I have been asked to write a few words in comment on the review of the Sixth International Church Music Congress published by Monsignor Robert Hayburn in the winter 1974 issue of Musart (Vol. 27, No. 2). The congress was held in Salzburg, Austria, from August 26 to September 2, 1974. Monsignor Hayburn gives a very detailed and accurate account of the program, including the Masses, concerts and lectures which truly filled the days of the meeting.

However, even though he was present and participated in all the events of the congress program, there are a few misunderstandings that have crept into the Musart article that need some clarification. First, the nature of the Consociatio Internationalis Musicæ Sacrae must be explained. This is a papal society, erected by Pope Paul VI in 1963, and as such functions under the direct supervision of the Vatican. In 1969, the papal Secretary of State issued to CIMS a new set of statutes by which only experts in the field of music (composers, performers or musicologists) are to be members, although those who had been admitted under
the old 1963 provisions could be retained as members also. The society exists for the service of the Holy See and for those national conferences of bishops who request advice in matters of music and liturgy. Election procedures in CIMS are governed by the statutes of the society and by the rules used in ecclesiastical voting which are not necessarily what an American might expect. Since membership in CIMS is not open to everyone, the number of members is not an indication of the health or vigor of the society. Financially, CIMS is in good order, a fact confirmed by its ability to organize international congresses of the scope of the Salzburg event and the several symposia that have brought experts from the countries of eastern Europe and from missionary lands, an expense undertaken by CIMS itself. Truly it is an international organization both in membership and in the scope of its activities. Monsignor’s objection that no choirs from the Third World were present in Salzburg cannot be a discredit to CIMS, for who indeed could expect any organization to pay for the transportation of hundreds of choir members from South America, Africa or Asia to the European meeting? In due time, no doubt, meetings in those parts of the world will be organized.

Most disturbing of Monsignor Hayburn’s comments are, however, those with reference to Gregorian chant. He says that the emphasis put by CIMS on the use of Gregorian chant is unrealistic. But as a papal society, CIMS is dedicated to carrying out the wishes of the Holy See. The use of Gregorian chant has been mandated by the Vatican Council, by various decrees issued to implement the orders of the council, and by Pope Paul himself on many occasions. The Jubilate Deo sent by the Holy Father to the bishops of the world at Eastertime surely makes it very clear that chant is to be learned, cherished and used not merely by trained groups but by entire congregations. That Gregorian chant is necessary in mission lands is able to be ascertained by talking with musicians from those areas. At the recent symposium in Rome, sponsored by CIMS, on the subject of native music for the liturgy in the missions and by the rules used in ecclesiastical voting which are not necessarily what an American might expect. Since membership in CIMS is not open to everyone, the number of members is not an indication of the health or vigor of the society. Financially, CIMS is in good order, a fact confirmed by its ability to organize international congresses of the scope of the Salzburg event and the several symposia that have brought experts from the countries of eastern Europe and from missionary lands, an expense undertaken by CIMS itself. Truly it is an international organization both in membership and in the scope of its activities. Monsignor’s objection that no choirs from the Third World were present in Salzburg cannot be a discredit to CIMS, for who indeed could expect any organization to pay for the transportation of hundreds of choir members from South America, Africa or Asia to the European meeting? In due time, no doubt, meetings in those parts of the world will be organized.

Most disturbing of Monsignor Hayburn’s comments are, however, those with reference to Gregorian chant. He says that the emphasis put by CIMS on the use of Gregorian chant is unrealistic. But as a papal society, CIMS is dedicated to carrying out the wishes of the Holy See. The use of Gregorian chant has been mandated by the Vatican Council, by various decrees issued to implement the orders of the council, and by Pope Paul himself on many occasions. The Jubilate Deo sent by the Holy Father to the bishops of the world at Eastertime surely makes it very clear that chant is to be learned, cherished and used not merely by trained groups but by entire congregations. That Gregorian chant is necessary in mission lands is able to be ascertained by talking with musicians from those areas. At the recent symposium in Rome, sponsored by CIMS, on the subject of native music for the liturgy in the missions, one of the conclusions reached by all participants was the need for a continuing use of chant in those countries.

I regret that Monsignor Hayburn was unable to con-celebrate the Mass in the beautiful new Cathedral of Linz, but arrangements for ceremonies for such an event are made some time in advance, and the plans having being formulated did not admit of further con-celebrants without previous announcement. It is true that the high altars of many of the great churches were used, but, then, as has been so often pointed out, there is no legis-la-tion coming either from the council or from post-conciliar documents that demands an altar versus populum. The solemn form of Mass with the assistance of deacons and arch-priest is actually spoken of in the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy and is found in use regularly in great European churches and cathedrals. The proceeding with the distribution of holy communion during the singing of an extended Agnus Dei seems to me to be a rather prac-tical adaptation that the reformed liturgy so wisely allows.

The pluralism that one encounters today can be for us Americans an opportunity to learn and perhaps to find ceremonial ritual that we can well make use of in our churches.

Finally, the criticism of there being too much Latin and too little congregational singing demands only a recalling that at international events with peoples from many nations Latin is the one unifying, practical instrument for communication. Had German been the vernacular used exclusively (and it had a right to be, since the congress was in Austria), what would have been the reaction of French, English or Polish? And how can such congregations sing together except in Latin at such multi-lingual meetings? So when there was congregational singing, it was in the Latin tongue, which led to a criticism that it was not pastoral or practical for Americans. The extent of the vernacular used at Salzburg can easily be checked by consulting the program, and it was extensive in the languages utilized and in the volume of literature presented. The degree of congregational participation was likewise extensive, because every Mass involved the people in all the responses and acclamations, which were printed in the program itself.

Monsignor Hayburn does not think there will be much of a future for CIMS unless its attitude is changed. CIMS is doing what the Holy See has asked. I believe it will continue and its task will remain unchanged — the implement ing of the wishes of its founder, the Holy Father.

R.J.S.
Large Choral Works for Holy Week

The Passion According to Saint Mark
Ronald A. Nelson
Appropriate for the current Series B Lectionary. For mezzo soprano, contralto, tenor, and bass soloists, SATB choir, narrator, congregation, organ and/or piano. Instrumental scores available for optional orchestration.
9338 Complete Score 1.35
9339 Bulletin with Congregation Part 7.00/100

The Words from the Cross
Paul Fetler
Effective in its entirety as a Good Friday service or separately during Lent or Holy Week. For narrator, SATB choir, and organ.
9536 Complete Score 1.00

The Seven Words from the Cross
Knut Nystedt
Dramatic and sensitive in its telling. For liturgist (chanting), male soloists, and SATB choir.
1287 Complete Score .40

PAUL MANZ—Praise to the Lord, the Almighty
for choir, congregation, brass quartet, and organ
Score 97-5296 $2.50
Choir copy 97-5297 .30
Set of Instrumental Parts 97-5298 2.75

JAN BENDER—How Lovely Shines the Morning Star
for choir, congregation, trumpet, and organ
Score 98-2211 $3.40
Choir copy 98-2260 .60
Instrumental Part 98-2261 .90

S. DRUMMOND WOLF—Adeste Fideles—O Come, All Ye Faithful
for choir, congregation, 2 trumpets, and organ
Set of Instrumental Parts 98-2243 1.00

THEODORE BECK—Seven Anthems for Treble Choirs, Set II
97-5163 $1.90
With various types of accompaniment—guitar, autoharp, keyboard instrument, handbells.
INDEX TO VOLUME 102

ARTICLES

"Gregorian Chant as a Fundamentum of Western Musical Culture" by William Peter Mahrt Spring 1975

"Anton Bruckner and Church Music" by Wouter Paap Summer 1975


"Corpus Christi, 1975" by Monsignor Richard J. Schuler Summer 1975

"What We Profess" by Monsignor Richard J. Schuler Fall 1975

"The Musical Shape of the Liturgy Part I: The Gregorian Mass in General" by William Peter Mahrt Fall 1975

"The New Books for High Mass" by Harold Hughesdon Fall 1975

"Latin Liturgy Association" by James Hitchcock Fall 1975

"The Christ Principle in the Liturgy" by Rev. Edward Holloway Winter 1975

"Solesmes in the 1970's" by Joseph O'Connor Winter 1975

"How To Buy a Pipe Organ" by Anna Marie Ettel Winter 1975

"The Musical Shape of the Liturgy Part II: The Polyphonic Mass" by William Peter Mahrt Winter 1975

"Native Music in the Missions" by Monsignor Richard J. Schuler Winter 1975

BOOKS REVIEWED

Vatican II Hymnal edited by Terry L. Haws Summer 1975

CHORAL MUSIC REVIEWED

G.I.A. Publications Spring 1975

Missa Brevis by Gerhard Track. G.I.A. Publications Fall 1975

Graduale Romanum Abbey St. Pierre of Solesmes, 1974 Winter 1975

MAGAZINES REVIEWED

Gregoriusblad, Vol. 98, No. 4 December 1974

Gregoriusblad, Vol. 99, No. 2 June 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 16, No. 10 November 1974

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 1 January 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 3 March 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 4 April 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 5 May 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 6 June 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 7 September 1975


Music — A.G.O. and R.C.C.O., Vol. 9, No. 4 April 1975

Music Ministry, Vol. 7, No. 4 December 1974

Music Ministry, Vol. 7, No. 5 January 1975

Music Ministry, Vol. 7, No. 6 February 1975

Music Ministry, Vol. 7, No. 12 August 1975

Music Ministry, Vol. 8, No. 1 September 1975

Singende Kirche, Vol. 22, No. 2 1974-75

Singende Kirche, Vol. 22, No. 3 1974-75

SAMPLE MUSIC AND SPECIAL REVIEWS

Thirteen Amens and Alleluias by M. Praetorius. Spring 1975

Hide Not Thy Face From Us, O Lord by Richard Farrant, arranged by S. Drummond Wolff. Concordia Publishing House Summer 1975

What We Profess by Monsignor Richard J. Schuler Fall 1975

The Musical Shape of the Liturgy Part I: The Gregorian Mass in General by William Peter Mahrt Fall 1975

The New Books for High Mass by Harold Hughesdon Fall 1975

Latin Liturgy Association by James Hitchcock Fall 1975

The Christ Principle in the Liturgy by Rev. Edward Holloway Winter 1975

Solesmes in the 1970's by Joseph O'Connor Winter 1975

How To Buy a Pipe Organ by Anna Marie Ettel Winter 1975

The Musical Shape of the Liturgy Part II: The Polyphonic Mass by William Peter Mahrt Winter 1975

Native Music in the Missions by Monsignor Richard J. Schuler Winter 1975

BOOKS REVIEWED

Vatican II Hymnal edited by Terry L. Haws Summer 1975

CHORAL MUSIC REVIEWED

G.I.A. Publications Spring 1975

Missa Brevis by Gerhard Track. G.I.A. Publications Fall 1975

Graduale Romanum Abbey St. Pierre of Solesmes, 1974 Winter 1975

MAGAZINES REVIEWED

Gregoriusblad, Vol. 98, No. 4 December 1974

Gregoriusblad, Vol. 99, No. 2 June 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 16, No. 10 November 1974

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 1 January 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 3 March 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 4 April 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 5 May 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 6 June 1975

Journal of Church Music, Vol. 17, No. 7 September 1975


Music — A.G.O. and R.C.C.O., Vol. 9, No. 4 April 1975

Music Ministry, Vol. 7, No. 4 December 1974

Music Ministry, Vol. 7, No. 5 January 1975

Music Ministry, Vol. 7, No. 6 February 1975

Music Ministry, Vol. 7, No. 12 August 1975

Music Ministry, Vol. 8, No. 1 September 1975

Singende Kirche, Vol. 22, No. 2 1974-75

Singende Kirche, Vol. 22, No. 3 1974-75

RECORDS REVIEWED

Summer 1975

Winter 1975
AN INVITATION TO JOIN
THE LATIN LITURGY ASSOCIATION

The Association seeks to further the use of Latin as a living means of worship in our day alongside the vernacular, and as the vehicle of the spiritual and cultural heritage of nearly two thousand years.

It is the purpose of the Association to encourage the celebration of Mass and the Divine Office in Latin in our parishes, with special emphasis on the sung Mass.

Write the secretary, Mrs. Jean Findlay
Millbank
Afton, Virginia 22920

Regular member — $5; Sustaining member — $10; Supporting member — $25.