SACRED MUSIC  Continuation of Caecilia, published by the Society of St. Caecilia since 1874, and The Catholic Choirmaster, published by the Society of St. Gregory of America since 1915. Published quarterly by the Church Music Association of America. Office of publication: 548 Lafond Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55103.

Editorial Board:  Rev. Msgr. Richard J. Schuler, Editor
                   Harold Hughesdon
                   Virginia A. Schubert
                   Rev. Richard M. Hogan
                   Mary Ellen Strapp

       548 Lafond Avenue, Saint Paul, Minnesota 55103

Music for Review:  Paul Salamunovich, 10828 Valley Spring Lane, N. Hollywood, Calif. 91602
                  Rev. Ralph S. March, S.O. Cist., Eintrachstrasse 166, D-5000 Koln, 1, West Germany
                  Paul Manz, 7204 Schey Drive, Edina, Minnesota 55435

Membership, Circulation and Advertising:  Earl D. Hogan, 3800 Crystal Lake Blvd., Minneapolis, Minnesota 55422

CHURCH MUSIC ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA
Officers and Board of Directors
President  Monsignor Richard J. Schuler
Vice-President  Gerhard Track
General Secretary  Virginia A. Schubert
Treasurer  B. Allen Young
Directors  Mrs. Richard K. Biggs
            Mrs. Donald G. Vellek
            William P. Mahrt
            Rev. Robert A. Skeris

Membership in the CMAA includes a subscription to SACRED MUSIC. Voting membership, $12.50 annually; subscription membership, $10.00 annually; student membership, $5.00 annually. Single copies, $3.00. Send membership applications and change of address to Earl D. Hogan, 3800 Crystal Lake Blvd., Minneapolis, Minnesota 55422. Make all checks payable to Church Music Association of America.

Second class postage paid at St. Paul, Minnesota.

Library of Congress catalog card number: 62-6712/MN.
Sacred Music is indexed in the Catholic Periodical and Literature Index and in Music Index.


Copyright, Church Music Association of America, 1981.
The church music of today presents a very contradictory picture. It seems that liturgical music has lost its orientation. The liturgical reforms brought fruitful new beginnings and uncertainties as well. Today's confusion does not resemble a fruitful wilderness capable of producing new harvests, so much as it resembles the Babylonian confusion of tongues. The uncertainty is increased through the efforts of ecclesiastical circles to avoid at all costs any appearance of "backwardness," and to show their "openness" by copying every changing fashion of the day. One is quite willing to allow others to pull one's chestnuts out of the fire.

Indications as to what could be appropriate for the liturgy from a musical point of view should not amount to a rigid corset; they have rather the function of a skin, which is elastic, allowing growth while still giving form. That is far removed from rigid rubricism. If one wishes to separate the chaff from the wheat, it cannot, of course, be done without some criticism, above all in an age in which attempts are made to declare that the chaff is really wheat.

How necessary this is can be shown by means of an example: during a church concert I heard an Our Father composition which made use above all of language as such. The palette ranged from various kinds of speaking through singing all the way to the scream. The piece ended with an exhausted Amen which was scarcely audible. Although it was certainly effective, this piece made an anguished impression. It was a cheerless monologue of varied, individually muttering, screaming, singing men. Such expressionism is not useable in the liturgy, for it suggests that "We can't pray any more." It is the exact opposite of a common prayer. I am not assuming that this composition was conceived for the liturgy, and I understand completely the intentions of the composer even though they do not agree with my own conception of the Lord's Prayer. But I could easily imagine that a lot of people would hit upon the idea of using the piece in a worship service in the belief that it will make their liturgy "relevant" (as the fashionable word has it). My own experience indicates that many composers hardly inquire at all concerning the hidden difficulties of their creative efforts, and if they do so at all, then they deal much more with technical than with ideal matters. It is completely legitimate for people to strive for success. Depending on one's personal attitude, means are chosen which appear suitable for achieving the goal. Many pay tribute to a mere opportunism of success. They keep very diligent watch for the slightest changes in fashionable gestures, are accustomed to rearranging themselves every few years, and try, like the droplets of fat on a bowl of soup, to swim on the top. Many have developed virtuoso talents in this regard.

For serious artistic creation, however, such a foundation is much too meager, though one can be quite successful in the genre. Sooner or later everyone, especially if he practices a church music which does not desire to be a mere fortuitous mirror of the spirit of the age — or its dis-spirit — must make up his mind what sort of music his is going to be. The artist does not produce any "wares" in the sense of an economic value. Naturally the composer has to deal with the contradiction that music is simultaneously art and a product, but that is the material side of his problem. Here we are concerned with the ideal side.

In his Numbers and God Ernst Junger writes: "Without the Muses there exists neither personal happiness nor higher spirituality. Their service presumes inner freedom and the courage to make sacrifices. That has always been true: the poet was only summoned
when the goods had already been distributed. Poverty remained his privilege. Within a world that is numbered up and counted down he becomes unnecessary, indeed burdensome. The powers that we expect from him are a tendentious opportunism in the sense of their own machinations. That produces trumpeter types.”

Junger’s next paragraph also touches our problem more than is evident at first glance. “The atrophy of artistic education leaves hollow spaces behind, which invention makes an effort to fill up.” (Junger distinguishes invention and fabrication. Invention has a purpose, fabrication a meaning.) “The value of poetry is supposed to be marked with a number. Technology penetrates into the world of dreams and images. That would have remained insignificant if others powers had not simultaneously been set free. Demons build their nests in the decaying altars.”

The composer of liturgical music is supposed to create resonant symbols, emblems of the Divine in sound. The normal attitude towards the composer all too easily regards him as a mere “beautifier” or “embellisher” who is ultimately superfluous. It is my view that in the case of liturgical music we are dealing not simply with an additive embellishing, but with the integration of music in the liturgy, even in its simplest and most modest form. Here, a sham art in the sense of the “trumpeter types” cannot suffice. Here the Church, too, stands at a fork in the road: whether she takes over the ant-hill style which is the effect and expression of the mob psychology of our day, especially in the form of a conscious trivialism; or whether she does not drop the demand for a higher spirituality. This demand can apply effectively even to the most modest liturgical music. The whole question is basically one of inner attitude, and not of complicated artistic construction.

The invasion of the interior world by technology will occupy us under the aspect of electronic music. It belongs to the problematic of our own time that hybrid forces are arising, which want to usurp the Christian worship service. The re-interpretation of liturgical actions in the sense of a merely temporal horizontalism has far reaching consequences for the music connected therewith. If cult decays, then the music connected with cult either decays along with it, or makes itself independent of cult. For the composer, the trivial mass style is less of a temptation than it is for the pastor of souls, who wants to win over the masses for pastoral reasons. In the process, one is willing to put up with the fact that the faith is falsified by kitsch; one comforts oneself with the hope that when one once has the masses, one will be able to make up for that later on — first, however, one must have them. Such successes are dubious, as are all successes which one tries to achieve through back-door shortcuts. As soon as the masses perceive that something else was really intended, they split off and fall away again. Some declare triviality to be a completely suitable means of expression for religious content, and often join with this an anti-artistic attitude. This is supported with the old slogan that there really is no distinction between the sacred and the profane, although that contradicts both the New Testament (driving the money-changers out of the temple!) and the experience of humanity.

Triviality is a diminishing of man’s ability to experience, limiting it to the level of instinctive impulses. As sentimentality, organistic enthusiasm, and dressed-up pathos it appeals to man’s lowest level. Liturgical music, on the other hand, must appeal to all of man’s levels, including the spiritual and intellectual sphere. But that does not mean it needs to be barren of sentiment. The point at which the trivial makes its inroads is the vernacular language; nobody understands trivialities in Latin. But one should not make the fathers of the popular liturgy responsible for this. For them, the problem was not
posed in all the sharpness with which it is posed for us, because the understanding of theology was by and large still intact then. It was only the appearance of horizontalistic theories (which the sociologist Helmut Schelsky aptly characterized in the motto “From the salvation of souls to social salvation”) which made possible the fundamental invasion of the shallow and the superficial. This was all the easier because the mass media had already pre-manipulated the masses in this respect, through a constant irrigation or sprinkling with insipid music.

It would be risky to join in the manipulations characteristic of commercial music. In the long run, people will not allow themselves to be treated like children. Sooner or later the result will be inner withdrawal, or opposing actions. There is no comparison here with earlier times, in which trivial music was just beginning to arise. Corresponding to the struggle over environmental pollution, there will arise movements to protest this constant sprinkling with more shallow and superficial music. Slogans such as “Village without a jukebox” or “No loudspeaker will disturb you here” are the first signs pointing in this direction. The weariness of the pop scene, and the clear withdrawal of one-time initiators of these trends from the tumult and commercial selling, are further indications that the problematic phase of commercial music is only beginning. The difficulties are still to come. One should really be more critical of attempts to get into the swim of things in this area, for otherwise the Church might once more end up on the wrong side.

In the book, New Music since 1945, by H. Vogt, co-author Hans Peter Raiss defines as follows: “Beat is the designation for an extremely orgiastic music whose driving meters and garish harmony are able to suspend temporarily the playing of roles dictated by society, in those who listen to it.” Amateur hobbyists pieced together political songs whose surrogate nature, however, did not remain unnoticed. The Left was more alert and keen of hearing than the progressive assistant pastors, for it stoutly resisted this culture industry which bought and sold their own intentions for a profit, and thus falsified them. “The pop scene,” says Raiss, “has consolidated itself into the multi-media show: flashing strobe lights, and acoustic spectacles, clouds of marijuana smoke and libido-lyrics, films, comics.” A new church music for the masses cannot be made of such ingredients, as some dreamers believe. Christian worship is no Dionysian orgy. Simplicity does not have to be trivial. The attempt to “actualize” or make relevant a (supposedly) moribund great art through trivial elements is not really new. During the renaissance, for instance, people wanted to “enliven” the church music of the Netherlanders (whose spiritual presuppositions were no longer understood) by adding elements of the dance music of the day. As a sublimation, this effort succeeded very, very seldom, and when it did, then the process could no longer be recognized as such. Then as now, behind these attempts there stood a lack of original ideas on how to renew art from within itself, and the constantly recurring effort to score cheap and speedy numerical successes. One might say (with Hocke) that in a certain sense people of that age “jazzed up” great art.

Linked with the attempt to be as relevant as possible, on the broadest possible basis, one can repeatedly observe a tendency toward liturgical horizontalism and functionalism. In an effort at intelligibility (in itself legitimate) one oversteps the boundaries which lead to falsifications. The process amounts to a rationalistic, nihilistic procedure of reduction. Holy Mass becomes primarily a celebration of common humanity and brotherliness: all other aspects recede into the background. In trying to make worship more understandable, all relationships which are more difficult of
understanding are either re-interpreted, or simply omitted. The only function left to the
Kyrie is setting the mood, or isolated penance; sometimes it is omitted entirely, since the
term "sin" is not especially welcome in many theological circles, and thus why bother
with a confession of sins? The Gloria is simply a song of praise, the Sanctus likewise; the
Angus Dei resembles the Kyrie and is a cry for mercy. From this point of view everything
ultimately becomes interchangeable. And replaceable. People replace biblical texts with
others, because they no longer can or want to make the imagery and the deeper
meaning transparent to others. Why make a detour?, they ask. If everything must be
explained in any case, then let us rather take a text which is self-explanatory.
Unfortunately, these substitute texts practically never provide the same spiritual
richness and depth as inspired biblical texts. As a consequence of these re-
interpretations, there then arise compositions (called "Masses") on texts which cause
religious problems, texts which are very far from the message contained in, say, the
Ordinarium Missae. One ends up in subjectivity, and ultimately in the uncontrollable.
Then everything is simultaneously true and false. This exclusively horizontal
understanding is ultimately based on the view that in the Eucharist, independent of our
consciousness, nothing really happens — everything is to be taken in a purely symbolic
way. It is regrettable that two groups form as a result: the rigid traditionalists, who are
simply unapproachable in view of the blunders of a so-called Renovatio, and the
progressivists, who believe that tradition alone is responsible for the difficulties of the
present, and who would prefer to change everything radically. The solution actually lies
in the middle: conservare et promovere. Naturally, this has effects on church music which
cannot be overlooked.

If the problems of the trivial are primarily pedagogical, then discussion of the theories
of the avant garde brings us to some central questions regarding composing. To what
extent is it possible to make use, in church music, of what are known as “progressive
techniques”?

When Richard Wagner said, “Boys, do something new,” his statement became a
slogan or, more correctly, a premise for any kind of artistic accomplishment at all. But is
newness really a completely binding premise? Taken by and of itself, novelty is no
mark of quality. Art can only be good or bad. If novelty were its most essential
criterion, then the art of the past could no longer mean anything to us.

Music's material is finite. The formal structural possibilities constantly remain subject
in principle to the same basic conditions, which are varied. From the point of view of
material, newness is limited. By way of anticipation it should be said that a constant
digging through mere material will not bring us any farther. In my view, however, the
changes in the spiritual and intellectual aspects are unlimitedly variable. In his book,
European Literature and the Latin Middle Ages, Ernst Robert Curtius indicates that in
literature, certain basic forms have periodically returned since antiquity, and are merely
varied and changed. That applies to the other arts as well. In our own day people often
seek out the absurd, in the hope that the chaotic conceals within itself possibilities for
new material, which reason is no longer capable of thinking up. People want to sail out
into unsounded depths, and hope for great new catches of fish. Inspired by Curtius,
Gustav Rene Hocke shows in his book, The World as Labyrinth, that there are two kinds
of experiential possibilities, and hence two different creative types: classical and anti-
classical. This polarity can be traced through all of cultural history. The classicist strives
for clarity, harmony, perspicuity, order, form. The anti-classicist seeks the enigmatical,
the mysterious, the disharmonious, the irregular, the formlessly rambling. In art history, anti-classicism has received the name “Mannerism” (which is not to be confused with manneredness!).

In the mannerist, vitality and intellect are immediately and directly combined: the balancing, equalizing forces are missing. His art is a mixture of over-heated expression and ice-cold calculation, or else the irrationally irregular is combined with absence of feeling; an art of the dark or seamy side which is also consciously anti-naturalistic. The classicist has an unbroken relationship to God, whereas the mannerist suffers from God. Hocke describes the difference this way: “The man with an unbroken natural instinct and without a split consciousness represents God as a shape or figure, as the most divine metaphor, in the pagan religions as well as in Christianity. The mannerist sees God as Will, as Strength, as a more or less abstract configuration of tensions and effects in nature. The basic drive of classicism is toward a personal essence, whereas the manneristic aims at a precipitous operation or a faceless activity. The classicist represents God in His essence, the mannerist God in His existence.”

On the higher levels both of these forms refer to the Absolute. The lower levels lack this reference and degenerate on the one hand into a completely temporal, superficial cult of beauty and functional, utilitarian optimism, flattening out into kitsch, and on the other hand into the unintelligible destructive and absurd. Both possibilities of experiencing and creating are mutually related, often enough in one and the same bosom. Great natures succeed in balancing them. Classical clearness gives form to mannerism, while mannerist precipitousness gives tension and depth to classicism, preserving it from stiffness. All the great figures in art are simultaneously classical and manneristic.

To absolutize these two fundamental attitudes one-sidedly would be a fateful mistake. Hocke notes that

After all, the manneristic high points of European intellectual history, in works by personalities subjectively shaken in the depths of their own existence, do not merely prove the high specific beauty and expressive power of great “anti-classical” works of art. They also frequently make accessible to us extraordinarily suggestive transcendental aspects, and in so doing they also point to special images of the Divinity, the ‘dark side’ of divinity, so to speak.

The task of the creative artist is to harmonize and to integrate these contradictory natural tendencies. Our problem today is that art, to a large extent, has fallen into complete disintegration; the Infernal is shining through. But the problem cannot be solved by simplistic opposition to all that is problematic and daring. Nor by accepting, in an opportunistic way, a certain development as “historically given,” just because it has been predominant for some time now (as I heard at the last CIMS congress). Now is the time to betake ourselves to the night side of modern art, there to tie up anew the torn threads and thus render re-integration possible. Therefore naive traditionalism is no alternative. Naive traditionalists are frightened and disturbed by whatever is daring, because it reveals the limitations of their own view. That is the “Philistine” at whom the romantics poked fun, who only grasps that which falls within the circle of his vision — or rather, within the square of his vision, for he can grasp only four-cornered objects. Testing modern theory and practice is like panning and sluicing for gold. Every last tiny particle cannot be integrated. The prerequisite for the success of this undertaking is a renewal in the Spirit, of which Psalm 50 says:
Create in me a new heart, O God:
And renew a right spirit within my bowels.
Cast me not away from thy face;
And take not thy holy spirit from me.

The subject which we must now treat, "Electronic Music and Worship," is an important part of this problematic area. The penetration of technology into art is simultaneously the penetration of inorganic principles into the stratified organism of the work of art. Not the least advantage of a technical appliance is the fact that it can be disassembled and in certain cases put together again in a different and yet meaningful way. If this principle be applied to art, then the organic nature of the work of art, the fact that it "grew" into a whole, would be called into question, because disassembling a work of art, and re-assembling it in another way, means destroying it.

Since the atomic bomb, everyone realizes that technology can bring not only blessings but also destruction. Confrontations concerning issues like environmental protection, atomic power plants and the like, show that viewpoints have changed. The feeling of discomfort with technological progress increases in proportion to the insight that technology is indeed able to make life easier, but cannot give life its meaning. The art historian, Hans Sedlmayr, deals with these problems in his book, Danger and Hope of the Technological Age. He defines today's technology as a technology of the inorganic, and says

Recognition of the fact that the center of emphasis for the human spirit has shifted to the sphere of the inorganic allows us — with reference to the total reality of the world — to perceive a disturbance in the condition of man. In accord with his very essence, man belongs to the sphere of organic nature and of the spiritual world. He has little or no part in the inorganic sphere, which is extra-human. To shift the emphasis of man's thinking, creating, working, and living into this zone is a cosmic disturbance. It is a disturbance in man's microcosmos, in that man now one-sidedly develops those abilities which are fitted to the peculiar nature of the inorganic world, while stunting the growth of those spiritual organs and potencies which correspond to the vital sphere and to the life of the spirit, such as vivid, organic, physiognomic and symbolic perception. Furthermore, this shift in emphasis is a disturbance in the macrocosmic relationships of this earth, by one-sidedly protecting and propagating the inorganic, which affects all areas of life, almost always at the expense of the organic. This leads to the "devastation" of life — of the earth and its waters, of the air, of the landscape — and the genuinely spiritual likewise suffers, since it is similarly "devastated." And finally, this shift of emphasis leads to man's fixation in a sphere unrelated to him — the inorganic sphere, through the denial of the reality of those higher types of existence.

Sedlmayr points out that the most varied but actually effective images of the world all assume that the world is constructed in levels or stages, which lead from the realm of inorganic nature through the kingdom of life into the empire of the spirit.

The essential element of perception (which is not yet common property) consists therefore in having realized that man's present condition in a technical and industrial age amounts to a serious disturbance, and that this disturbance is fundamentally cosmic and anthropic: only peripherally is it a disturbance in the social or cultural areas. The often-cited cultural malaise comes for the most part from the fact that the men of the "inorganic age" have displaced themselves in a lifeless environment that is
not appropriate or natural for them. Man cannot live well in a lifeless environment. As certainly as we recognize this, we also perceive that the step into the inorganic, which the technical and industrial age has taken, can never be taken back.

Sedlmayr's conclusion is that the bruising forward rush of the technical sciences into the realms of the inorganic is a challenge to the human spirit to develop itself in conformity with the reality of the world, and not in conformity with the industrial system. This is also the challenge for art.

From these general considerations, some conclusions can be drawn for our subject. Ancient aesthetics distinguished between somnis (meaning everything that "resounded" in some way), and vox (the voice animated by a soul). There are many intermediate forms, and various values which approximate to one or the other concept. Vox, insofar as sound is formed through man's direct and immediate cooperation, thus becomes the medium of his animate feeling. In the case of the string instruments, for example, it is the sensitive hand which forms the tone, in the case of the wind instruments the human breath. Even in the case of the keyboard instruments, the hand forms the attack, the touch. This is the whole purpose of the required technique. The history of instrumental music shows that the use and handling of instruments is derived primarily from vox.

Electronic sound, on the other hand, is pure sonnos, and indeed at its outermost limit, where sound can pass over into noise. The tone is formed in a completely inorganic way. This gives it the note of artificiality and, in spite of all the refinements, of the dull and denatured. One might opine that precisely this total elimination of the vox renders electronic sound especially suitable for the representation of objective or abstract structures, and hence it could theoretically be a medium for the spiritual. But spirituality does not mean lack of the organic element, but rather, filled with the spirit, it transcends and transforms the organic.

Electronic music intends to be art. The composer creates directly and immediately with the help of various generators. Magnetic tape irrevocably captures the definitive end product, as in works of the plastic arts. Reproduction takes place through loudspeakers. Interpretation does not take place here. This is a new situation. Whether it really includes hidden new possibilities can however be doubted on the basis of our experiences up until now. Electronic music originated in the meeting of electronic tone production and the principle of seriality, which is a technoid principle insofar as it recognizes only quantities and not qualities.

The first purely electronic compositions were catalogues of tone colours rather than compositions in the sense of sonorously structured time. After the first surprises and shock effects had worn off, these sound montages proved to be unsatisfying, and basically capable of little more than illustrative functions. Purely electronic music existed for only a short time. As serial technique lost its fascination, electronic music also atrophied. As absolute music, no single valid work of this type has succeeded. People soon began to include natural sources of sound by way of contrast. The human voice was subjected to technical processes, denatural, and included as a contrast. It is typical that the vox is deformed as much as possible into somnis. The early electronic works in this mixed technique have religious titles: Stockhausen's Song of the Three Young Men, for instance, or Krenek's Spiritus intelligentiae. sanctus. In my opinion, these religious titles arise not so much from a basic religious attitude as in the sense of a metaphysical reference or connection; the note of the demiurge is perceptible. Such works are rather the expression of a technical intelligence which sets itself up as absolute, which

PROBLEMS OF LITURGICAL MUSIC
disassembles organic things like the vox and re-assembles them in another way. This
tendency, and the rigid fixation, appear to contradict the essence of music. Hence there
emerged the opinion that electronics did not permit of anything genuinely musical,
 apart from the fact the many mixed forms combining sound and noise should really be
called “post-musical.” The original hope that one would arrive at completely new forms
and structures remained unfulfilled. Once again one is ultimately confronted with basic
archetypal forms of construction to which music, whose element is time, is in fact
bound.

In this technoid art there manifests itself the spirit of the man of today, which sets
itself up as absolute. But Stockhausen, for example, in the course of this later creative
efforts, turns to oriental meditation practices. The intentions can scarcely be called
Christian. The inner religious experiences of Christian mysticism bear a different
character. For all their strangeness, these oriental practices appeal to western man (who
feels he is autonomous) insofar as they contain a moment of self-redemption.
Stockhausen’s meditation pieces must be seen from this aspect. Abstracting from their
tendency, they are not useable in the liturgy, since they desire to be themselves musical
liturgy. In the directions for Stockhausen’s From the Seven Days we read: Play a vibration
in the rhythm of your bodily members. Play a vibration in the rhythm of your cells.
Play a vibration in the rhythm of your molecules. Play a vibration in the rhythm of
your atoms. Play a vibration in the rhythm of the smallest of your component parts to
which your inner ear can still reach. With this, we enter an uncontrollable area. Even
criticism is meaningless when Stockhausen says: “...whoever is not on our wavelength
will desperately discuss, analyze, talk, and talk: he also wants to have It and becomes
deranged, aggressive, destructive, when others simply do It and he cannot, even though
he is so-o-o-o intelligent.” That is plain enough. The whole episode belongs in a chapter
entitled “Art as Ersatz-Religion.”

But one should not simply dismiss all this as pure nonsense. These intentions play to a
side of man that can be fascinating. It is the reverse side of our benumbered,
computerized world, from which man tries to break out into the completely, totally
irrational. However, this irrational recognizes no personal God. Christian worship will
never be able to dispense with music in the sense of vox. It is the human being whose
response is demanded; even in the transferred sense of instrumental music. The action
of the human being dare not limit itself to pushing the button which activates
independent appliances. One does not completely replace the candles on the altar with
electric light bulbs; one still needs bread and wine for the Eucharist, and does not
replace them with synthetic nutrients. The (fixed) altar should as a rule be made of
natural living stone, and this “according to the symbolic meaning of an altar” (General
Instruction of the Roman Missal, no. 263).

Music for the liturgy should make use of those artistic means of expressions which
benefit man in the entire compass of his essence, that is, including his spiritual structure.
Neither pure vitalism, one-sided reference to emotions and feelings, nor undiluted
abstraction are adequate for this purpose. Novelty is not an absolute value, least of all a
novelty limited to the area of means. Novelty has value only when it opens up new
spiritual aspects which correspond with the essence of Christianity.

In the eastern Church the choir represents the chorus of singing angels. Music for the
liturgy should be an echo of this angelic music. In the ancient writings, the angels are
regarded as the “resounding ones” par excellence. Both Old and New Testaments report
on the singing of the angels. It is above all in the Apocalypse that the heavenly liturgy is
described. The four cherubim unceasingly chant the Trisagion, the twenty-four ancients sing the triumphal song, and after the judgment the singing of the angels resounds like thunder. St. Gregory Nazianzen asks, “Who of the faithful would doubt that precisely at the hour of the sacrifice the heavens open wide, and the choirs of angels are present? Then above and below are linked, heaven and earth, the visible and the invisible, become one.” In many variations, the Preface proclaims that we join in the eternal hymn of praise sung by the angels, and that we should sing the Thrice Holy.

What for our forebears was vividly obvious, has today become a faded and colorless notion for us. The angelic powers, the satanic; purgatory, paradise; these are views around which people willingly make wide detours in contemporary theology, because they are difficult to reconcile with the image of the world projected by the natural sciences. I am not so much concerned with theological discussions as with the meaning and reference of this image: *musica angelorum*. We are all happy to consider music for the liturgy solely from our purely human point of view, and to demand that it be only a mirror image of ourselves. In such a case it is well to reflect upon a point of view outside ourselves, and not to believe that our artistic problems are the highest value — they are artistic problems which often enough degenerate into a deliberate seeking of problems. Typical of this is a statement once uttered in our midst: our age is unfit for affirmation, all we are fit for is the *De profundis*. But in this obviously superficial sense, what age is fit for affirmation?

The angels chant the hymn of praise and speak of the “Lord of all powers and principalities,” of which they are themselves a part. Cardinal Newman thought that the angelic powers were the real causes of the laws of nature (*Apologia pro vita sua*). When physics and biology speak of spiritual principles which stand behind causality, that is not too far removed from Newman’s view, and replaces the Church’s symbolism with “working titles.” From this point of view, Johannes Kepler’s harmony of the spheres is likewise a concept which possesses a real value. Kepler showed that the planetary orbits correspond to musical laws. This train of thought was continued in our time, as harmonic research, by Hans Kayser, Max Caspar, and Rudolf Haase. In Haase’s brochure *The Measureable Unison* (Stuttgart, 1976) we read: “Harmonic research shows that in nature there exist musical laws, which form a network of analogies, and thus furnish the earthly world with a (horizontal) structuring; on the other hand there are in both past and present credible indications pointing to real though immaterial correspondences with our earthly world, so that we consider it possible that harmonic structures could also belong to this class of correspondences, which would then run vertically, so to speak, into a dimension inaccessible to our perception.” These conjectured vertical harmonic structures bear a conceptual relationship to the *musica angelorum* which is, for us, inaudible.

If it is true that music for the liturgy should be a reflection of the angelic music heard in visions, then such music will not be able to dispense with beauty. To the conscious cult of the ugly there is opposed a courage for beauty. Beauty, however, is not identical with limited appeal or ability to please. Beauty, as I understand it, knows how to maintain the balance between the abyss, and security in hopeful confidence. To that extent church music could become the opposite number to the precipitous “modern” if it renews itself in its spiritual roots, and does not waste itself in the merely external adaption of attitudes and artistic means which are foreign to its very essence.

The confrontation remains. Church music cannot be an untouched island of faith. By reason of its very essence, the aesthetic ideal of church music will never be able to
dispense with the “classical.” Regarding the opposite, anti-classical side, it is true that “Pride and willingness to gamble everything away, fashionable charlatanry, and impudent imitation must be overcome by a constantly alert confrontation with classicism, in other words not with the merely classicistic” (G. R. Hocke). One should, however, guard against becoming self-righteous. Hence the continuation of the quotation: “On the other hand, our classicists can save themselves from banality and rigidity only when they see in the countenance of their manneristic brother not merely the mark of Cain, but also that common reference to the Absolute.”

Beauty is also characterized by a certain hilaritas. This is something which music for the liturgy cannot renounce. Manneristic techniques have no term for it. Beauty possesses an inner order which is not, however, identical with organization. This limits the total application of manneristic techniques, since they are often based merely upon organization. Far be it from me to undervalue manneristic art works of high rank, but I wish to speak out quite plainly against any merely fashionable mimicry. Thus a prominent Austrian composer told me quite naively: “I am now composing a serial Mass” and added at once, “It will be tonal all the same.” A twelve-tone alibi, in other words. If complete panchromaticism is supposed to be the result, then one need not belabor the twelve-tone technique. That is either naive opportunism or pure hypocrisy, depending on how one looks at it.

And now a word about Gregorian chant. It was recommended as a standard, but most often only with a one-sided orientation. Chant is of antique-Asian origin, and possesses a great many manneristic irregularities which, however, were smoothed over or completely remodelled in a classicistic sense by western interpretation. People preferred only this classicistic side, which is why many compositions of recent times, which oriented themselves on it, remained trapped in a classicist weakness of expression. If chant was used in a different way, the cry arose at once: Not that way! Basically, it was not the chant itself, but a classicistic aesthetic derived from its interpretation, which was proposed as a model. One should really examine the chant much more closely, because in it heterogeneous elements have become a spiritual unity which allows greater range; to that extent, as a fundamental musical gesture of integration, it still represents a model for imitation.

In the Epistle to the Romans Paul says that the invisible is revealed in the visible, in other words that both are related to each other. To this we might add that the audible is similarly related to the inaudible. “Because that which is known of God is manifest in them. For God hath manifested it unto them. For the invisible things of him, from the creation of the world, are clearly seen, being understood by the things that are made; his eternal power also, and divinity.” Romano Guardini says that: “The world is more than mere ‘world’; each thing more than mere ‘thing’; and the human eye is more than a mere physio-psychological organ.” And we add: Music is more than mere music.

JOSEPH FRIEDRICH DOPPELBauer
WILLIAM MAWHOOD AND THE ENGLISH EMBASSY CHAPELS

Those seeking information concerning the organists and choirmasters of the eighteenth century embassy chapels in London's fashionable west end will find little rewarding in musical dictionaries. The condensed biographies give little more than the chapels in which they served and a brief mention of their sacred music. Historically, the most musically active chapels were the Sardinian, Bavarian, Portuguese, Spanish and Venetian which had a short period of glory, now forgotten. Knowledge of the services and music sung in these chapels is found in the generally unknown diary of William Mawhood. There are forty-nine small volumes dating from 1764 to 1790 which remained in manuscript for nearly two hundred years.

Interest in the diary followed William Grattan Flood's letter in the *Musical Times* of London mentioning Dr. Arne's Masses and a likely period as organist in the Sardinian chapel. To shed light on these years, William Barclay Squire, the musicologist, who had learned of the diary, contacted Mawhood's heirs who permitted him to copy the references to Dr. Arne. Squire published this information in the *Musical Times*, June 1910, as part of an article entitled "Dr. Arne's Masses.") Entries relating to Arne and those that follow in Mawhood's diary are interspersed by succinct and occasionally slightly longer references of Mawhood's dealings and friendship with the clergy of the chapels, the laity, and such better known musicians of the embassy chapels as Samuel Webbe, Stephen and George Paxton, John Danby, and Samuel Webbe, Jr. The diary was finally published in 1956 by the Catholic Records Society of London which omitted business transactions for practical reasons.

William Mawhood (1723-1797) was born in West Smithfield in London's east end nearby St. Bartholomew's Church where he was baptized. He was educated at the Jesuit college in St. Omer, France, a fact recalled by the motto *Ad maior cm Dei gloriam* heading some volumes of the diary. He continued his father's business as wool merchant and clothier, a part of his fortune coming from outfitting the soldiers under the command of his cousin, Charles Mawhood, and priests of the chapels. Although home was close to the center of his activities, he bought a country estate in east end Finchley, conveniently near London to attend chapel services and then entertain his friends in conversation and music-making. Among the first entries in the published edition are those, although brief, revealing his non-business activities of 1765:

- Sun. 6 Oct. Came to Prayers called at London House.
- Wed. 20 Nov. Came this day to town went to Madrigall and Thursday to the Crown and Anchor.
- Mon. 25 Nov. Sent to the St. Cecilia Feast at Mr. Squires the Bull Holborn.

The last reference concerns the annual concert in honor of St. Cecilia at the Sardinian chapel for the benefit of the poor. (The chapel was dedicated to St. Cecilia.) The Madrigal Society was founded in 1741. Mawhood serving as president, 1773-1775. London House and the Crown and Anchor were meeting places for the musicians and the Concerts of Ancient Music (1710-1792) held at the Crown and Anchor.

The eighteenth century gentleman was commonly expected to have an interest in music and to frequent current musical performances. Mawhood was no exception and though he held no official position as organist in any of the chapels, he substituted from time to time for them and in St. Omer, France, tried out several organs and played some
services. He was sufficiently wealthy to have purchased two organs (one bought in 1770 cost 10£), a harpsichord, and the newly introduced pianoforte. The instruments made musical evenings possible at home or in Finchley. The piano purchased in 1775 after a demonstration did not hold concert pitch so the brass strings were replaced by steel. It was disposed of in 1787. He highly prized these instruments and they were kept in tune and repaired by a Mr. Plenius or the prominent organ builder of the time, Mr. Blyfield.

Since government officials regarded the embassy chapels as extra-territorial property, they overlooked the attendance of English Catholics. The chapels offered a degree of safety and a lesser danger of being exposed by informers than the secret garrets or several London inns. Each chapel provided a safe place to harbor several priests serving the missions. Some of the clergy were musically inclined and entertained at Finchley. One, Roland Davies, a convert, pupil of Handel, and a composer of Masses, is said to have presided at the organ in Westminster Abbey during the coronation of George III. After his ordination in Douay, Davis returned to England and in 1785 served at the Bavarian chapel.

Mawhood records his attendance at services in veiled terms such as “prayers” (low Mass), “high prayers” (high Mass), “did the usual” (confession), and Sacra sanctum (Holy Communion) as well as vespers, compline and “tenebris.” (He sang a lesson at tenebrae in April 1776.) Mawhood also speaks of getting candles on Candelmas day. Although benediction was uncommon, Bishop Challoner is said to have given benediction every Sunday at “The Ship,” a famous London inn. Mawhood, however, mentions benediction only once, 1774.

Thomas Arne (1710-1778) composed his church music years after he had gained success in various forms of secular music including that for the theater. When William Barclay Squire asked Flood for details of Arne’s years at the Sardinian chapel, Flood replied that he had copied the passage from Charles Butler’s Mémoires. This is misleading, for Butler’s brief reference to Arne mentions only the Masses Arne wrote for the Sardinian chapel. Mawhood makes no such statement although he first visited Arne in February 1767, and after a performance of Arne’s Mass on Christmas day of the same year. Their friendship grew and Arne hoped with Mawhood’s influence to obtain a “protection” from the ambassador for his son, Michael.

In the early entries, Mawhood omits the names of the chapels attended but on Sunday, September 29, 1766, he says, “Came to Prayers at Lincoln’s Innfields” meaning the Sardinian chapel. The first mention of the Bavarian chapel is for “prayers,” Sunday, October 12, 1769. Of the three statements on Arne’s Masses in December 1767, it is hard to tell whether those of December 25 and 27 were sung at home or in the chapel, but the third is more specific, December 29: “Performed Dr. Arne’s Service at Church.” (The use of the word church is a surprise as the word “chapel” was more common at the time.) There are fourteen references to Arne’s Masses in the diary but the most significant are those for January 1, 1773, when the “old” service (the lost Mass for three voices in F) was sung, and January 3, 1773, when his “new” service was introduced (Mass in G for four voices). Charles Butler speaks of the three-voiced Mass as “exquisite; it is what all church music should be, solemn and simple, the melody slow and graceful.” As for the Mass in G, Butler says “It did not please.”

It was through Mawhood and his friends that Arne came to write his most remembered sacred composition. Mr. Pemberton, a dancing master, was employed by Mawhood to teach his children and when he died on January 13, 1770, Arne was asked...
to write a dirge for the memorial service. The five-part dirge was delivered to Mawhood on the nineteenth, rehearsed on the twentieth, and sung in the Sardinian chapel the next day. The dirge, a custom at the time (Mawhood mentions several) was not the full Requiem Mass but only the Libera. The title was taken from the first word, Dirige. The request illustrates the restriction imposed by the penal laws. No public funerals were permitted, and prayers at the graveside were those of the established church read by a Protestant clergyman. However, a Mass might be said privately at the chapel during the next few days.

Another issue raised by Flood's letter of April 1910, related to Arne's "conforming to the Church of England" and his deathbed retraction. Although Arne was raised a Catholic and attended the chapels, it appears he was lukewarm in practicing his religion. However, Mawhood mentions that Arne once accompanied him to The Ship for the Sunday sermon. At the time, Mawhood wrote the entry for December 6, 1777, stating that Arne had "conformed" and mentioned a will made "between Mrs. Arne and Michael." The conforming was a surprise to some and a severe shock to Webbe, a fact which Mawhood records in detail. On the other hand, Flood observes that since Catholics were forbidden to transfer property the "conforming" made the will legal. Painfully, Mawhood mentions Arne's death on March 5, 1778, and his burial at St. Paul's, Covent Garden. Flood mentions a Father Browne, senior chaplain at the Sardinian chapel, as administering the last sacraments and the joyous shout of "Hallelujah!" when the ceremony was ended. Joseph Gillow's biography of Arne gives a similar report but others have doubted Arne's conversion.

Mawhood showed continued interest in Arne's Masses and in 1769 paid a Mr. Aycott for a manuscript copy of the three-part Mass. In 1790, he gave a "Frenchman" (Mr. Bardeloe?) Arne's Masses and the dirge to be copied but later mentions payment for only one Mass. The dirge was not forgotten and at a memorial service honoring Arne it was sung again on May 1, 1930. The dirge like one of the Masses might have been lost if Vincent Novello had not given the manuscript to the British Museum.

Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians makes no mention of George Paxton (d. 1775), a friend of Mawhood and organist at the Sardinian chapel. George Paxton was the nephew of Stephen Paxton, a recognized composer and musician whose two Masses were frequently sung at the chapels. After September 1766, the diary cites many occasions when he attended the Sardinian chapel, possibly because of the splendor of its ceremonies. After vespers it was customary to go to The Ship, a short distance away, where Bishop Challoner gave the sermon since the government decided that English sermons were unnecessary at the Sardinian chapel. If a large number attended, some planks on the second floor could be removed so that those above could hear Bishop Challoner sitting in the center of the group below. George Paxton was a guest of Mawhood on several occasions and Mawhood substituted for him on a few Sundays. They "had words" on March 3, 1775, and Mawhood refused to substitute that day. Neither spoke to each other again until three weeks later when Mawhood returned Paxton's Book of Lessons. George Paxton composed Masses and motets and his vesper service was used at the Sardinian chapel in later years. He was succeeded by Samuel Webbe.

Without doubt the most influential musician of the embassy chapels was Samuel Webbe (1740-1816). Although as a youth he had to shift for himself, music was such a compelling force that he accepted a poorly paying job as music copyist that brought him in contact with Carl Barbandt, organist at the Bavarian chapel. Here a short digression is
necessary because of Barbandt's influence on Webbe. The Bavarian chapel dates to 1740, and Barbandt likely became organist there shortly after his arrival in London about 1750. In 1766, Barbandt privately published the *Catholic Hymns and Festivals throughout the year; taken out the public liturgy of the Church and set to music in a manner no less solemn than easy, and proper to promote the Divine Worship and excite the Devotion of the Faithful.* A critic speaks of the collection as "a little trivial French style... conformed to the chapel for which they were written." Barbandt's collection is said to contain the *Adeste fideles* and a popular *O salutaris.* Both are included in Benjamin Carr's Philadelphia collection of 1805. Mawhood attended services at the Bavarian chapel for the first time on October 12, 1769, and since he made no mention of Carl Barbandt, it is possible that Barbandt may have died some time after 1766. Biographers give no clue.

Samuel Webbe was fluent in Latin, French, and Italian, later adding German and Greek. He certainly lived up to his motto of never losing a minute. As a result of these accomplishments, Mawhood engaged him to teach his children and a long friendship developed, for Webbe was very frequently a guest at Finchley. Biographers are at a loss as to the date when Samuel Webbe became organist at the Sardinian chapel. Mawhood supplies the omission. His entry for October 25, 1775, records that Stephen Paxton came to announce that his nephew, George Paxton, had drowned after falling off a wharf near Blackfriars Bridge, either the previous night or in the early morning. Some tense moments followed. Webbe immediately applied for the position at the Sardinian chapel and was assured of it "if the Ambassador did not appoint another."

Webbe was invited to accompany Mawhood to France when Mawhood took his children to St. Omer for further education. These visits were a delight to Mawhood as he made new friendships. Contacts were closer after Webbe became organist at the Sardinian chapel and biographers intimate that Webbe became organist at the Portuguese chapel, holding both positions simultaneously. Mawhood aided Webbe in later difficulties especially during Webbe's illness and family troubles.

In 1793, Webbe, in gratitude for the musical instruction received by Carl Barbandt offered free instruction in sacred music on Friday evenings. The announcement was given greater publicity when it appeared in the *Laity's Directory* of 1793. This was especially helpful to young organists seeking knowledge of the liturgy needed to fill positions in the chapels opened during the last years of the century. Among those who applied were John Danby, Vincent Novello, Charles Dignum and Samuel Wesley. Both Novello and Dignum were choir boys at the Sardinian chapel and biographers intimate that Webbe became organist at the Portuguese chapel at sixteen. Dignum was a leading singer in the London theaters and Danby organist in the Spanish chapel.

The diary records many repetitions of Webbe's Masses and those of Stephen Paxton. (There are over thirty citations of Webbe's Masses.) Two others are referred to in the diary but they appear to have been sung infrequently. (Mawhood often leaves unmentioned the Mass sung when he attended the various chapels.) These were the so-called *Roman Service* and Abbe Pasquale Ricci's *Service for two voices in G minor.* Grove speaks of the Abbe as traveling about Europe seeking performances of his music. He came to England and Mawhood says his Mass was sung at the Bavarian chapel on February 2, 1776, and again on Christmas day 1784. The Mass was also sung in the Sardinian chapel on Christmas day, 1771.
The Roman Service, was possibly so called, as it may have been brought from Rome perhaps by some priest. (Mawhood mentions that Rev. Thomas Johnson brought music from Rome at a later date.) The Roman Service was rehearsed on December 24, 1769, sung on Christmas day in the Bavarian chapel and again in 1770, and also at the Sardinian chapel in 1771. The Mass appears to have had an especial appeal to Mawhood for it was sung at Finchley on December 12 and 17, 1784, with Samuel Webbe, Samuel Webbe, Jr., John Danby, Charles Dignum and a Mr. Dind.

A collection of Masses sung in the Sardinian chapel, published in 1792, contained those of Webbe, Stephen Paxton and Ricci. An edition published the preceding year by Skillern contained a Mass of Arne possibly omitted in 1792 because of his "conforming." Secrecy at the time prescribed the general knowledge of Arne's retraction. Webbe is also credited as the editor of the chapel music found in John Coghlan's An Essay on the Church Plainchant, 1782, and published under Webbe's name in 1792. English and American hymnals include such items from Webbe's Motets or Antiphons as the Adeste fideles, O filii et filiae, Stabat Mater and Tantum ergo. In evaluating the eighteenth century chapel choirs Charles Butler says, "unfortunately, the thinness of the catholic choirs, in these times, made them drop the counter-tenor and tenor parts and sing only the canto and bass. This entirely spoiled the beauty of the composition." The same approach is found in the first American collection of John Aitken, 1787.

In the 1770's, some government leaders who felt that Catholics had been subjected too long to unjust disabilities were instrumental in passing the Catholic Relief Act of 1778. The bill abolished the severest restrictions and penalties against Catholics, but the new freedom angered the Protestant bigots. In June of 1780, the opposition organized by Lord Gordon grew, and some 20,000 marched on the House of Commons demanding the repeal of the act. When denied, they answered by sacking and burning the Sardinian, Bavarian and Moorfields chapels. They first attacked the Sardinian chapel hoping to capture Bishop Challoner. In the turmoil Catholics fled the city and anticipating the horror, Mawhood hastily managed to send Bishop Challoner secretly to Finchley. The Mawhoods themselves were in danger, and expecting their home to be destroyed, sought refuge in the house of a neighbor. A few days later Bishop Challoner returned to London but the strain probably hastened his death the following year. James Archer, once an attendant at The Ship, attracted Bishop Challoner's attention and after studies in Douay was ordained to the priesthood. He became a special friend of Mawhood and after Bishop Challoner's death became a noted speaker at The Ship. Archer is reputed as the one who suggested that beer be placed on the table during the sermon as a subterfuge.

The Spanish chapel dates to 1742, and John Danby who had been substituting in the Portuguese and Bavarian chapels became organist there likely about 1784. Mawhood mentions substituting for him in 1786. The Spanish ambassador accepted as his own the new chapel built by Bishop Thomas Hussey which was blessed by Bishop James in 1788. On this occasion Mawhood "opened the organ." This custom was an honor and on several other occasions the privilege was repeated elsewhere. Danby's Masses and motets were sung in the chapel and his vespers service used in the Sardinian chapel. He suffered the loss of his limbs after sleeping in a damp bed and Grove notes that Danby died while his friends were participating in a concert arranged for his benefit.

After the Gordon riots the chapels were rebuilt and the Sardinian and Moorfields chapels enlarged at the request of the bishop to accommodate the increasing number of Catholics attending. When the Sardinian chapel was reopened in February, 1781, William Mawhood
Stephen Paxton's service was sung and a Mr. Dyets "opened the organ." A new London chapel, St. George-in-the-Fields, was built in Southwark and Mawhood was one of a committee assigned to take care of the organ. From entries in the diary it appears that the organ in the old Spanish chapel was repaired. Mawhood was frustrated with the slow progress and the problem of a platform for the organ. Several entries show his concern for the voicing and and the unclear sound of the diapason. He later remarks about a troublesome cipher which disturbed the service. Mawhood closed his diary in 1790 at a time when ill health lessened his activities. The last entries are a great contrast to the opening spirited ones of the 1760's. We are at a loss for details that came at the end of the century. Mawhood died in 1797.

While honoring Mawhood for rescuing Bishop Challoner, we should also remember the enlightening revelations of the chapel services and details concerning the lives of the organists. Mawhood saw only a glimmer of future religious freedom. Yet, from this once silent minority came the early nineteenth century Catholic revival that a few decades later blossomed into a "Second Spring."

J. VINCENT HIGGINSON

5. Gillow, Vol. IV: 143-144.
6. Diary: 11.
The Liturgist

A recent “definition” of a liturgist is worth repeating here: “A liturgist is an affliction sent by God so that those Christians who have never suffered for their faith may not be denied the opportunity to do so.”

The professional liturgist is a Johnny-come-lately, but the species is growing rapidly. A kind of ninety-day wonder, he or she has diplomas and degrees from schools that boast up-to-date theology departments with concentrations in liturgy. Qualified liturgists must have attended many workshops and often they have master’s degrees.

A liturgist is really a bureaucrat slightly camouflaged as a scholar with special concentration on matters of the early Church. He or she coordinates, facilitates, animates and generally orders around the people who unfortunately come within the job description. He or she decides on and issues the orders for the music to be used, but frequently has never trained a choir or played the organ (but possibly the guitar!). He or she determines the vestments to be worn and the banners to be displayed, although never put a stitch in any material. He or she schedules the lectors and the cantors and the ministers of various kinds, but does not read or sing or minister personally. The liturgist is a bureaucrat whose coordinating is full-time, and demands, of course, a full-time salary as recompense.

Worship, each issue eagerly awaited, is the Bible for the liturgist and Modern Liturgy, The Pastoral Musician and Contemporary Liturgy are the commentaries. Since the fads and experiments in liturgy keep changing so fast, it is difficult for liturgists to keep up to date without reading the book and its commentaries. Workshops also help, and the various companies that peddle the tools for the liturgist (hymnals, missalettes, banner designs, costumes, environmental furniture, etc.) keep their products before the market with their weekly and monthly publications. The liturgist is somewhat in the position of a theatrical entrepreneur who must keep informed on what is going on throughout the country so he can be in the forefront with his own operation. Developments in liturgical space arrangements, new experiments with non-sexist language, the dance, rearrangements of the sanctuary area and seating for the assembly, all the latest ideas on where to place the organ and the newest interpretation of what ministry means or will mean shortly — all such progress may have come to light since the liturgist’s own scholarly research on the third century was completed, or the current presentations of the nation-wide workshop series arrived on tape cassette, or even since the university degree in liturgy grew a little tarnished by the passing of time.

The liturgist in the parish determines the format for the liturgical celebration, what the music will be, even what the texts will be. He or she decides on the “theme” for the day and on the actions of the ministers, including the priest whose role is restricted carefully to presiding. The liturgist judges the quantity of wine to be used for Sunday Masses and how the lay distributors will proceed and what will be done with the excess. (Often the Precious Blood of Christ is poured into the sacarium, and the sacred vessels only doubtfully purified. Is there any wonder why the Holy See has forbidden the distribution of the Holy Eucharist under both species at Sunday Mass with large congregations?)

There is no doubt that in many places the office of liturgist has become an abuse and an intolerable infringement on the duties and rights of well-established positions in the liturgical life of a parish. The role of the liturgist with reference to the pastor, the other
priests or the people of the parish is not the concern of this commentary. What is its concern is the position of the church musician vis-à-vis the liturgist.

For a person who does not sing and who cannot play a musical instrument, who has never trained a choir or perhaps never even sung in one, who has no knowledge of music theory, music literature or music history, whose musical literacy is limited to the radio or phonograph — for such a person to move in and determine what will be sung and played, when the music will be prepared or the choir will meet, where the organ will be placed or the musicians located — such is an intolerable and unwarranted invasion and affront to the church musicians. Professional musicians should rise up, object and resist!

That is easily said, but when the organist or choirmaster does so, it is soon learned that persons of such competency and caliber are no longer needed in the parish liturgical program as it has been set up by the liturgy committee, chaired by the liturgist. Is there any wonder why we have witnessed such disintegration musically and liturgically in our churches? Is there any wonder why we have fallen to such levels? Connected closely with the whole liturgical “reform” is the dramatic fall in attendance at Mass on Sundays and holydays, a silent demonstration against the gross incompetence that has assumed control of the divine liturgy. Churches have been torn apart in the name of environment reform; the notion of “sacred” has been destroyed; incompetency in every area has been encouraged (note especially the banners, the vestments, the sacred vessels, the music!). Liturgy has become entertainment that has to be varied unceasingly; the profane and the banal are all many Catholics, especially children, have ever experienced in their worship of God. With all that has been discarded and destroyed in every art form in the past two decades, the activity of the Vandals in Spain and North Africa fade into nothing in comparison.

Could it be that this is what the fathers of the Second Vatican Council had in mind in giving the Church the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy? Hardly, if we accept the axiom that “by their fruits you shall know them.” The musicians have the specific command of the council fathers to “preserve and foster the treasury of sacred music.” But it has been an ever-increasing impossibility to do so in the face of the liturgists. Novelty, banality, incompetence, profanity and loss of the faith have become the marks of the new liturgy as it is promoted by the liturgists. But this is not what the Church through the documents of the council and those that followed from the Holy See after the council has ordered. Here lies the great conflict between church musician and liturgist: what did the council order? Will we implement the directives of the highest authority in the Church, or will we continue to promote individual and private options and opinions?

What is necessary to resolve this problem of musician vs liturgist? Two things must be considered. First, the properly trained church musician is a professional person and must be regarded as such with full recognition given to his expertise in his field. It is not the position of the liturgist to tell the musician how to pursue his profession, and that means how to select music, how to prepare the music and how to organize and use the musical forces concerned. Secondly, both musician and liturgist must be bound by the Roman liturgical books which indicate the solemnities and feasts, the texts to be used and the ceremonies to be performed. Experiment has ceased by Roman decree. It is now our task to implement the liturgy given us in the official books of the Roman Catholic Church. Cooperation between liturgist and musician is assured when both begin from the same sources. Disagreement begins only when one or the other is more concerned
with creating novelty than with the worship of God according to the directives set out for all in the Roman books and decrees.

An old adage states that "good fences make good neighbors." Well defined limits to the activity of the liturgists may assure the continuance of such an office. The musician must be "off-limits" to the sphere assigned to the liturgist. Cooperation yes; domination no! Within certain determined areas the services of a liturgist may be of value to a parish, but the liturgist must not be the factotum.

R.J.S.

Freedom At Last

A federal appeals court in Washington, D.C., ruled on November 10, 1981, that church organizations are not immune from antitrust laws. The ruling was given in reply to a case involving the American bishops and booksellers who wished to bring into the United States an Irish edition of the Liturgy of the Hours. The bishops' office of liturgy refused to admit the books for sale and went to court to enforce their decision that only their translation could be distributed in this country.

The court states that "while the freedom to believe is absolute, civil law has always been recognized to have some right to impose restrictions on the freedom to act in pursuit of religious beliefs. Thus, neither religious free exercise nor social antitrust interests are totally free from a balancing process" between religious freedom and competition in the marketplace. It must be determined whether the action of the bishops in restricting the sale of the Irish edition is "legitimately geared to the Church's protection of its liturgy rather than its survival in the marketplace of religious books."

In my opinion it is the latter that provoked the restriction imposed on the Irish edition. It is the same policy that restricts Americans to the ICEL translations of the liturgical books for Mass, even when better translations are readily available. The bishops committee on the liturgy is recipient of substantial sums that are extracted from all publishers who wish to use those translations (and only those translations are allowed to be used) for missalettes or hymnals. The issue revolves around the dollar sign.

When the rash of new liturgical books hit this country just after the promulgation of the liturgical changes, I said that it would be wise to designate the Holy Father's missions as recipients for all profits gained by publishers from the new liturgical books. First, it would have limited the avalanche of printed volumes considerably; second, the problem of ICEL and its monopoly would never have occurred.

The Vatican Council is supposed to have given us a new freedom. Now at last we have a spark of some little liberty, coming through the action of a civil court. Is it to a civil court that the sons of God must turn for their promised freedom that has been so woefully restricted in the name of pluralism and liberalism?

R.J.S.
REVIEW

Choral


Ten Christmas pieces make up this book of 46 pages. While the melodies are familiar, the arrangements are new, offering several settings for each carol along with various instrumental parts for flute, trumpet, glockenspiel, organ and guitar. The choral arrangements vary from unison to four voice. For the price this is a useful and interesting addition to a choir's Christmas repertory.

Prayer to the Child Jesus by John Seagard. SATB, a cappella. Augsburg Publishing House. $.60.

Polyphonic in texture with some interesting rhythmic patterns, this piece can be very effective if the proper forces are available. The bass line runs very low, and the possibility of a low E for most groups is out of the question as is a high B for the sopranos. Some rearrangement is able to be made, of course.


Chordal and simple in structure, this short carol is gentle and soft, hardly ever rising above a piano. Interest lies in the harmony which has considerable dissonance with frequent seconds and sevenths. Rhythm, range and tessitura are all easy.

The Angels' Song by Eugene Englert. SATB, organ. Augsburg Publishing House. $.60.

The text is by John Cawood (1775-1852). A pleasant melody is treated to a variety of settings for unison, duet and four-part, but interest is achieved by key shifts with moves from G major to B flat to F and A flat and a return to G. Harmonies are somewhat dissonant, but the voice leading makes them easily achieved. The accompaniment is independent.


This is a Polish carol delicately set for two voices with an easy but interesting accompaniment. Harmonies are traditional and the text poetic and rhymed. There are no demands on the singers but a very rewarding effect can be achieved with a minimum of effort.


A well-known German carol with a text by Theodore Baker has been pleasantly set with traditional harmonies and suggestions for double choir effects. Variations with treble and bass voices which divide into three-part writing add contrast in a standard carol. This is part of a series of arrangements by Pelz of standard Christmas pieces which include The First Noel, What Child is This?, Silent Night, God Rest You Merry Gentlemen, Away in a Manager, O Come, O Come, Emmanuel and A Child is Born. All are SATB arrangements; some incorporate instruments; all have a variety of vocal writing.


Traditional harmonies usually in choral style with a slight hint of canon make this fourteenth century German carol a useful piece. It is not difficult in any way, and probably can be found in similar arrangements by the dozen.


A very familiar tune (Potsdam) in a setting by J.S. Bach with a text by Horatius Bonar makes this publication a useful piece for nearly any occasion. The text is not found in the liturgy, but is pious and very personal. The writing and voice leading cause no problems.

Shepherd Thy People by Joseph Roff. SATB, organ. Volkwein Bros. $.45.

The text is from Micah 7:14, 18, and can be used for most occasions. Harmonies are mostly conventional with some little chromatic alteration. Voice leading is good, although the bass line occasionally is rather low for an average group. This could be a good introduction of a choir to more contemporary writing.

All This is Christmas by Joseph Roff. SATB, organ. Willis Music Co. $.60.

With a text by Edward F. Donohoe, this might be a piece for a Christmas concert and is preferably accompanied by a piano because of many non-organistic patterns. The accompaniment is not easy because of chromaticism, arpeggios and octaves. Seconds and sevenths bring some dissonance into the vocal lines, but most of the contemporary idiom is to be found in a totally independent accompaniment. The piece is not easy but will be rewarding.
Matthew, John and Mark and Luke by Harrison Oxley. SATB, a cappella. Alexander Broude, Inc. $0.75.
A delightful, quasi-medieval carol with a text by Peter Vincent, this little piece employs fourths and fifths against a melody line which produce an ancient effect, moving from a unison intonation to a full, forte statement of “fiddle and drum beat out sin.” It is not difficult and will be a pleasing and welcome change from the usual Christmas carol style.

This Song is Best! by Ian Kellam. SATB, organ. Alexander Broude, Inc. $1.20.
A medieval text is set in a contemporary idiom that is demanding on both the vocalists and instrumentalist, but when adequately prepared with proper forces can be a most interesting Christmas piece. The chromaticism and some little rhythmic problems are the most serious obstacles, but a reasonably good group that reads with some proficiency will be able to learn and perform this work. A college group might well find it worthwhile.

Three unison Christmas carols make up this publication: O Little One Sweet, When the Herds were Watching and Sweet was the Song. Aside from the singable melody line, interest lies chiefly in the keyboard accompaniment. These can prove useful to a group of unison singers who are seeking something new.

This cradle song begins simply with traditional tonality and a unison statement of the melody which moves into two voices and finally four-part writing as the rhythmic patterns and the harmonies become more complex. It is probably too difficult for an average parish choir, but for a college ensemble it can be worth the study.

Jest, Son of God most High by Gerald E. Brown. SA, organ. Alexander Broude, Inc. $0.70.
Writing for two equal voices and a solid accompaniment is a most welcome form, particularly for convents or for male choirs. This little piece has some interesting uses of consecutive fifth and octaves and some contemporary sounds in the organ part.

Jesn, Son of God most High by Gerald E. Brown. SA, organ. Alexander Broude, Inc. $0.70.
Writing for two equal voices and a solid accompaniment is a most welcome form, particularly for convents or for male choirs. This little piece has some interesting uses of consecutive fifth and octaves and some contemporary sounds in the organ part.

Seven minutes in duration, this is not a liturgical text and could rather have been called a cantata than a sequence. It has three movements, each of which consists of a carol prefaced by a recitative, which may be omitted, leaving the carols as separate pieces. Voice leading is good for the most part, an important element in an a cappella composition. The writing treats the voices independently with an exchange of polyphonic and homophonic sections as well as a variety of voice combinations. For a good group, this could be a major composition on a Christmas program.

A Lovely Lady Thus Did Sing by Barry Ferguson. Treble voices, a cappella. Alexander Broude, Inc. $0.70.
An interesting concept, this is a dialogue between the Blessed Virgin and the Christ Child, the words being taken from a fifteenth century Bodleian manuscript. The possibilities for performance are many, but one could consider a fine soprano in the role of the Blessed Virgin with elementary school children singing the words of the Christ Child. A duet is possible between soloists or between sections of the choir. A charming piece, it brings something both new and old.

Come Rejoicing by Paul Drayton. SATB, organ. Alexander Broude, Inc. $1.20.
A difficult composition because of the chromaticism and voice leading, this can be a challenge to a first-rate choir as well as the accompaniment. The text is from the eleventh century. An optional arrangement for double chorus presentation may be employed with a semichorus of sopranos and altos placed in a gallery. This work was written for the Guildford Choral Society.

Sound the Trumpet! Praise Him! by Franz Joseph Haydn, arr. by Hal Hopson. SATB, organ, brass quartet (opt.). Alexander Broude, Inc. $0.70.
The St. Anthony chorale of Haydn with a harmonization of Johannes Brahms is the basis of this fine processional or recessional composition. To be sung with majestic vigor, it can be most effective without great difficulty, since the harmony and choral writing are very traditional. It can give a festive spirit to any great occasion.
Sound the Trumpet by Henry Purcell, arr. by Walter Ehret. SAT or SATB or SAA or SA, organ. Elkan-Vogel, Inc. $0.55.

Another festival piece in an eighteenth century idiom, this piece requires a clarity of diction and intonation so the independent lines are distinctly proclaimed. Runs and trills demand precision but the reward is found in a very beautiful sound. Two texts are given, one secular and one sacred.

Help Us, Jesus Christ, God's Son by Heinrich Schütz, arr. by Walter Ehret. SATB, a cappella. Theodore Presser Co. $0.55.

Both German and English texts are given in this Lenten motet that would adorn any program of church or concert performance. The beautiful polyphonic writing interprets the penitential text and offers no problems for singing. Schütz should be a part of the repertory of every serious group.

Praise and Thanks to Thee by Henrich Schütz, arr. by Elwood Coggin. SATB, a cappella. Theodore Presser Co. $0.55.

Another motet by Schütz with a text that fits most occasions, this is a useful work and not difficult but very rewarding in its sound and movement. It is only two minutes in length, but it can develop the best discipline and good choral techniques in a group that is serious about its repertory and performance.


A very frequently used text dating from the nineteenth century, this arrangement adds some interest to this popular piece. With treble and bass voices contrasting each other, and with organ and optional trumpets, the piece can be a fine recessional or processional. Four verses of the hymn are given various treatments.

R.J.S.

Lord of Life: Peloquin's Liturgy for the "Year of the Family" (G.I.A. Publications, Inc., 1981; G-2402-FS, full score; G-2402, vocal/organ score.

For the Year of the Child, Alexander Peloquin was commissioned to write a children's liturgy entitled Unless You Become: this reviewer was privileged to conduct the premiere performances at the National Shrine of Our Lady of the Snows in Belleville, Illinois. Terence Cardinal Cooke commissioned Peloquin's latest large work, Lord of Life, to celebrate the Year of the Family (1980), and the composer conducted the first performance at St. Patrick's Cathedral on October 5 of that year. Peloquin provides music for every response and every function in the Eucharistic liturgy. The exuberantly festive work calls for SATB choir and congregation, flute, two trumpets, two horns, two trombones, double bass, harp, percussion and organ. Cello is also included for the meditation after communion.

Lord of Life is a cyclic work; the various pieces that form the whole share thematic relationships. To excerpt this or that "piece" in the manner of a pastiche of various favorite Mass movements is not to let the full power of this work be experienced. This is not, to be sure, humble Gebrauchsmusik, but the composer remains practical and realistic even amidst complexity. Other commentators have noted how deeply Peloquin's music is wed to ritual. Although some of his large-scale works have been "staged" as theater or concert pieces, they function best at the liturgical celebrations for which they were intended.

There are thirteen settings in Lord of Life. The texts, other than biblical or liturgical texts, come from two well-known chorales (Lobe den Herren and Nun danket), a hymn of Fred Kaan, and a prayer of St. Augustine.

Verse-refrain forms predominate, as befits a work that is both exciting for the musicians who perform it and highly involving for the congregation which is led from one familiar or seemingly familiar melody to another. The subtlety of Peloquin's achievement is that the worshiper must constantly sense that he has heard this or that tune before and is drawn into participation because of that very sense of compelling recognition.

Peloquin has won both praise and condemnation for his experimentation with the placement of the Gloria in the Mass. He effectively positioned the Gloria at the end of his Lyric Liturgy and at the beginning of Unless You Become. The Gloria is returned to its usual place in Lord of Life.

The infectious Latin American rhythm of the offertory song with dance, "People Matter," underscores Peloquin's only direct sermon in this work. Church and street come together. It is a song (words by Fred Kaan) of "the modern city" and "its nameless people" where "Christ is present," indeed "is ev'ry man." The final affirmation of the text is, "People matter, people count!" Predecessors in Peloquin's catalogue of works which include dance are, most obviously, the sacred dance from Lyric Liturgy and the offertory song and dance from his previous complete liturgy, Unless You Become.
Following is a charting of the various pieces from *Lord of Life* and the basic melodic material that is utilized in each. The offertory and the communion ("A Simple Command") alone employ material that is not familiar or is not shared with other sections of the work.

1. Processional: "Praise to the Lord" chorale melody
2. Gloria: original melody, *Resonet in Laudibus* and tetrachord theme
3. Responsorial psalm: *Adoro te devote*
4. Gospel acclamation: "Praise to the Lord" and *Adoro te devote*
5. Offertory: original
6. Holy: *Adoro te devote* and tetrachord theme
7. Memorial acclamation: Gloria melody
8. Great Amen: Gloria melody
9. Lord’s prayer: Gloria melody
10. Rite of peace: Gloria melody
11. Simple command: original
12. Meditation: original melody and part of *Adoro te devote*
13. "Now Thank We" chorale melody

Peloquin’s setting of "Now Thank We All Our God," to be sung "with rejoicing," is a vigorous highpoint. The three familiar verses, all in F major, are complete here, with instrumental introductions and interludes, and the second verse finds the choir singing the chorale tune to a Samba beat with a dancy countermelody in trumpet which must certainly have been written by St. Vitus himself.

*Lord of Life* is definitely the work of an experienced musical artist of catholic taste who has spent most of his life in the service of God’s people. Here Peloquin finds inspiration anew in the liturgical texts and in ten centuries of music alike. It should once more be underscored that the strength of such a work can only be appreciated and lived when it accompanies ritual and when it is incorporated in its entirety. There is a world of compelling variety for soul, mind and body in this work, and we are indeed a special people to be so profoundly identified in music. We are not, in the words of the offertory song, God’s "nameless people." We find our name clearly written in *Lord of Life.

ROBERT J. HUTCHESON, JR.

**Books**


This is more than a bibliography. The volume also includes several essays on various aspects of male choral groups ranging from one on the male choral music of Franz Liszt to the method of learning a song according to the barbershop method. With such a variety of content, perhaps the title “handbook for male choruses” would have been more descriptive.

Both religious and secular compositions are included. Works rearranged for male voices are also listed. Because the male choral group was so popular during the nineteenth century and because of the richness of the repertory from the composers of the romantic era, one finds many such items listed, particularly in German. Information for purchasing music is adequate with publishers addresses provided. (Is World Library still in Cincinnati?)

With the diastrophic condition of music in seminaries today, a work such as this will find little use in what was once a flourishing field of male choral activity. But for anyone who is fortunate enough to have a group of men dedicated to singing, either for liturgical or concert purposes, this volume can be the source of much information and many an hour can profitably be spent studying its pages, both the bibliography and the essays. It is certainly useful.

Dr. Tortolano is a frequent contributor to *Sacred Music*. He is chairman of the music department of Saint Michael’s College in Vermont and music director at the cathedral in Burlington.

R.J.S.

**Instrumental**


These eight chorales from the Little Organ Book cover the liturgical year from Advent through Christmas and Easter and the remainder of the seasons. The choral are: *Nun Komm’, der Heiden Heiland; Heut’ triumphiert Gottes Sohn; Christe, du Lamm Gottes; Christ lag in Todesbanden; Jesus Christus, unser Heiland; Liebster Jesu, wir sind hier; Jesu meine Freude; and In der ist Freude*. A brass ensemble can produce a wonderfully spiritual sound and be a real source of uplift and inspiration as well as a powerful means of decorating a feast with something special. When well played, these choral can be effective liturgical music, joined to the hymns of the congregation and the part-singing of the choir. This set is part of a larger series of brass ensemble music under the editorship of Jean-Pierre Mathez, most of which is secular in scope.

R.J.S.
Magazines

BOLLETTINO CECILIANO. Anno 76, No. 6-7, June-July 1981.

An article discusses the question of a national hymnal for Italy. Various books of hymns for certain areas of the country have appeared in the last ten years, but now the bishops’ conference has ordered a national edition that has been published by the Carrara firm in Bergamo. It contains music for the ordinary parts of the Mass, for the various feasts of the liturgical year, and songs in honor of the Blessed Virgin and the Holy Eucharist. There are 192 pages, and it sells for about $1.50. Also in this issue is an advertisement for a new Liber usualis in Italian of some 666 pages, costing about eight dollars, and another book of 926 pages comprising the liturgy of the hours with original music by twenty-two contemporary authors, which sells for fifteen dollars.

An article commemorating the twenty-fifth anniversary of the death of Lorenzo Perosi deals with his love for his mother, but especially for his heavenly Mother whom he praised in music. News of Italian musical events and some reviews complete the issue.

BOLLETTINO CECILIANO. Anno 76, No. 10, October 1981.

Under the presidency of Bishop Antonio Mistrorigo, who is the director of the Italian Association of St. Cecilia, many activities are planned for the group to promote the music of the Church. The association has just celebrated its centenary of founding and looks forward to its next one hundred years. The magazine, Bollottino Cecilian, is the organ of the society. Ernesto Papinutti contributes an article on how to accompany the Pater noster. Helmut Hucke says it should not be accompanied, but other musicologists say it might be. Since it is Gregorian chant, it is part of the whole discussion about accompanying chant and the very nature of Gregorian melodies. Further, there still remains a prohibition against using the organ with the Pater noster or the preface. So the author concludes that the question of accompaniment might be solved by saying placet juxta medium, which could be translated as “Yes, maybe.” But he seems to lean toward “yes” because he provides the notes with which to do it!

Aldo Bartocci has an article on Justine Bayard Ward, whose method for teaching Gregorian chant has spread all over the world from its beginnings in this country, and whose generosity contributed greatly to the promotion of church music here and abroad. News of various Italian musical events as well as an account of the Twelfth European Congress of Gregorian Chant, held September 3-6 in Gorizia, fill out the issue.

R.J.S.

COMMUNAUTES ET LITURGIES. Number 4, 1981.

During the calendar year 1981, this Belgian French language journal has been exploring various aspects of the liturgy. The topics treated are: silence, gestures, the rhythms of the liturgy, space, music, and the life of the senses in the liturgy. This issue which is devoted to liturgical space contains several articles dealing with the relationship between worship and church architecture. In “The God of Churches,” Jean-Yves Quellec discusses the relationship between our way of thinking of God and the style and decoration of our church. He notes for example that a table altar reminds us of Christ in the Eucharist whereas an altar that resembles a massive tomb implies a different sense of God. After remarking that there is often a gulf between contemporary religious ideas and certain churches constructed in a different period, the author raises the question of how to get out of that situation and asks the reader to find the answer by reflecting on his discussion of the subject.

In “Several Reflections on the Construction of Liturgical Spaces,” Frederick Debuyst criticizes the contemporary trend to create a church which is primarily secular and functional, resembling a lecture hall or a theater rather than a sacred space. He says that the proper liturgical space should convey a Christian holiness which is a holiness of communion. In designing a church special attention should be paid to the entrance which should provide an ambiance of reflection and preparation. Light is a very important quality of the interior. It can be used to divide the church into a number of areas that can be illuminated according to their function. The sanctuary is at the heart of the church building, but, according to Debuyst, all too often in modern churches there is no focus in the arrangement of that area, so that the pulpit, altar and celebrant’s chair compete for attention and neutralize each other. According to Debuyst the three most important considerations in a church are intimacy, community and an opening to the world. The Church of St. John the Evangelist in Hopkins, Minnesota (a suburb of Minneapolis), is cited as an excellent example of a modern church. In particular the author appreciates its large narthex which unites the church and the school, parish hall and offices. The interior of the church is successfully divided into zones; a place for community worship and a chapel for private prayer as well as the baptistry. The author finds the
arrangement of the sanctuary very successful. (Reviewer’s note: One wonders if the author of this article has actually seen and attended Mass in this church. What is good in theory has some drawbacks in practice.) Debuyst concludes his article by saying: "In this context space is the place and image of the communion of persons." In an ideal building, "the house of the church invites the faithful to renounce the dispersion of indefinite exterior space and find their interior unity."

In a more general article on liturgical space, Paul Roland, who is associated with the world of the theater and the arts, provides some thoughts with which to conclude this review. He says: "What must be absolutely forbidden in our churches is ugliness. We should not continue to permit it as apparently we do at present... Currently when literary and artistic creation is discussed, it is often noted that we are passing through a wasteland. But is not this because man has nothing to say? And if he has nothing to say, isn’t it because he has no one to talk to? Without a reference to something that is beyond this world, man would not be able to live."

While providing material for thought and study, the articles in this issue do not give us answers to the problem of contemporary church architecture. They do point out, however, how our opinions are colored by our philosophical orientations and our experience, and how the same abstract words (sacred space, etc.) can be used to mean very different things in their three-dimensional realization.

Records


Organ, brass, strings and woodwinds combine a wide variety of ways on this very exciting and delightful recording of music from several different composers. Paul Manz is featured at the keyboards of the Schlicker organ at Mount Olive Lutheran Church in Minneapolis. It should be remembered that Dr. Manz himself collaborated with Herman L. Schlicker on the design of that organ, and it is obvious from this disc that he knows the instrument thoroughly.

This digital recording contains eleven selections, and all of them serve to demonstrate once again the use of the organ as an ensemble instrument. There is a generous sampling of works by J.S. Bach, including Break Forth, O Beauteous Morning Light and Sinfonia (both from the Christmas Oratorio), In Dulci Jubilo, Nun Komm, der Heiden Heiland, and Awake, Thou Wintry Earth (from the cantata Praised Be the Lord). Other pieces to be found are two festival or church sonatas by W.A. Mozart, How Lovely Shines The Morning Star by Manz, Harald Rohlig’s A Little Shepherd Music, Arcangelo Corelli’s Pastorale, and In Dulci Jubilo by Michael Praetorius.

From beginning to end, this is one of the most thoroughly enjoyable organ records I have heard. The quality and clarity of the digital recording, the musical sensitivity and balance of the instrumentalists, and the colorful organ registration make the entire album sparkle with glory.

Of particular interest on this magnificent record, however, are the two Sonatas by Mozart (K 144 in D major, and K 224 in F major), and A Little Shepherd Music by Rohlig. The Mozart sonatas include all the non-essential repeats often left out in other recordings. This makes the sonatas doubly enjoyable.

The work by Rohlig is, quite simply, thrilling. It is a little three-movement piece for woodwind and organ, and it truly gives the organ an opportunity to display its silvery tone and its power.

MARY GORMLEY

OPEN FORUM

Lines from Pebble Creek: Gregorian Chant Re-Visited

One of the great losses in what is still dubbed the liturgical "renewal" has been the near total disappearance of any sense of the propria, the proper parts of the Mass. There is not much sense talking about an unfolding drama unless you have a staging area, and setting the stage was precisely the function of the old propers. Bland translations aside (and the offertories down the drain altogether), they are rarely now even recited, and their numerous options drift off into a dreary sameness. They were, of course, ineluctably bound up with Gregorian chant. That is not to say that they had to be — there are vast stores of other settings — or that those responsible for keeping erstwhile liturgical law had elicited anything like a universal awareness of their importance. But early attempts to preserve the very notion of them, such as Omer Westendorf’s notable Summit Series, appear to have frittered away in the onslaught of the likes of J. Paluch & Co.

One hopes that it is an issue which might still be addressed, even in my little church astride Pebble Valley, Nebraska. That will have to wait for another chapter, however, for the immediate prodding to these considerations comes from a thirty-hour credit course
Marier's at Catholic University. Our experiences seem
year of Our Lord 1981, I believe, and that was Ted
Marier's at Catholic University. Our experiences seem
to have been much the same.) It was the occasion of
some raised eyebrows and jollity among my confrères.
Not having been involved with chant at that level for
something over a decade, I was understandably
timorous about my re-entry. “Oh there's nothing to
worry about,” consoled a friend, “you'll likely have a
group of hard-working nuns.”

Well, there were no nuns, hard-working or
otherwise. Duquesne, which from its noble height
above downtown Pittsburgh is at a level with the
towering U.S. Steel landmark, is one of a handful of
American Catholic institutions of what used to be
called “higher learning” which offer a degree in sacred
music. The program is headed by Anne Labounsky
Steele, a prominent American disciple of Jean Langlais
who is currently recording his complete organ works
for Musical Heritage.

Anne, whose roots are Russian Orthodox, is a
confirmed Lutheran (ALC), mightily concerned with
the task of building — and protecting — musical
propriety and professionalism in the Church's liturgy.
Her Catholic students need quite a bit of protection. I
do not know what uses of subversity she employed to
register some seventeen or eighteen students in last
summer's course in Gregorian chant. But I can tell you
that they were not just the ordinary brand of summer
credit-hunters. They were looking, instead, for their
liturgical and musical roots. The dozen or so who
studied for credit were about evenly divided between
graduates and undergraduates, and all were
professional musicians with church and/or teaching
connections. There were four Roman Catholics, one
Polish National Catholic, a Jewish music librarian, and
an assortment of Lutherans, Presbyterians and
Methodists. So, as Arthur Reilly used to say, “you can
see where the Church is getting off at.”

There was, in the group, no trace of a simple,
nostalgic hankering for what was. As a matter of fact,
only one or the other Roman Catholic had had any
Gregorian experience at all. So that my notion of
exploring the riches of the literature was somewhat
stayed by basic excursions into the rudiments of
notation, solfège, and even the not terribly important
matter of modal analysis. But we were able to touch the
chiefs bases of the church year — read and sing them,
and that alone was enough to bring forth expressions of
disbelief that such fortune should ever have been
squandered, and to send organ majors back to works
they had long been playing without understanding
them. Along the way we managed to dust off Peter
Wagner, Willi Apel, Dom Anselm Hughes, Igino
Angles, and, of course, Pothier and Mocquereau.

The National Library in Ottawa has been kind
enough to send me several manuscript samples of
Healy Willan's Englished Gregorian propers (he did the
entire Roman Gradual), and we did some minimal
experimenting of our own, most honorably. I think,
with parts of Mass No. 9, *Cum Jubilo*. Maurice Duruflé
(though he did some marvelous experimenting of his
own with Mass No. 9) and Johannes Overath would
probably not have approved, but I do not know why
the question should continue to be moot. Dom Ermin
Vitry held — nearly 30 years ago, at the time of the
Assisi conference — that if Gregorian was to be spared
a second and final death, it would have to be, in a
measure, in the vernacular. We have lost nearly half
those years, and the chant is not so slowly and surely
vanishing — amid occasional amateurish emasculations
of its substance and daily canting everywhere of the
glorious Holy Saturday *Alleluia*, which was meant to
come but once a year, like the first thunder after
winter.

The Duquesne session was closed with a dry run of
the new Roman Mass, with chants selected in proper
order; and, at the students' request, a prayerful singing
of Englished Gregorian vespers in the university chapel.
With an eye — or an ear — to that Holy Saturday
*Alleluia*, I asked Mrs. Steele to recess the session with
Langlais' *Incantation for a Holy Day*, which she delivered
admirably. For my part I tried to make it plain that
there was no dry run or play-acting about my priestly
blessing.

Though New York is out of season in August, I could
not resist a quick look-see, being that near. (“Near!” a
Gotham friend exclaimed, “Pittsburgh is the far-west of
my life!”) The mostly Mozart affair at Lincoln Center
was also mostly sold-out, and about the only thing I
managed to hear was the highly touted new production
of the *Pirates of Penzance*. It was everything they say
about it, though the male lead could just as well have
been sung by one of the Everly Brothers, and the
amplification was so powerful as to sock one several
rows back. I hadn't known that Broadway had taken a
cue from the church.

That night, thinking it might help me get to sleep, I
stole up to the Capuchin Fathers' house-library and
borrowed a couple issues of the journal of the National
Association of Pastoral Musicians (NAPM). (Jim Welch
has taken to calling that organization “NAPALM”
because of the manner in which it defoliates all musical value.) Well, the magazine did everything but induce sleep. I have not encountered gibberish the like of it, from Weakland to Funk, outside the domain of Master Social Workers. Father Funk has recently excoriated the editor of The American Organist for having the gall to reprint an article from Sacred Music, the which he, in any case, had patently mis-read. And a couple of years ago, someone writing in Milwaukee's Gemsbom referred to Sacred Music as "that tired old journal."

Age and ennui are displayed in various ways, and one of them is a loss of interest in genuine challenge and an intolerance of quality. I think that no body in the world, save the American Roman Church, for whose worship music is supposedly important, would have so readily taken to its bosom Joe Wise, Ray Repp, and the St. Louis Jesuits, interlopers who could certainly not cut it on the open market. For that matter, it must be cause for some chagrin for Fathers Gelineau and Deiss to know that they will never make IBM's TV commercials. Sacred Music is certainly old, and for all I know, it may be tired. But that is not our problem. Our problem is that we have been talking to ourselves. I take some surcease, some hope even, in my summer's experience with the young, the unspoiled, the serious folk at Duquesne.

Monsignor Francis P. Schmitt

NEWS

The Catholic University of America gave Jean Langlais an honorary degree of doctor of music at a September convocation marking the dedication of a new Schudi tracker organ in St. Vincent's Chapel. He was cited as "one of the preeminent organist-composers of the twentieth century." During the assembly members of the university faculty played some of his compositions, including Poèmes Evangéliques: La Nativité, Hymne Song in memory of Jehan Alain and Prélude Grégorien, which was composed especially for the occasion. He himself then played several works and improvised on the Salve Regina. The new organ has twenty-nine ranks and three manuals with mechanical action.

Paul Manz was honored by a special service of thanksgiving observing his fortieth year of service and his thirty-fifth year as organist at Mount Olive Church in Minneapolis, Minnesota. Both the morning service and a vespers service were dedicated to him. Music included organ works by Flor Peeters with whom Manz studied together with many of his own compositions both for organ and for choir, including Praise the Lord for He is Good, Let Us ever Walk with Jesus and Ev So, Lord Jesus, Quickly Come. His son, Pastor John Manz, visiting choirs from Central Lutheran Church and the Westwood Choristers, took part in the occasion.

The Saint Cecilia Chorale of Marksville, Louisiana, under the direction of Merkle Dupuy sang a concert of sacred works at the historic Saint Mary's Cathedral in Natchez, Mississippi, October 25, 1981. Mrs. Lewis Roy is organist. The choir continues to sing frequently at various churches in Ayoyelles Parish from which the members are drawn.

Saint Paul's Cathedral Choir of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, performed a program of sacred and secular compositions under the direction of Paul Koch at Synod Hall, May 15, 1981. Among the works sung were Terra tremuit by Vincent Goller, Laus in pace, Max Fikles in me gratia, Cum Sancto Spiritus by Vivaldi and Salve Mater by Oswald Jaeggi. On Thanksgiving Day, 1981, the choir sang Mass in Rome at the Basilica of Saint Paul-outside-the-walls. Other stops on the European trip were in Florence, Assisi and Venice. Accompanists for the group are Hugh Young and Kay Koch.

The Franciscan Sisters of Rochester, Minnesota, have installed a new organ in their motherhouse at Assisi Heights. The instrument is a thirty-five rank E.M. Skinner organ formerly housed in the auditorium of Saint Mary's Hospital in Rochester with some additions. The dedication concert was played by Robert E. Scoggin, October 4, 1981. Music of every period of composition was played to show the various resources of the organ.

The Van Daalen Organ Co. of Minneapolis, Minnesota, has installed a seventeen stop mechanical action organ in the Church of Saint Patrick, Edina, Minnesota. The dedication of the new instrument was made on December 13, 1981. A hymn festival under the direction of Paul Manz with readings from the advent season formed part of the occasion. Choirs from Christ Presbyterian Church, Calvary Lutheran and St. Alban's Episcopal Church took part. Father Ambrose J. Mahon is pastor. Ita Vellek is organist and choir director at Saint Patrick's.
The John Biggs Consort presented a program of music of all centuries at the San Fernando Mission in California, sponsored by the Da Camera Society of Saint Mary's College as part of the Chamber Music in Historic Sites series. Composers represented were Dufay, Buxtehude, Morales, Monteverdi, Schütz, Hassler, Hermann Schroeder and John Biggs. Performers were Eileen O'Hern, Lou Robbins, Salli Terri, Paul Brian, Gary McKercher, John Biggs, Jennifer Biggs and Adrienne Biggs.

Noel Goemanne conducted the Dallas Catholic Choir and the choir of the Church of Christ the King in a celebration of the patronal feast of the parish, November 22, 1981, at the Church of Christ the King in Dallas, Texas. The combined group sang Goemanne's *Missa Internationalis* and his *Fanfare for Festivals*, works that the Dallas Catholic Choir sang on its recent Canadian tour.

At Christ's Church, Baltimore, Maryland, Philip Manwell, organist and choir director, presented Orlando di Lasso's *Missa pro defunctis* for All Souls Day. Other music used recently for the liturgy includes *Schubert's Mass in G* and *Palestrina's Missa brevis*.

The Second Choral Festival for the Feast of Christ the King was held at St. Thomas More Church, Munster, Indiana, November 22, 1981. In addition to performances by the individual choirs, the combined groups sang *A Festival Psalm* by Butler, *Psalm 150* by Franck, *Like a Father* by Cherubini, *Sound the Trumpet* by Purcell, *Kyrie* by Lassus and several Gregorian chant settings. Participating choirs were St. Thomas More, directed by Terrence Clark; St. Joseph's at Dyer, directed by Joseph Rehling; St. Maria Goretti in Dyer, directed by Richard Johnson; Holy Name in Cedar Lake, directed by Anne Zimmerman; and St. Michael in Schererville, directed by Sylvia Muller. Terrence Clark organized and directed the festival, and Sister Beatrice Flahaven, O.S.B., was organist.

Father Dennis M. Bonsignore planned the music for his ordination to the holy priesthood and his first solemn Masses, at the Church of Our Lady of Lourdes in Elmira, New York, and the Church of the Holy Apostles in Rochester, New York, May 23, 24 and 30, 1981. In addition to Gregorian chant, music included M.L. Nemmers' *Missa in honor of St. Mechtild*, Palestrina's *O Bone Jesu*, *O Sacrum Convivium* by Remondi and *Panis Angelicus* by Franck at the celebration in Elmira. In Rochester, among other compositions, the

*Missa "Laudate Dominum"* by Lasso and *Missa brevis* by Palestrina were heard, together with *Ave Maria* and *Jesu dulcis memoria* by Victoria. Choirs participating in the celebrations were those from Old St. Mary's Church in Rochester, under the direction of Thomas Donohue, and Our Lady of Lourdes in Elmira, directed by Paul Holland. Mary Montanarella was organist.

As part of the centennial observance of Sacred Heart Parish, Saint Paul, Minnesota, a sacred concert was presented on November 1, 1981. Traditional hymns sung in German as well as music for the Latin high Mass made up the program. Included were *Gloria* from *Missa Secunda* by Hassler, *Sanctus* from *Messe solennelle* by Gounod, Mozart's *Jubilate Deo* and *Ave verum Corpus* and Purcell's *Hallelujah*. Robert Kaiser was organist and choirmaster, assisted by the Minneapolis Brass Quartet and percussionists.

A program of compositions spanning ten centuries was presented at the Cathedral of St. Vibiana in Los Angeles, California, February 22, 1981, to commemorate the bicentennial of the city, Pueblo del Río Nuestra Senora la Reina de Los Angeles de Porciúncula. Anne Marie Biggs, soprano, and Jelil Romano, organist, performed works by Richard Keys Biggs, Jacopo Peri, Jean Philippe Rameau, J.S. Bach, Francis Hopkinson, Franz Schubert, Louis Vierne, Charles Ives, Mario Castelnuovo-Tedesco, E.W. Korngold, Rayner Brown, Flor Peeters and Norman dello Joio.

A concert honoring the memory of Pietro Yon and commemorating the tenth anniversary of the Twin Cities Schola Cantorum was held in the Cathedral of Saint Paul, Saint Paul, Minnesota, November 22, 1981. Among the compositions of Yon that were programmed were his *Requiem Mass*, his *Missa Eucharistica*, commissioned for the Ninth National Eucharistic Congress held in Saint Paul in 1941, an *Ave Maria* and *Christ Triumphant*. In addition to the male Schola Cantorum, the Cathedral Choir, the choir of Our Lady of the Lake, Mound, Minnesota, and singers from several other groups joined for the occasion. Mary Downey, who had been organist for Yon while he was active in church music in New York City, played his *Hymn of Glory* and the second movement of his *Concerto for Organ*. Soloists for the occasion were Daniel Dunne, James Scheu and Sue Doran Herber. Richard D. Byrne and Rudy Gruenwald were directors; Richard Burg, organist; and John Kaeder organized the occasion.

The Holy Father has appointed Monsignor Johannes Overath as new president of the Pontifical Institute of Sacred Music in Rome and has elevated him to the rank of a protonotary apostolic. A priest of the Archdiocese of Cologne in Germany, Monsignor Overath is president of the Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae and editor of the federation's journal Musicae Sacrae Ministerium. He succeeds Monsignor Ferdinand Haberl of Regensburg as head of the papal music school.

R.J.S.

CONTRIBUTORS

J. Vincent Higginson was editor of The Catholic Choirmaster until it joined with Caccia to become Sacred Music in 1963. He is an authority on hymns, author of several books, a composer, a papal knight and a frequent contributor to these pages.

Joseph Friedrich Doppelbauer is an Austrian composer and teacher active in the Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae (CIMS). His music was important among the works commissioned for the Sixth International Church Music Congress in Salzburg in 1974.

Stephen Morgan Wanvig, whose drawing of Ely cathedral adorns the cover of this issue of Sacred Music, is a free lance artist living in Minneapolis, Minnesota. He is a graduate of the University of Minnesota.

EDITORIAL NOTES

About the Pictures

The small city of Ely is located in eastern England north of Cambridge in a region formerly called the Isle of Ely, eel island, because of the eels found in the river there. This area of marshland was once crossable only by fen-slodgers who knew the firm paths. It was perhaps for that reason that Hereward the Wake, "the last of the English," was able to hold out until 1071 against the Norman invaders when they finally devised a sort of pontoon road to reach him. The present cathedral of the Most Holy Trinity was begun a few years later in 1083 by Abbot Simeon on the site of the Benedictine abbey founded in 673 by St. Ethelreda (or Audrey), queen of Northumbria.

The nave of the cathedral, in the late Norman style, is one of the finest romanesque structures in England. The cathedral is well-known for the beautiful wooden lantern which completes the octagon tower over the central crossing. It was constructed in 1322 by Alan de Walsingham after the original central tower fell. They say it is the only gothic dome in existence, a structural achievement, and that all of England was searched to find oaks of sufficient size for the corner posts.

V.A.S.

Back Issues of Sacred Music

Over the years many significant articles have appeared in the pages of Sacred Music. The magazine is now in its 108th volume, making it the oldest music magazine in continuous publication in the United States. During those years it has recorded many events and reflected many of the problems that have beset the Church and its liturgy. Sacred Music is the successor of two previously published journals: The Catholic Choirmaster, which ceased with the completion of its fiftieth volume, and Caccia, whose numbering was maintained in Sacred Music.

We have extra copies of most of the issues of Sacred Music from 1965 onward. Interesting articles in those issues that we suggest you reread are these:

- "Pope Paul on Sacred Music." Vol. 96, No. 2.
- "The Subject is Worship — An Evaluation of the Present" by John Buchanan. Vol. 96, No. 3.
- "Sacred Music since the Council" by Johannes Overath. Vol. 99, No. 3.
- "Thoughts in These Days" by John Buchanan. Vol. 100, No. 1.
"The Decline of the Sacred" by James Hitchcock. Vol. 100, No. 4.


"Mass versus populum Re-examined" by Klaus Gamber. Vol. 101, No. 4.

"Gregorian Chant as a Fundamentum of Western Musical Culture" by William Peter Mahrt. Vol. 102, No. 1.


"The Musical Shape of the Liturgy" by William Peter Mahrt. Vol. 102, No. 3; Vol. 103, No. 2; Vol. 104, No. 4.


"Viennese Classical Masses: Sacred or Secular?" by Richard M. Hogan. Vol. 103, No. 2.

"Resacralization" by Deryck Hanshall, S.J. Vol. 103, No. 4.


"Massversus populum Re-examined" by Klaus Gamber. Vol. 101, No. 4.

"What is Celebration" by Peter J. Thomas. Vol. 105, No. 2.


"Mass versus populum Re-examined" by Klaus Gamber. Vol. 101, No. 4.

These articles answer so many questions that are continually asked. Often the editors of Sacred Music receive questions from all parts of the country. The answers are usually found in articles already published. May we suggest these articles to you. Write for the back copies.

A charge of $3 per issue is asked.

R.J.S.