The Holy Eucharist

At the very center of the priest's life is the Holy Eucharist. His greatest privilege is to celebrate the Mass. His gravest obligation is to guard the Blessed Sacrament in his parish church. His truest consolation is to bring the Viaticum to his dying parishioners. His highest achievement is to instruct the children to believe that under the appearance of bread and wine the very Body and Blood of Jesus Christ is present and waiting for them to adore It and receive It. No one comes closer to the Eucharistic presence of Jesus than the priest. It is the reason for his life.

If the priest is first in nearness to our Eucharistic Lord, the organist and choirmaster must be second. Truly that role revolves about the Blessed Sacrament as does the life of the priest. Through song and the organ, the musician comes, even daily, into the house of God to adorn the Holy Sacrifice. His presence is necessary for the solemn liturgy which requires music as an integral part of its being. He spends long hours in the church, God's house, practicing and preparing for the liturgical actions. It may be only putting music scores in order, or arranging the chairs for the singers, or cleaning the choir loft and the music cabinets, or selecting and organizing the music to be used in the next few weeks. But these things are done in God's house, in His very presence. They bring one close to Him and His life which is lived on in the Church and its members. What a prayer such activity can be in the silence and beauty of God's temple.

Often musicians complain that in the press of performance, whether singing, playing or directing, they have little time or thought for prayer. They must do their work, keep the choir functioning, keep the organ performing. How can there be a deep, contemplative prayer with such activity and such distractions? There probably cannot be right then, although every action one does is indeed a prayer. Saint Paul reminds us that all we do is prayer, because Christ lives in us. But in the quiet of the church when the musician is practicing and preparing, then it is possible to have those moments of contemplation. We can offer to God all that we are, all that we have, all that we will be doing when next we make our contribution to the Eucharistic liturgy as organist, choirmaster or singer.

During Mass, at the moment of the consecration and elevation, one can offer oneself and all that we are doing. We can offer our art, our performance, our struggles and even our mistakes and seeming failures. It is a brief moment of silence, but it can contain a lifetime of effort and an eternity of love that every Catholic church musician should have for the Eucharist and the God that It is.

Sometimes non-musicians think that organists and choirmasters are concerned only with the excellence of their performance. They are indeed concerned that it be the best possible, for only the best can be offered to God. But it is the performance that is offered along with the performer—all that I am, all that I have, all that I am doing. One is reminded of the medieval tale of Our Lady’s juggler, the little monk who had nothing to give to the Blessed Virgin but his talent as a dancer. He danced for her in the silence of the abbey church at midnight, and was rewarded by the brilliant illumination of the abbey church, the sweet smile of Our Lady, and the assurance that his prayer was most acceptable, even though he did not grasp the height or depth of the contemplative action that he was so innocently doing.

If Jesus loves the priest and rewards him with the privileges of such close association with Him in the Eucharist, how much does He also love the musician who comes second, who adorns the Eucharistic actions with great beauty, who spends long hours in His presence, who leads others, both in the choir and in the congregation, to
adoration, thanksgiving and deep prayer through music.

Music is a mystery, a sharing in the angelic activity of heaven, a foretaste of eternity, the language of the angels, the saints and the elect. As church musicians we use music here in this world, and have the hope and the assurance that we shall continue that sharing in God's creation throughout our lives, when we come some day into that kingdom where the hosts of heaven sing an everlasting Sanctus, Sanctus, Sanctus.

Truly, the Holy Eucharist is the center of our lives, the joy of our music, the hope of eternity, and the reason for all we do, think, speak and are. O Sacrament most holy, O Sacrament divine, all praise and all thanksgiving be every moment Thine!  

R.J.S.

Translations

Since the Second Vatican Council granted the privilege of the vernacular languages for use in worship, including the solemn sung Mass and office, musicians have been struggling with the texts provided by those in charge of translations. The problems have been enormous and often the musicians have questioned the degree of cooperation given them by those preparing our English versions. The theological and biblical accuracy of texts is not the primary concern of the musician; he is quite willing to accept what proper authority gives him. He does have a concern, however, for the beauty of the language, its mode of expression, the position of the vowels and consonants, and the felicity of sound of the words themselves. The words of sacred scripture have traditionally been hailed as the model of our English tongue, especially in such versions as the King James and the Rheims-Douay. Merely to have those sacred words read aloud caused in the listener sentiments of worship, dignity and beauty. Our English language comes close to Italian in the sheer grace of its sounds and the elegance of its phrases. Music created to adorn beautiful English texts ranks among the treasures of the musical art, inspired to a large degree by the textual excellence. One need only mention the works of Handel, Mendelsohn, Purcell and many others.

Recently announcement has been made that still another translation of the liturgical texts will be imposed on the English-speaking world. This is being organized through ICEL (International Commission for English in the Liturgy). A new translation will, of course, sell more books and make money for publishers!

But it will also be a means for promoting the position of the feminists and their "non-sexist" language. It will allow for incorporating more theological and biblical variations, considerable confusion in what we believe and even errors in matters of faith. It will cause wonderment, unhappiness and even harm among the lay people. For the man in the pew, revision of the text of the "Our Father" will upset a prayer he has known since his babyhood. He will struggle with changes in the Nicene Creed. The role of the priest will be challenged and the concept of the Mass as the sacrifice offered by the priest will be weakened. God as our heavenly Father, Jesus Christ as true God and true Man, will be obscured by substitutions to eliminate "sexist" words. Above all, the notion that our English liturgical books are accurate translations of the Latin originals falls when translations have become paraphrases, interpretations and even newly composed texts and rituals. If we are to remain Roman Catholics, then we must have Roman books, accurately translated, true in doctrine and correctly stated.

But what about the singer and the composer? In addition to the difficulties encountered by all Catholics, he has his own problems caused by new translations. Musical repertory is developed only over a long period. Constant changes, aside from their theological and cultural impact, cause numerous problems musically.
The need in ritual actions for steady, repeated and well-known procedures is accepted fact. Changes are difficult and not always easily accepted. This is true of hymn texts and liturgical responses. It is true of the words of the Mass, now already very familiar to the people. Think of resistance that changing the words of the “Our Father” will bring on. The same dilemma confronts the choir when it has one translation of a text in one setting and another in a second setting of the same text. Composers who have worked to provide proper musical treatment for vowel sounds or emphasis for important words find their efforts destroyed by a shift in texts, resulting in vocal and expressional blunders that make performance difficult and even unintelligent.

These continued text changes are an insult to the musician who is asked to set them to music. It is tantamount to saying that his artistic, creative work is not considered of any lasting importance since it is changed or set aside frequently; his efforts to combine sacred words with sacred sound are lightly cast aside each time a new translation is adopted. We have arrived at an age that considers the sacred texts, even of the scriptures, and the melodies connected to them as mere “throw-away” items. This is not a cause for surprise when the very notion of the “sacred” has been abandoned by the liturgists and their co-operators, the translators. The liturgy becomes a field for propaganda for every new theological or cultural fad.

As composers we should object to what is being done to our musical art. As performers, as congregational participants, as Catholics who have a right to our heritage and traditions, we should vehemently oppose the tampering with our sacred texts. We should demand true translations of the Roman liturgical books, beauty and dignity of the English, sound theology, the clear expression of our faith in our prayers (lex orandi est lex credendi), and absence of the latest political innovations, particularly those promoted by the radical feminists and their non-sexist language campaign.

R.J.S.

New Music

The amount of new sacred music for choral ensembles that is published each month in this country is truly large, the product of many composers and many publishing houses. Much of it is sent to Sacred Music for review.

The pieces range from a cappella arrangements of renaissance polyphony to contemporary settings, some serious and some belonging to the entertainment type. They are, for the most part, what are called “general anthems.” These are musical settings of texts that can be sung with equal ease by Catholics, Protestants and Jews, even perhaps by Hindus and Mohammedans. This, of course, is a great asset for the publishers who are looking for the widest possible market.

But what has become of Catholic liturgical music? Who is writing for the official texts of our liturgy? When have you last seen a setting of a text of the proper parts of the Mass for Sundays and feast days? I am sure you have not seen a new setting of the ordinary parts of the Mass. There are, indeed, Catholics today who do not even know what the term, “ordinary of the Mass,” signifies. It is useless to ask if you have seen a new setting of the ordinary in Latin.

In adopting the “general anthem” we have abandoned the treasure of the liturgical year. With such general texts, many not even from the scriptures, we have made Pentecost and Christmas, Easter and Corpus Christi, all to be alike, since we have set aside the particular and special texts of those days. The four hymns do the same thing. In abandoning the liturgical year, so beautifully contained in the texts of the proper of the Mass and the hours, we set aside the life of Christ which is found in those texts. We cease to be Catholic. We have lost our heritage.

R.J.S.
Columbus and Mozart

Is there any connection between Christopher and Wolfgang?

It may be a little hard to see at first, but Monsignor Rudolf Pohl, president of the Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae, in his preface to the current issue of Musicae Sacrae Ministerium (Anno XXVIII, No. 1 & 2, 1991, p. 8-10), says there is indeed a connection.

The world is observing with spectacular festivities the fifth centenary of the discovery of America and the evangelization of the new-found western hemisphere, the phenomenal activity that Columbus set in motion in 1492. The carrying of European civilization and Christianity to the new world and subsequent establishment of ecclesiastical and civil structures across two continents remain events of history equal to the spread of Christianity itself through Europe and the Mediterranean world in the early centuries following Christ. Columbus brought the Americas into the orbit of European and Catholic life and culture. He began an influence that continues to this day. As Hilaire Belloc said, “Europe is the Faith, and the Faith is Europe.”

As the centuries advanced, not just the music of renaissance Spain and Italy made its way across the Atlantic. In due time, the sacred music of Mozart came too. And not just Mozart, but all that the period surrounding his genius embraced. It was a Catholic music, rooted in the baroque expression of the times, and European in its origins, but truly capable of assimilation into the transplanted cultures developing in the new world.

There are today, unfortunately, liturgists who do not know or understand the church music of Mozart. They wrongly wish it to be used only in sacred concerts, in spite of the clear directives of the Second Vatican Council: “the treasure of church music is to be preserved and cultivated with the greatest of care” (Sarcrosanctum concilium, Art. 114). This is not meant to refer to concerts; the fathers of the council were dealing with religion, not with cultural or strictly musical matters. They put Gregorian chant in prime place in worship, but they say that polyphony should by no means be excluded (Art. 116). Instruments are recognized as necessary prerequisites for much sacred music and are allowed (Art. 120).

Mozart is indigenous music for those countries in which European culture has been established. The Church is concerned (Art. 119) for the use of the music that is a part of the culture of peoples. Monsignor Pohl says, “the liturgical church music of Mozart can only be positively perceived in the light of the II Vatican Council.” The bishops of Austria in the synodal resolution of the Archdiocese of Vienna in 1970 stated this very clearly. Mozart’s Masses are useable and appropriate for the liturgy of this post-conciliar period. Pohl says further, “as long as music can be vividly perceived, it remains contemporary music. It is precisely our own era that forces the question, ‘what is more contemporary than Mozart?’”

The close of the Mozart year, 1991, and the celebration of this Columbian year, 1992, have a connection. Columbus brought the Faith to these shores; that meant the celebration of the Latin liturgy; and in time Mozart and the music of his period came to adorn our worship. It is unfortunate that our liturgists today do not know this and continue to try to relegate the treasury of sacred music to the concert halls when it belongs in our liturgy as an expression of our indigenous culture brought to these shores by Columbus.

R.J.S.

FROM THE EDITORS
A CENTURY AND A HALF OF MUSIC AT ST. PAUL'S CATHEDRAL

In 90 years, since the turn of the century (1900-1989), St. Paul's Cathedral in Pittsburgh has had only three organists/choirmasters: Joseph Otten (born in Holland) for 27 years; Rev. Carlo Rossini (born in Italy) for 23 years; and Paul Koch (born in Pittsburgh) for 40 years. Perhaps such a record is testimony not so much to the material remuneration involved as to the extraordinary and abiding devotion of the musicians to labor selflessly in the vineyard of the Lord. However, in the first fifty-seven years of the cathedral (1843-1900), there were eight or ten organists/choirmasters. With several of them are associated some remarkable facts that stand out in the history of American music.

The first organist at St. Paul's Cathedral was Henry Kleber. He had come to St. Paul's Church about 1840 (it became a cathedral in 1843). The organ “was a small one...placed not on the gallery over the main entrance, but in a small organ loft in the right transept” (A.A.Lambing). Fire destroyed the building in 1851. Kleber remained until the early 1850's, when in 1853, he became organist at the Third Presbyterian Church.

Kleber, born in Germany in 1816 (died in Allegheny, 1897), came to Pittsburgh-Allegheny about 1831 as a boy of 15, and almost at once became an enormous force in the musical life of this fast-growing city. As early as 1838, he organized the Pittsburgh Kleber Band, probably the first band west of the Alleghenies, which was to become famous and, under various directors, the foremost band in western Pennsylvania. Later, in 1861, the band was to march in a body to the Civil War. In 1846, the Kleber Music Store was founded, a flourishing business for many, many years. Kleber was also one of the founders of the Frohsinn Society, one of the finest of many singing societies in the area and which soon gained national prominence. In a recent concert brochure (Pittsburgh, 1991) we find a thumb-nail announcement:

Meet Henry Kleber, Pittsburgh's "musical establishment" for half a century...the peripatetic musician who...composed schottisches and polkas that were national best-sellers; acted as a conductor, pianist, tenor soloist, and impresario; and made news headlines by horsewhipping a music critic.

In September 1852, the Pittsburgh Gazette wrote that Kleber had “acquired an enviable reputation as a composer.” He published some 180 compositions. For many years he was associated with Stephen Collins Foster as a close collaborator and Foster's principal teacher. Indeed, Foster dedicated the piano work Village Bells Polka to Kleber, and the latter in turn dedicated his Spirit Polka to Foster. When Foster died in 1864, it was Kleber who played the organ, sang a solo (from Handel's oratorio Joseph and His Brethren) and was in charge of the music at his funeral in Trinity Episcopal Church.

At the dedication of the new cathedral in June 1855, still at the corner of Fifth and Grant, Mozart's Twelfth Mass was sung for the first time in Pittsburgh. John T. Wamelink, the new organist, was at the organ, and Henry Kleber led the choir. Wamelink (b.1826) was a native of Holland and had come to Pittsburgh about 1852. Like Kleber, he became a strong force in music almost at once, teaching piano and voice. One of the most active members of the Pittsburgh Philharmonic Society, whose aim was the cultivation and rendition of oratorio and operatic music, he was one of its conductors and also accompanist for a time. In March 1854, Wamelink conducted Handel's Messiah (Part I), the first performance in Pittsburgh.
In 1848, fire struck Trinity Episcopal Church in downtown Pittsburgh. However, the organ (built by the firm Henry Erben of New York) was not greatly damaged. In 1852, it was sold to the Jardine Organ Co. ("traded in" for $500 payment on Trinity's new Jardine organ). They in turn sold the organ to St. Paul's Cathedral, where it was used first in the basement, and upon completion of the building (1855) was moved upstairs (Mellor Scrapbook). When in 1866, the cathedral installed a large new organ, the Erben organ was sold to St. Bridget's Church. Alas, after being taken to St. Bridget's, and stored there before being set up, the organ was totally destroyed in that church's fire in 1871.

On June 11, 1866, the new organ was inaugurated in the cathedral with a sacred concert "under the supervision of Professor Wamelink with the justly celebrated American organist, George W. Morgan of New York, being invited to preside at the key desk" (Pittsburgh Catholic, June 9, 1866). The organ was built by the prominent American firm of George Jardine & Son and comprised three manuals and 45 stops. It had 3,000 pipes, was "pumped by hand," and cost $7,500. The Catholic reports further that "the keys or manuals overhang. This is the latest clavial fashion. The radiation of the pedal keys...is also a new feature...The organ will be, we understand, the third in size in the United States, and decidedly the largest west of the Allegheny Mountains."

In 1864, Wamelink established, with his brother-in-law, a thriving music and piano store on St. Clair (Sixth) Street, under the name Wamelink and Barr. Wamelink left the cathedral in 1868 when he moved his music firm to Cleveland, and became organist and choirmaster at St. John's Cathedral there in 1870. He remained in Cleveland until his death in 1900. A footnote: when the new St. John's Cathedral in Cleveland was dedicated in 1948, the beautiful bronze and gold tabernacle was presented by Theodore Lenihan as a memorial to his grandfather, "the prominent Cleveland musician and organist at the cathedral, John T. Wamelink."

Two organists, John H. Schenuit and A. Frauenheim, respectively, held the post of organist at the cathedral in the years between 1868-1871. In the spring of 1868, there was a concert in the cathedral under Schenuit which included selections from oratorios with organ and orchestra. Schenuit's name is found later as a double bass player in the Pittsburgh Symphony Society at the program of the May musical festival in the old Exposition Building in 1879. Frauenheim was a member of the prominent early-Pittsburgh family who were founders of the Iron City Brewing Company and great benefactors of St. Augustine Church in Lawrenceville. He left his post at the cathedral because of ill health, and in 1872 took up the position of organist at St. Augustine Church.

Horace Wadham Nicholl (b. near Birmingham, England, in 1848) came to Pittsburgh in 1871, at the urging of an American friend, from Stoke-on-Trent and became organist at the cathedral. He remained in the post some four or five years until he became organist at the Third Presbyterian Church. (Early records tell us that, in 1868, the Third Church "had the finest organ in the city.") He also taught organ at the Pittsburgh Female College.

A descendant of the founder of Wadham College, Oxford, Nicholl lived and studied in Germany a long time. He soon became very well known in America as performer, composer and music authority. His name is to be found in many of our music encyclopedias. Accounts tell us that on many occasions, the cathedral was not large enough to accommodate the crowds who came to hear him play. In 1878, after seven years in Pittsburgh, Nicholl moved to New York where he maintained his reputation as organist, composer, teacher and editor. He died there in 1922.

Nicholl, it seems, was much flattered that people referred to him as a "19th-century Bach." He possessed a prodigious capacity for composition, and joined great
contrapuntal skill with modern taste in his works. His huge output included works for piano and voice, large choral works, chamber music, a cycle of biblical oratorios, orchestral suites, a Mass, two symphonies, symphonic poems, etc., and 12 Grand Preludes and Fugues for Organ (including double, triple and quadruple fugues). To play any of these last, the writer can attest, is a complete day's work.

Assisting at the cathedral as choirmaster at this time was a Professor Tom McCaffrey. There followed, also as choirmaster, about the years 1878-80, a singer who was extremely active with many singing groups in the area, Thomas F. Kirk, Sr. He was a dynamic leader of orchestras, bands, choruses, etc. for over half a century. A drummer-boy in the Civil War, he had also been a friend of Foster and was the conductor in 1875-76 of the Stephen C. Foster Serenaders. He was the director of The Troubadours begun in 1875, a half-minstrel/half-vaudeville group which gained enormous popularity. Indeed, it is reported that often people stood in line from Saturday evening to Monday morning to get tickets! He was the first to direct the public-school orchestra in the district, and is reported to have given some 2,000 concerts in and around Pittsburgh. He directed a band later to be called President McKinley's Own Band. It made several trips to Washington to be with the president. (His son, Tom Jr., traveled with famous bands and later became manager of the new Alvin Theatre and later, also the Nixon Theatre.) Kirk was director of St. Paul's Cathedral Choir of 50 voices for seven years.

Hermann T. Knake became organist at the cathedral about 1880, shortly after Nicholl left for New York. It seems he remained as organist into the 1890's. He was also pianist for the Pittsburgh Quintette Club, a well-known music group in the city. The flourishing music store, Barr, Knake & Buettler, was the successor to Wamelink & Barr when Wamelink left Pittsburgh.

In 1893, Miss Alice Carter came to the cathedral as organist, where she remained until 1899. She had been organist at St. Bridget's Church and had a splendid reputation. During her tenure as organist, Joseph Carl Breil became choirmaster at the cathedral in 1894, where he remained about four years. Here was a musician with a most remarkable career.

Breil was born in Pittsburgh in 1870 (d. 1929 in Los Angeles), graduated from Holy Ghost College (later Duquesne University) in 1888, and was the composer of Duquesne's Alma Mater. He studied voice in Milan and Leipzig and for a time sang in various opera companies. By 1891, he was already well-known as a choral director, and by 1894 (when he came to the cathedral) had composed some 50 works. Breil composed the first score ever written (1912) to accompany a motion picture, Queen Elizabeth, in which the lead was played by the great Sarah Bernhardt. He became associated with Hollywood in those early years of film, and wrote the music for the D. W. Griffith productions (super-spectacles!) Birth of a Nation and Intolerance. He wrote many instrumental and choral works including both grand and comic operas, and in 1919 his opera, The Legend, was produced at the New York Metropolitan Opera. Among his many popular songs was The Perfect Song, used as the theme song for the wonderfully-popular radio program "Amos 'n Andy."

With the turn of the century came an entirely new approach to music at the cathedral, indeed to most of America. There had been in the diocese in the last decade some strong forces that presaged the turn to music more liturgically fitting. For example, Caspar Koch at Holy Trinity Church (now named St. Benedict the Moor) had edited the first hymnal in the diocese in 1897 and, according to the Pittsburgh Catholic, was the first to introduce to Pittsburgh the singing of the proper parts of the Mass. Hans Glomb maintained a high level of liturgical music at St. Mary's Church, Sharpsburg, as did also John Vogel at St. Philomena's Church, and several others. Of direct interest in this regard is the following passage from an
address, "Ramblings of an Organist," given by Dr. Caspar Koch, municipal organist at Carnegie Hall and professor of music at Carnegie-Mellon University. At Synod Hall, Pittsburgh, May 8, 1950, at a convention of the Diocesan Guild of Catholic Organists, he said:

In the 1890's...with the support of a few other organists we organized a Catholic guild of organists, complete with a state charter. With a choir of some 120 singers we gave a program of classics from Palestrina and Lasso to Ett, Witt, Haller and Singenberger at St. Philomena's Church in April 1898. At a Catholic convention in Pittsburgh we were invited to provide a strictly liturgical program for the pontifical Mass in St. Paul's Cathedral. Since the organ loft in the transept of the old cathedral could not accommodate the choir of 100 men, we were given permission by Bishop Phelan and Father Canevin, the pastor, to employ an orchestra along with the choir in the large rear loft. The Mass, by Adler, was sent to us by Singenberger, and the proper of the Mass was sung by Brothers of Mary from St. Mary's on the north side and St. Michael's on the south side; Charles Guthoerl of St. Peter's on the south side played the organ accompaniment. ... A few years later Joseph Otten came here as organist of St. Paul's Cathedral. His seriousness and integrity as a church musician became a welcome force in clearing the choir loft of unecclesiastical music. (CK)

Otten was a musician thoroughly schooled in liturgical music, in Gregorian chant and sacred polyphony, in the classics and the 19th century Caecilian masters of Europe. Born in Holland in 1852, he came to St. Louis where, in 1880, he founded the St. Louis Choral Society. From 1880 to 1894 he greatly distinguished himself as its conductor, and more and more introduced orchestra into the group until, in 1890, he absorbed the Musical Union Orchestra, the principal orchestra among several in the city, and in 1893 he incorporated the two groups to form the St. Louis Choral-Symphony Society. This was the organization which was to become some years later (1907) the St. Louis Symphony.

Otten came to Pittsburgh in 1900. His first performance at the cathedral as organist and choirmaster was on Sunday, January 14, 1900. The choir sang Gounod's Messe Solemnelle. The church committee had "accepted the resignation of Miss Alice Carter" in December 1899, and "appointed Mr. Mayer as interim organist." No doubt this was the William Mayer (b. Richmond, 1868) who came to Pittsburgh in 1879 and became extremely active as organist, band leader, teacher, etc. for over 50 years. "He was an authority on pipe organs, designed several organs which attracted national attention, and for years represented Andrew Carnegie in his musical benefactions" (E.G.Baynham) — more precisely, in his donations of organs to churches and other institutions!

In March of 1900, we read in the Pittsburgh Catholic of Carnegie's offer to provide a new pipe organ for St. Paul's Cathedral, to be "best of its kind in the country." The large four-manual Kimball organ, built in Chicago in the summer of 1901, was dedicated in concert September 27, 1901. This replaced the Jardine organ installed in 1866. The Catholic of October 2, 1901, reports "The magnificent new $20,000 organ donated by Andrew Carnegie...is situated in the north transept gallery, while the antiphonal organ is located immediately behind the high altar." Mr. Gaston Dethier, renowned Belgian organist (then organist at St. Francis Xavier Church in New York), played the dedication. "The selections were from the greatest masters...works of Liszt, Thiele, Mendelssohn and Widor...the cathedral choir, under Joseph Otten, placed in the rear gallery, sang Ave verum by Saint-Saens and Tantum ergo by Greith." The Catholic further says: " the manuals are of 61 note range...The key and drawstop action is tubular pneumatic for all departments except the antiphonal organ, for the manipulation of which electricity is employed. The blowing apparatus occupies 150 square feet, is situated in the basement...and is operated by electric
motors aggregating 11 1/2 horsepower. Innovative indeed!

In this same year, 1901, the cathedral property, following intensive study and discussion, was sold to H. C. Frick in what was then the largest real-estate transaction in the history of Pittsburgh. The consultants and the cathedral authorities had considered for some time the idea of removing to a more propitious location. The debt was large and increasing; the impending excavations around Fifth & Grant would seriously threaten the foundations of the church; the location was yielding to commercial activity and the congregation was dwindling. With the sale in September 1901, the authorities promptly chose a site in the rapidly-growing Oakland section of the city. The last Mass in the old cathedral was in May 1903, the cornerstone for the new cathedral (at the corner of Fifth and Craig) was placed in September 1903, and the consecration of the new cathedral took place on Wednesday, October 24, 1906.

Otten remained in charge of the music while Epiphany Church served as the pro-cathedral. Meantime, the Kimball organ (less than two years old) was dismantled and shipped to the east end where it was stored in a shed on Craig Street, until the new cathedral was ready. The cost of moving the huge instrument, a major operation, was also the gift of the original donor, Andrew Carnegie.

It was while the present cathedral was under construction that Pope Pius X (now Saint Pius X) issued, on the Feast of St. Cecilia, November 22, 1903, the famous motu proprio calling for a reform in church music. The Pittsburgh diocese, at the firm direction of Bishop Canevin, immediately put into effect the instructions of the Holy Father. Among other things, this meant the dismissal of women from the choir lofts, a directive that was to be withdrawn with the new approaches of Vatican II in the 1960's. Choirs of men and boys now became the rule in churches throughout the diocese, a remarkable and exceptional example to all America. Through the succeeding years the diocese, under the leadership of its bishops, has always strictly followed the mind of the Church, and the cathedral, since the first Mass was offered within its walls, has always been known far and wide as an exemplar of the best in liturgical music. The Pittsburgh Catholic in December 1911 reports, for example, that the "current issue of America commends the Pittsburgh diocese for having a church music commission which has so successfully promoted the cause of good church music."

Otten was a highly esteemed musician and authority on church music, and wrote many articles on the subject. His authoritative articles in the Catholic Encyclopedia included Ambrosian chant, Gregorian music, religious song, musical instruments in church services, passion music, harmony, counterpoint, Sistine Choir, several composers, etc. A skillful conductor, he was a strict, yet warm, disciplinarian. Otten's choirs of both men and boys were recognized widely for their excellence. Evidencing the widespread recognition accorded his choral work, he was invited to bring his men's choir to both international Eucharist congresses held on the North American continent: one at Montreal in 1910 and the other at Chicago in 1926. He traveled with his men's choir throughout Pennsylvania and other states.

A brief sampling of countless programs presented by Otten at the cathedral indicates the good taste and propriety of this outstanding church musician:

Consecration of Bishop Regis Canevin, February 1903: Ecce sacerdos and Veni Creator by Witt; Missa Solemnis by Zeller; propers sung by a choir of Benedictine priests; Gregorian Te Deum followed by Oremus pro Pontifice Nostro Leone by Singenberger.

Consecration of the new cathedral, October, 1906: processional Coelestis urbs Jerusalem and recessional by the boys choir, Ecce sacerdos by Singenberger; Mass by Nekos; propers sung by a choir of priests; Domine Deus by Stehle.

Consecration of Bishop Hugh Boyle, June 1921: Ecce sacerdos by Witt; Missa Aeterna Christi munera by Palestrina; Gregorian propers and Te Deum.
Otten also inaugurated a custom of having hundreds of children from parochial schools in the diocese join with his choirs to sing the Gregorian Missa de Angelis annually on Thanksgiving morning. He compiled The Parish Hymnal, a splendid hymnal declared official for the diocese and used throughout the United States for many years. On the instrumental side, he directed many concerts, also with the cathedral choir and the Pittsburgh Orchestra in Carnegie Music Hall.

In 1922, there was a major renovation of the Kimball organ (which included the electrification of such action as was water-powered until then). This work entailed considerable expense and was paid for by the Carnegie Corporation.

After some 27 years of distinguished service to church music at the cathedral, Joseph Otten passed away on November 21, 1926. At the solemn Mass of Requiem in the cathedral, the school children alternated with the men’s choir to sing his beloved Gregorian chant on Thanksgiving Day.

The Reverend Carlo Rossini, who had come to Epiphany Church in Pittsburgh in 1923, succeeded Joseph Otten at the cathedral as organist and choirmaster. Father Rossini is the subject of a separate article by Rev. Thomas Jackson.

Paul Koch, born in Pittsburgh in 1912 (All Souls Day), began his position at the cathedral in October 1949. Koch had graduated from Carnegie Tech (Carnegie-Mellon University) in music in 1935, earned a graduate degree (M.A. in literature) at the University of Pittsburgh in 1936, while teaching music in the Pittsburgh public schools and for a brief time at Carnegie Tech. In 1936, he left for further music study at Leipzig, Germany (State Conservatory of Music) and in Paris with the renowned organist, Marcel Dupré. He returned three years later and became head of the department of music at the Asheville (NC) School for Boys. Following government service in Miami and New York during the war, he returned to teaching in New Jersey. Father Rossini had urged Koch for many years to return to Pittsburgh and to church music, in order to succeed him as soon as the war would end because of his wish to retire and return to his native Italy. In 1944, entirely at the urging of both Father Rossini and the cathedral authorities, Koch did come to Pittsburgh and became organist first at St. Stephen’s Church (Hazelwood) and then St. Philomena’s Church (Squirrel Hill) until such time as Father Rossini would leave the cathedral, which was in September 1949.

Koch assumed a music program which, under Otten and Rossini, had reached a very high liturgical level. The choir of men and boys was vigorously maintained, and the combined choirs of (eventually) 90 boys and some 50 men brought many people to participate enthusiastically in the liturgy. The men’s choir sang every Sunday and soon were singing the proper of the Mass each week from the Liber Usualis. The boy choirs (one in the sanctuary and one in the gallery, but eventually joined into one) joined the men at least once Sunday each month and usually at the numerous pontifical functions. Indeed, it was not unusual for the combined choirs to sing two pontifical functions in one day! The boys choir, in time, was in demand for functions outside the church, e.g., singing Bach’s St. Matthew Passion with the Pittsburgh Symphony under Dr. William Steinberg at the Syria Mosque in 1961; singing the same at the Carnegie Music Hall with the Bach Choir in 1960; Benjamin Britten’s War Requiem with chorus and orchestra at Carnegie Music Hall in 1967 (Carnegie-Mellon University) with Harth conducting; Penderecki’s St. Luke Passion at Carnegie Music Hall (repeated at Calvary Episcopal Church) in 1969, with chorus and orchestra (Harth conducting); singing in the Broadway show, The Happy Time with Ray Bolger at the Civic Light Opera in July 1969, etc.

There were many memorable occasions in the early 1950’s, viz., the annual conventions of the diocesan Guild of Catholic Organists (DGCO) with over 600 choir-boys (from 15-20 churches over the diocese) all immaculately vested, processing from
Synod Hall and occupying the entire middle aisle of the cathedral, singing the solemn Mass and alternating with a large choir of men in the gallery; the annual "homecoming" Masses which brought back so many men who had sung at the cathedral over the years; concerts/shows by the men's choir to raise funds for the new organ, etc.

In March 1961, a two-manual organ (Moller) was dedicated by Bishop Wright in the chapel of Our Lady at the cathedral. On December 8, 1962, the large Beckerath organ was dedicated in the cathedral, an event heralded throughout America and Europe. It replaced the Kimball which had served since 1901. The Story of the Beckerath Organ is a separate essay rather than a part of this history.

While at the cathedral, Koch was named City Organist at Carnegie Hall, playing a recital every Sunday; he was also director of music at Mellon Institute of Industrial Research, directing classical programs and Broadway shows; and he was also professor of organ and piano at Pittsburgh Musical Institute.

The men's choir traveled quite a bit during the 1960's. There were trips to outlying parishes and neighboring dioceses to sing concerts, special celebrations and Masses; there were trips to Cleveland and the choir was one of few invited to sing at the Fifth International Church Music Congress held in Chicago-Milwaukee in 1966. The repertoire of Masses expanded to include many contemporary European masters plus Masses composed especially for the choir. The large repertoire included Masses of Gregorian chant, classic polyphony, 19th-century and contemporary masters, etc. Seldom was any Mass repeated during a season! In 1966, the renowned French composer, Maurice Duruflé, came to the cathedral to conduct his famous Requiem in a memorable performance. The men's choir was augmented by ladies from Carnegie-Mellon University. In 1968, the men supplied the male voices for a performance of Haydn's Nelson Mass at Seton Hill College (Greensburg). This performance was repeated a month later (December 1968), with professional soloists, in the cathedral. The reception of the large audience, which included Bishop Wright, was completely enthusiastic, and the prevailing spirit led to immediate plans for similar performances of the world's great choral masterpieces.

The instructions of the Second Vatican Council encouraged not only greater music participation of the congregation, etc., but also did not restrict mixed choirs of men and women (as had the motu proprio of St. Pius X. which ruled the diocese since 1903). Koch consulted Bishop Wright more than once on the true intentions of the council: "...The treasury of sacred music is to be preserved and fostered with great care. Choirs must be diligently promoted, especially in cathedral churches..." At the cathedral the congregation, already provided with hymnals (with words and music), was encouraged and instructed regularly in the singing of hymns/responses, also Gregorian Credo III for the sung Masses.

In September 1970, ladies were heartily invited to join the choir and there was a most gratifying response. Soon there was a splendid mixed choir of 75 men and women singing regularly on Sundays. The boy choir was now discontinued.

With the new choir came a complete change in the repertoire of Masses and motets, including a change to larger and more involved compositions. A repertoire of standard Masses for the Catholic liturgy was carefully developed for weekly use and with the plan to present annually in concert one large Mass from the treasury of great choral classics. In the next two months (December 6, 1970) the choir performed Mozart's Coronation Mass with professional soloists at a program commemorating the eighth anniversary of the dedication of the Beckerath organ. This pattern—to sing a major work in conjunction with an organ recital by one of the world's renowned organists and thus to commemorate the anniversary of the organ dedication—was to be followed by the choir for sixteen years. It was an annual event...
that brought enormous crowds of music lovers into the cathedral.

Henceforth, the choir was to present some of the most beautiful works in all Catholic church music: the Mozart Requiem and Coronation Mass, Haydn's Nelson, Pauken, and Theresien Masses; Schubert's Mass in G; Beethoven's Mass in C Major; Vivaldi's Gloria; Kodaly's Missa Brevis; and others, including Brahms' Requiem and selected Bach cantatas. Portions of all these classics were regularly used at the Sunday Masses, judiciously selected to conform with liturgical norms, and always received to the extreme delight and edification of both singers and listeners. A dozen records of such performances, professionally prepared, are extant. Accompaniment for these performances was usually on the great Beckerath organ, occasionally with orchestra. Special mention must be made of two exceptional organists who served for many years with Koch as assistants and who regularly accompanied so expertly the Sunday choir Masses and the concerts. They are Matthew Cvetic, who served some twelve years (from 1951) and Richard Nussbaumor who served some fifteen years—from 1963 until his untimely death in 1978. Both were brilliant organists of exceptionally good taste, musicians who contributed so mightily to the extraordinary level and variety of the cathedral music over the years.

In November 1975, the choir of 51 singers traveled via chartered plane to Rome. Many choirs from all over the country have since made similar trips to the Eternal City. They sang a special Mass in St. Peter's Basilica on Thanksgiving Day, concelebrated by Cardinal Wright and some 35 bishops and priests. The newspapers claimed that St. Paul's Cathedral Choir was the first American choir ever to sing a Mass in the basilica. They sang Mozart's Coronation Mass, adapted to include Gregorian Credo III with congregation and with several solos deleted. A charming footnote: Cardinal Wright came out to greet the choir after the Mass, and coming up to the director with outstretched arms, and under the great scripture motto inside the dome high, high above, embraced him and exclaimed loudly Tu es Paulus, et super hunc Paulum aedificabo chorum meum!

The entire choir, often functioning not so much as “just another choir” but rather (as once noted in the newspaper) as “a way of life!” always plunged completely and enthusiastically into various projects for raising money (flea markets, musical revues, bake-sales, raffles, etc.) and always came away with goodly sums to assist in their exciting plans...with the result that each choir member who was free could travel to Europe at not-too-great personal expense. The choir was to make four more trips to Europe. Each time they sang under special circumstances: in 1978 to Austria and Germany, where in Vienna they sang in the Ursuline Church, formerly the Chapel of the Ursuline Nuns for whom Mozart wrote his first Mass (Ursulinenmesse, 1768); then to Salzburg to sing a special pontifical Mass in the cathedral (where Mozart played). This Mass was broadcast all over Austria, Hungary and Czechoslovakia where it reached, we were told, thousands of people behind the Iron Curtain. The Mass sung was by our own Pittsburgh composer, Antonio Corona, and dedicated to the cathedral choir. In 1981, again to Rome to sing in the Basilica of St. Paul-outside-the-Walls; 1985, to Spain and Portugal to sing Mass in the cathedral of Barcelona; and in 1988, to Ireland, England and France to sing in the pro-cathedral in Dublin. Accompanying the choir during Mass was Gerard Gillen, perhaps Ireland's greatest organist.

After forty years of devoted and rewarding labor in the vineyard of the Lord, Paul Koch retired on January 1, 1989. During those years he had the unfailing support of his wife Kay who participated in every project, sang with and accompanied the choir often.

James Noakes of Detroit, Michigan, became organist and choirmaster at Saint Paul's Cathedral in January 1989.
THOUGHTS IN ISTANBUL

The Basilica of Saint Anthony of Padua in Istanbul is where I really learned my trade as church organist. As an adolescent I was allowed to practice on its pipe organ, and at age nineteen I was appointed its organist, with a salary to boot. I was so overwhelmed by this that I went to early Mass and to communion the day of my first service, asking God that I may prove worthy of this privilege and fulfill my duties well for His greater glory.

Though I was already an accomplished performer, I had much to learn, and I learned on the job. The church belonged to Italian Franciscans, and the superior, who led the choir, was a trained musician and composer. He patiently taught me how to transpose Gregorian chant at sight, and how to accompany it modally. Through him I learned much repertory, from renaissance polyphony to more recent music (including works of Perosi and Refice), from simple recitation of chant on psalm tones to elaborate *faux bourdons* and complex polyphonic settings. At vespers I learned to distinguish between solemn tones for the *Magnificat* and simple ones, and I learned to use the *Liber Usualis* with as much ease and familiarity as if it were my own address book. “An organist without his *Liber Usualis* is like a soldier without his gun,” the Padre would say whenever I appeared without my own book. He also helped discipline my impulsive improvisations, warning me: “Modulating into distant keys is dangerous unless you know how to modulate back. It is like wandering off into the woods and not finding the path home again. Suddenly the choir must resume its singing in the old key, and you are far afield in a strange key.” I thus began to modulate with more understanding of what I was doing, and to harness my wild harmonic impulses. I learned about rituals, about fine points that distinguish high Mass from pontifical Mass, about the need to play more soberly during Lent and more festively after the resurrection. I understood why there was pink joy on Gaudete Sunday and purple mourning starting on Passion Sunday, and how the organ was used accordingly.

Learning these things made a true church organist of me long before I went to Rome to finish my formal studies, becoming a maestro myself. Padre Giorgio had passed on to me secrets of a long tradition of which he himself had been a part, and I was like a young man entering the seminary after having been long nurtured in his vocation by a humble parish priest in his native town. Now I was to study musical theology, in a manner of speaking, but what had sparked my vocation had been Padre Giorgio’s initiating me into the rich beauty of our liturgy, from the simplest low Mass to the solemn procession of pontifical Mass, when our then-bishop Roncalli (the future John XXIII) entered the basilica to my thundering playing while the choir jubilantly intoned *Ecce sacerdos magnus*.

I wonder what Roncalli would think if he entered that same basilica today. I was there recently and tried to play the organ again. I say “tried,” for there was really no opportunity to play. There was neither serious music to accompany nor any silence during which to play. The church was nearly empty, and the Mass was in Italian (in Turkey!). Some announcements were made in Turkish (the language of a Moslem people); some responses were in French (many Catholics in Istanbul used to be French-speaking). Conspicuously absent was the one language that used to unite the many races that once filled the now-empty church: Latin. There is no choir left. At Christmas or other festive occasions the choir of the Istanbul conservatory (all Moslem Turks) performs some major work there, and the church is filled with music-loving Turks who come to enjoy what to them is an exotic event and quasi-concert. The present superior relates with pride what an “attraction” his church has become for Turks. What he seems not to know is what I learned from some old friends. They
stopped going to that church. They prefer some small chapel where they can at least enjoy some privacy.

As one who deeply deplores the state of decadence into which our liturgy and our music-making have fallen since Vatican II, I could not but be pained at the contrast between what I saw and what I knew once. Granting that the number of Latin Catholics in Istanbul has shrunk dramatically, what is happening now has nothing to do with the size of a religious community. As a believer in the former unifying force of Latin for Roman Catholics, I fail to see what sense it makes to use a given vernacular when that vernacular is more foreign to those attending than was Latin. I say more foreign, because Latin was universal, and all Catholics felt a kinship to it. What kinship does Italian offer to French-speaking Catholics in Turkey, or to Greek-speaking Austrians, Yugoslavs, or many other Levantines born and raised in Istanbul, for whom Latin was once the common liturgical tongue? Absurd, I thought, absurd!

After Mass I ventured into the large crypt below the basilica, where Chaldean Catholic refugees from near the Iraqi border had their own Mass. What a contrast! The place was packed. At the altar, the ancient Chaldean rites were performed with solemn pomp, with several attendants to the priest, and with a sizable choir. The chanted prayers in Chaldean went on and on. Most of those attending no longer understand that archaic tongue, but they deeply felt what they were experiencing. It was obvious from their devout postures. They did not need to understand all that the priest was chanting. They knew and felt that it was sacred and that they were part of something sacred. I myself felt elevated and was finally able to pray, too. I did not need to understand Chaldean. I knew what the prayers meant, and I joined them in my heart.

Lucky Chaldeans, I thought. Mother Church still speaks to you in sounds you recognize! She makes you feel at home. You certainly have no identity crisis, nor do you need drums and guitars that remind you more of the secular world than of the mysterious world for which you long when you come before the Lord.

And I also thought this: Isn’t it interesting—and telling—that those clamoring for the greatest changes and the de-Latinization of the Church were not the non-Europeans? Non-Europeans were quite content to accept Rome’s form of worship. It was rather those do-gooder Westerners who, bored with themselves, decided that it would be good for others if they, Westerners, went “native” and turned their back on their old heritage.

If what followed Vatican II proves anything at all, it proves the moral bankruptcy of the Christian west. Like the Westerner who “rediscovers” himself and starts chanting “Krishna-Krishna,” our liturgical do-gooders tried to rediscover themselves by turning away from the greatest beauty created by man, in order to “self-express” with the primitive sounds of a jungle they never knew and would never like if they had to live in it—not just visit it, as do the bored rich when they go slumming.

KÁROLY KÖPE

ISTANBUL

16
LITURGICAL MUSIC AND THE RESTORATION OF THE SACRED

There are men and there are things; there are persons and there are objects. There are also principalities and powers; there are thrones and dominations. Theologians and moralists are familiar with virtues and vices; philosophers know qualities and modes of being. But what is *musica sacra*? What does “sacred” mean? A recent response claims that “liturgical theology” knows liturgical art to be “appropriate only to the degree that it functions in support of sacred liturgical signs” (meaning, in the case of liturgical music, the “communitarian sign” of the liturgy, i.e., “our oneness in the Lord”). A practical conclusion is drawn from this postulate: “Sacred music should only sustain the continuity of the voices during worship.” If it does not do so, it is “inappropriate to the liturgy and is then not sacred.” In a manner which evokes faded memories of the old Society of St. Gregory and its “lists” white and black, proponents of this view pinpoint a lack of analysis as the reason why the standards for judging music to be sacred “are only restrictive,” and hence not useful as guides: “they help you selectively eliminate songs but do not show which to include.”

It is always helpful to begin formulating a reply on the basis of concrete facts, of phenomena, of what presents itself to our senses. Let us therefore try to “approach the things themselves” as they are given, and examine the way they constitute themselves in the consciousness and intentions of the perceiver.

Let us visit in mind the Church of Santa Maria della Rotunda in Rome, popularly known as the Pantheon. It is the summer of 1973. Seeking temporary respite from the glare of the midday sun, people wander in and out, deep in conversation but filled with curiosity. Not a few continue to smoke their cigarettes to the end, or to light up a new one. And when one of them is told: Please, no smoking here, because we are in a church, he replies in amazement, Is this a church? (The architectural form alone is, of course, not enough to answer the question convincingly.) And then, after a moment’s pause, the final question: Even if it were a real church — why not smoke?

Let us move to Treptow, a suburb of East Berlin, in 1981. We are all admonished to extinguish our smoking materials at the entrance to the huge memorial park dedi-
icated to the fallen soldiers of the Red Army.

Or let us travel to Israel, very recently, and very discreetly but quite firmly. The same thing happens again. In the hotel restaurant, as American tourists at the next table take out their after-dinner cigarettes, someone says: No smoking, please! But why not? Here and now, of course, not for the sake of the place but because of the time. It is Friday evening and the Sabbath has begun.

In none of these cases does purposefulness or prevention play a part, as it would in a college lecture room or a hospital operating theatre. The danger of fire is not a factor in these examples, as it is during an airliner landing or take-off. These instances, finally, do not contain a general rejection of smoking, as though it were something to be forbidden in principle.

But in Rome, in Berlin and in Tel Aviv there was a common factor, namely the circumstance that in each case a limit or frontier was to be made evident and recalled to mind—a boundary line which distinguishes and separates a special place and a non-ordinary period of time from the arbitrary, run-of-the-mill “somewhere” or “anytime.”

From everyone who crosses the threshold into this “other” area there is expected a type of behavior which differs from his otherwise normal conduct. Whoever enters a mosque or the walled enclosure of an Indian temple, must remove his shoes. And in the case of the Indian temple the limitations can be so strict that the non-Hindu will be forbidden to enter the innermost sanctuary. In Christian churches, gentlemen remove their hats, as they do before an open grave, or when the national anthem is sung. By contrast, the believing Jew covers his head, not only in the synagogue but wherever he prays. (If you go to visit the grave of Moses Maimonides at Tiberias and do not wear a cap or a hat, the custodian will deny you entrance.)

In cultic areas, in spaces reserved for worship, it is above all silence which prevails; loud calls and laughter at any rate are considered reprehensible. Tourists are denied entrance to the great basilicas of Rome if they are clothed in an all-too-unconcerned fashion. And at such temples one is accustomed to regard with mistrust the instruments of public curiosity: photography is forbidden, at least during divine services in many Christian churches. And the same is true in the temples of orthodox Hinduism. The Pueblo Indians of New Mexico are offended when camera-carrying tourists even approach the entrance to their underground cultic chambers.

Now, if a stranger, an outsider, a non-initiate were to ask what all these curious and often difficult rules of conduct were supposed to mean, he would probably hear, in spite of all the concrete differences in detail, the same basic answer in each case: the meaning of all this is simply to attest and express reverence and respect. Reverence for what? For something—in any event—which demands and deserves respect and veneration. And when we try to specify more precisely the exact nature of that which is worthy of veneration, then we encounter the difficulty of reducing the various replies to a common denominator. But the answers would nonetheless converge on a common indication of something which is (or should be) in some sense “sacred” to men, whether that be the “grim majesty of death,” or the dignity of the fatherland, or the honor of fallen war heroes—or indeed the especially concentrated presence of the Divine—in fact of God Himself.

The conviction common to all of these replies is the existence, within the world as man experiences it, within the boundaries of time and space, certain pre-eminent places and periods of time which plainly stand forth above and beyond the level of everyday normality because they are of a special and exceptional dignity.

The selective de-limitation of something exceptionally worthy of veneration is the clear and original meaning of the apposite vocabulary still in use today. Hagios, for instance, the Greek word for “sacred,” implies opposition to koinos (the “average,”
common, usual). And the piece of ground belonging to the gods, upon which the
altar or the temple is built, is termed to temenos, that which has been cut off or
"carved out" of the total property which otherwise belongs to the community. In
Latin the verb sancire (the root of sanctus = sacred, holy) means to limit, circumscribe, draw a boundary around: for the ancient Romans, the term sanctio (sanction)
originally denoted the delimitation of sacred places and their protection against
transgression and profane contact.

Contemporary vernacular usage is of a piece with the classical roots. Sacré is that
which belongs to an ordre des choses séparés; the OED says that one of the meanings
of "sacred" is "set apart." The term "sacred," then, refers to a special dignity or pre-
eminence which rises above the continuum of everyday normality, which is precisely
"abnormal" and clearly marked off as distinct from the usual, the customary, the
normal. And such dignity quite rightly demands from men special forms of respect,
simply because certain empirically ascertainable objects, spaces, times and actions
possess the special characteristic of being ordered to the divine level or sphere in a
manner which exceeds the normal and the average. And it is on the basis of this
exceptional ordination to the supra-human level, of this precisely uncommon and ex-
ceptional "fulness" or concentration of the divine Presence that we can comprehend
the boundary or limit which divides and separates that which is "sacred" in this
sense, from the "profane." "Profane" simply means that which is precisely "unexcep-
tional," that which belongs to the realm of the normal, the average, the everyday;
"profane" does not necessarily mean "unholy" (even though the specifically "unholy"
does in fact exist, representing the acme of "profanity"). Thus we can say with a
certain justification that all bread is "holy" (because created by God, nourishment of
human life) or that every piece of earth is "consecrated ground," and so forth.
Expressions such as these do not call into question the existence of a completely
unique kind of "holy bread" or of "consecrated ground" in a literally incomparable
sense of that word. And so we can agree with the sentence of Aquinas, confirmed by
ethnology and the philosophy of religion as well as the theological interpretation of
testaments both old and new. Something is sacred (sacrum) on the strength of its
ordination toward cultic worship, ad cultum divinum.

The available evidence, when analyzed, allows us to conclude that if a special
presence of the Divine is to be found anywhere in man's historical world, it is to be
found in its most concentrated form in a sacred ritual action, and because of their
relationship to this sacred action, persons, places, times and objects are also called
"sacred."

But what is an actio praecellenter sacra? It is simply the accomplishment of an
action, a rite, performed by a community in a non-ordinary way. Let us be very
precise: we are speaking here of the celebration of the Eucharistic mysteries during
which there occurs the Exceptional par excellence, the un-common and extra-
ordinary in the absolute sense of those words—God's physical presence among men
under the forms of bread and wine. The meaning of this divine Presence for man is
precisely rapi—to be enraptured, carried up and away beyond the "here and now."
And nothing could be more obvious to a man of faith than to act "differently" within
such a circumscribed context, "differently" than he acts otherwise, on the tennis
courts, for instance, or at the supermarket. One speaks a language which is obvi-
ously human but different; "special," somehow, in delivery, in style, in diction and
grammar, and in vocabulary.

What then of the musica sacra which forms an integral part of this actio praecel-
lenter sacra? What must its distinctive characteristics be? Will it sound, for example,
like ordinary, everyday pop music to which more or less "pious" texts have been
joined? Will it sound like common, everyday entertainment music? like a more or
less inconspicuous background accompaniment for toothpaste commercials? Romano Guardini has reminded us that the foundation of any liturgical formation or education is the ancient truth that the soul informs the body: *anima forma corporis.* Comprehension of this truth is the key which unlocks the world of the Sacred, for it enables us to grasp what is meant by a symbol. It is not necessary to be a Christian in order to understand what is meant by a “sign,” but he who does not know what a “sign” is, cannot comprehend a sacrament.

Is it rash to ask whether one of the reasons for the decline of the Sacred is the fact that the Christian “sacred myth” (i.e. the gospels) is being weakened, doubted and attacked? For a long time, we have been told that the evidence of the new testament must be reconsidered in light of the new “historical sense.” Indeed, the evidential value of the bible as a whole is to be examined anew, it is claimed, “in light of that analytical criticism which has no parallel for acuteness of investigation, carefulness of method, and completeness of apparatus, since the days of our blessed Lord’s life on earth” (Ch. Gore). Now, if this fresh study results in disbelief in the “sacred tale,” it follows that the Christian “sacred object” will no longer seem so, and that the God-Man Jesus Christ is neither mediator nor object of the sacrum. And when the believer is no longer conscious of a connexion between the human world and a higher realm, where everything refers to everything else and many levels are interrelated in a meaningful way which links man’s microcosm to the macrocosm of the Transcendent, then it should come as no surprise if in a desacralized world, the abandoned altars eventually become the dwelling of demons (E. Junger).

The analysis can be taken a step further. When the divinity of Jesus Christ was denied by rationalist critics, it did not take long for the Eucharist to come under fire. In 1891, Ad. Harnack announced that at the Last Supper the Savior was primarily interested in the meal itself: it was the meal that Jesus blessed, and in so doing He taught His followers to sanctify the most important act of physical life. He also promised to be with them in the future, at every meal which they would henceforth share in remembrance of Him. Thus Harnack, a century ago.

And so it seems like old wine in New Age wine skins when tired voices, re-echoing the past, continue to entice the unsuspecting down the same sorry path which leads from the main line to the old line to the sideline. Thus the authors of a recent and widely hailed catechism explicitly call upon the Church to abandon the term “sacrifice” as a specification of the content of the Eucharistic celebration. In its place, the aspect of “meal” or “banquet” is to be emphasized. “The determining structure is that of the meal.” The Eucharistic Sacrifice is thus to be understood as a meal: “In the Eucharist the memory of Christ’s suffering is celebrated in the form of a meal. It is the basic form of the Eucharistic sacrifice” (Schmaus).

Divergence of views regarding the relation between the dogmatic and liturgical levels of the question has quite rightly been called the “central problem” of the *accomodata renovatio in liturgicis* (Joseph Ratzinger). Why has Christian art always pictured the Last Supper as a tragic event and not a joyous repast? Is it not true that “sacrifice” and “meal” are two concepts which cannot be equated with each other? Are they not in fact essentially (and not just externally) contrary human psychological processes?

The essence of a sacrifice is the freedom of total giving made possible through self-deny: *oblatus est quia ipse voluit* (Is. 53:7). Every sacrifice, including Holy Mass insofar as it is identical with the sacrifice of Calvary, necessarily implies merit and consequently moral freedom as necessary pre-condition of any merit, hence also logically presupposing suffering or self-denial as the necessary condition of freedom. In other words, meritoriousness is the necessary consequence, freedom an essential element, and suffering or self-denial the necessary pre-supposition of sacrifice. No
sacrifice is possible without suffering or self-denial, hence no Sacrifice of the Mass without the sacramental re-presentation of suffering. And precisely here lies the fundamental contradiction between sacrifice and meal: in the participants, they imply—nay, require!—psychological states of mind which are mutually exclusive.

It would mean delivering dogs to Bautzen if one were to attempt to explain the role of a meal as source of joy in holy writ. Suffice it to recall the fact that in the preaching of Jesus, the banquet or meal is a preferred symbol for the joys and glories of heaven. There is in fact an inseparable link between meal and joy, between eating and enjoyment, between *usus cibi et potus* and *delectatio*. There is no meal or banquet without enjoyment, without a *delectatio* of the senses.

Some, therefore, claim that since the Eucharist is a memorial not only of the Savior's death but also of His resurrection, it makes us share in the triumphant life of the risen Lord and hence implies an atmosphere of joy. But it is quite clear that the "memorial" concentrates primarily and directly on the last supper and on the passion, of which the Eucharist is one moment.

The sacrament of the Eucharist is received and eaten because food and drink better symbolize the specific effects of the grace of this sacrament. The Eucharist is both sacrifice (insofar as it is offered) and sacrament (insofar as it is received). The Church offers up the Mass, for it is a sacrifice; but holy Communion is a food, a gift, a privilege, something not offered but enjoyed. The real distinction between sacrifice and sacrament is to be sought in the contrary aspects of suffering and joy, though in a sacrifice, suffering plays a different role than does joy in the case of a meal. Suffering is a necessary pre-condition of the sacrifice, whereas joy is a necessary consequence of a meal. To summarize: a meal as meal cannot be a sacrifice, and a sacrifice as sacrifice cannot be a meal. To represent one "in the form of" the other is to present a tragedy "in the form of" a comedy, or to depict a circle "in the form of" a square. In liturgico-musical terms: if holy Mass is indeed a sacrifice, an *actio praecellular sacra*, then one of its integral and necessary parts will be a music which is also *sacra*. But if a fraternal meal is actually being celebrated, then very different music will be appropriate. . . a "polka Mass," for instance.

During the *ad limina* visit of the Brazilian bishops of their pastoral region Sul-I, on March 20, 1990, Pope John Paul II made these significant remarks:

> Legitimate and necessary concern for current realities in the concrete lives of people cannot make us forget the true nature of the liturgical actions. It is clear that the Mass is not the time to "celebrate" human dignity or purely terrestrial claims or hopes. It is rather the sacrifice which renders Christ really present in the sacrament.

This concise statement of Catholic belief really requires no further comment. The competent choirmaster, who in recent decades has often enough felt the lashes of Rehoboam, need only draw the logical conclusions in his daily liturgico-musical practice.

But this, you say, is one step removed from reality. If that be so in truth, then it may be that all of us must steel ourselves to persevere among the "sole retrievers of an ancient prudence." Those whose names are writ large, in golden letters, in the calendar of saints of the new age, in fact resemble nothing more closely than the tired knight who sees a recognition of his steed and a guarantee of his own knightly existence in the fact that modern technologies of energy are still often measured in...horse-power.

It is understandable that today, both the competent choirmaster and the legitimate liturgist often feel like Benito Ceneno, like one who finds himself, according to Herman Melville's late novella, in the situation of that unlucky captain whom the guileless and the good-natured assume to be the master of a pirate vessel. In reality,
however, Benito Cerenos was a hostage in danger of death; his veiled hints and
discreet indications were not understood by his well-meaning visitor, who was in-
stead strengthened in his mistrust. Has Benito Cerenos perhaps become in fact a
symbol for the situation of many a man in the midst of an ecclesia in mundo hujus
temporis ruled by increasingly neoteric tendencies and antilatvetic orientations?
Nostra res agitur! It behooves us to work while the light lasts, so that the Ecclesia
orans will not have to cross the threshold of the third millenium with empty hands
and ears ringing to the faint echoes of the ancient laughter of Gelimer, King of the
Vandals. Let us therefore continue to do the best things in the worst times, and to
hope them in the most calamitous. In mundo pressuram habeitis, sed confidite, ego
vici mundum. In the world ye shall have tribulation, but be of good cheer: I have
overcome the world (John 16:33).

REVEnED ROBERT A. SKERIS

NOTES

2. J. Pieper, Ent sakralisierung? (Zurich 1970) 7/32. The succeeding paragraphs are indebted to
Pieper's analysis.
4. Ordo Missae, editio typica: Institutio Generalis Missalis Romani (Citta del Vaticano 1969)
60, #256 = sacras aedes; 62, #260 = locum sacrum; 65, #280 = sacras actiones; 67, #289 =
vasa sacra; 68, #297 = cultu sacro, sacrae vestes, etc. See also Sacrosanctum Concilium, art. 7
(actio praecellenter sacra).
6. See e.g. the Christmas preface (in invisibilium amorem rapiamur) which anciently served as
the preface par excellence of the Blessed Sacrament.
7. See R. Guardini, Der Kultakt und die gegenwartige Aufgabe der Liturgie: Liturgie und
liturgische Bildung, (Wurzburg 1966) 38 f.
8. A. Harnack, Brod und Wasser: die eucharistische Elemente bei Justin (Leipzig 1891). See the
discussion of this and other theories by A. Piolanti (tr. L. Penzo), The Holy Eucharist (New
York 1961) 17/22, 97/8 on the erroneous view that sacrifice is only a meal taken in common by
a group of men for the purpose of strengthening their social and religious bonds. In fact, "the
Eucharistic table sunders man from sin and draws him close to God by sanctifying—which is
to say by sacrificing—him."
9. Sum. Theol. 11-Ilae, q. 141, a. 5.
10. Thus R. Amerio, Iota unum. Studio delle variazioni della Chiesa cattolica nel secolo XX
(Milano 1986) 502 and note 11.
11. Sum. Theol. Ill, q. 79, a. 5.

BIBLIOGRAPHY
J. Feiner amd L. Vischer (edd.), Neues Glaubensbuch (Freiburg 1973) 579 f.
W. Hoenes, Gottesdienst als Gemeinschaftskult. Ideologie und Liturgie = Distinguo 1 (Bad
E. Junger, Blatter und Steine (Hamburg 1934).
W. H. Mallock, Doctrine and Doctrinal Disruption (London 1908) 93/111, here 98.
J. Ratzinger (tr. G. Harrison), The Feast of Faith (San Francisco 1986) 33/60, here 36.
M. Schmaus (tr. M. Lederer), The Church as Sacrament - Dogma 5 (Kansas City 1975) 122.
H. Schrade, Bemerkungen zum Problem von "sakral" und "profan" in christlicher Architektur:
R. Skeris, Divini Cultus Studium. Studies in the Theology of Worship and of its Music -
Musicae Sacrae Meletemata 3 (Altotting 1990) 11/19.
G. Van der Leeuw (tr. D. E. Green), Sacred and Profane Beauty. The Holy in Art (New York
1963) 213/62.
REVIEWS

Choral

A Child is Born by Robert G. Griglak. SATB, organ. OCP Publications. 5536 N.E. Hassalo, Portland, Oregon 97213. $0.80.

Simple and familiar, there are no choral difficulties in this easily learned Christmas setting.

O Come, All Ye Faithful ar. by John Schiavone. SATB, organ, trumpet. OCP Publications. 5536 N.E. Hassalo, Portland, Oregon 97213. $0.90.

An easy setting of an old favorite, there are a few new ideas in what is mostly a unison setting with some four-part sections. The trumpet is in C, and one Latin verse is added.


The text is the work of Sr. Gemma Brunke, SC. The piece is dedicated to the choir of Saint Patrick’s Church in Brooklyn, New York. The harmonies are simple and there is no vocal problem. It has no liturgical place, but it can be useful for devotions and school functions.

Come, Thou Long-expected Jesus ar. by Austin C. Lovelace. SA(T)B, organ. Augsburg Fortress, 426 S. 5th St., Box 1209, Minneapolis, MN 55440-1209. $0.90.

The text is by Charles Wesley and the melody a Polish carol. Simple and easy, it is mostly unison and two-part. The familiar tune has a true tenderness and is gently set.


Both English and German texts are printed. There is a soprano descant provided for chorus or solo voice. The harmony is easy and traditional.


A familiar text, the setting is easy, a great amount in unison. It is not a liturgical composition, but might find a place in a choir program, perhaps on Saint Patrick’s Day.

R.J.S.

Organ


This collection contains twelve brief variations on the familiar hymn melodies, Old Hundredth and Donne Secours, set in a contemporary idiom. The nature of the style requires a sophisticated musical taste, perhaps making these pieces most suitable for recitals or hymn festivals.

Disjunct lines, atonality, chromaticism, and ostinato patterns abound, creating potentially virtuosic showpieces for the performer. Surprisingly, however, the variations are not technically difficult. Both manual and pedal parts are generally clean and easy to master; the greatest challenge lies in reading numerous accidentals.

Organists will welcome this unusual and stunning composition.

MARY ELIZABETH LE VOIR

Twelve Short Organ Pieces by Christian Immo Schneider. Augsburg/Fortress Publishers. $6.50.

These pieces are valuable not only as service music but as a teaching resource. Each is brief and straightforward, and a variety of styles provides opportunities to develop technique (e.g., double pedal, pedal solo, cantionale style, and so forth).

As a collection, these pieces offer the interest and practicality not always found in method books.

MARY ELIZABETH LE VOIR


This set of five variations is a valuable addition to the existing repertory for lent and passiontide. The keyboard part is scored for manuals only (organ or piano). Moreover, it is composed in the austere, tonal, neo-baroque style found in many of Jan Bender’s works.

The violin/organ combination is well-integrated and highly effective. Neither part is difficult. The variations may be performed independently or as a suite.

MARY ELIZABETH LE VOIR


Many organists are familiar with this fine series of hymn preludes published by Augsburg. The anthology is a tremendous resource for locating hymn preludes, interludes, or variations, and the volumes can be purchased separately.
Volume 21 contains twelve preludes including *Divinum Mysterium*, *Go Tell It on the Mountain*, and *Wie Schon Leuchtet*. As with the other volumes, the variations are short, practical, faithful to the chorale, and filled with compositional variety and interest.

MARY ELIZABETH LE VOIR

*Sortie (Grand Choeur)* by Théodore Dubois. The Kenwood Press. $5.50.

Flaasy postludes in the French romantic tradition are always popular with organists and congregations. Organists seeking new repertoire will welcome this publication of the lesser known *Sortie* (no. 10 from *Dix Pièces*). While it lacks the depth and artistry of the late romantic masterworks, it nevertheless sparkles with clarity and virtuosity. Rapid figuration in the manuals requires solid organ technique, but the pedal is minimal and the piece presents few technical difficulties.

MARY ELIZABETH LE VOIR

*A Fancy on “Westminster Abbey”* by Richard C. Baker. The Kenwood Press. $3.95.

This Fancy is a short work in compound meter with the melody in the pedal. The manual parts are primarily triadic intervals which lie well under the hands. The piece is bright and charming. It would serve well as an organ postlude.

MARY ELIZABETH LE VOIR

*Te Deum 1986* by Gerald Bales. The Kenwood Press. $8.95.

This *Te Deum* has its origins in the ancient alternatim practice of organ and Gregorian chant, and was patterned after the works of Louis Marchand. Proper performance assumes at least a working knowledge of French classic organ registration, since only minimal registrations are provided in the score. The compositional style is contemporary, with parallel chords, open intervals, and striking chromaticism. It is not, however, difficult to perform, and the music is both festive and dramatic. A schola is required for performance. The organ serves as a literal reply to sections of the chant. The solemn tone of the *Te Deum* is set, and a separate score is provided for the singers. A composition of this nature is of great value for the appropriate liturgical occasions.

MARY ELIZABETH LE VOIR

*Offertoire sur un Alleluia Grégorien* by Henri Mulet. The Kenwood Press. $5.50.

The impressionistic, flowing style of Mulet is exemplified in this slow, meditative *offertoire* for organ. The only actual reference to the Gregorian alleluia occurs in the principal melodic line, and is derived from the intonation of the Alleluia for the Twenty-third Sunday in Ordinary Time. A compound meter with running subdivisions of the beat, together with registrations rich in flutes and strings, lends a gentle, pastoral character to this piece.

MARY ELIZABETH LE VOIR

Magazines


This bi-lingual journal published in Strasbourg for the Union Ste-Cécile continues with its practical articles suggesting music for the liturgy, sample music (this time in French and Latin), reviews, and lists of events of interest to church musicians. In line with developments in Europe, it gives the proceedings of the first European summit meeting of musical federations of the European community which took place in Luxembourg in November of 1991.

V.A.S.


Several of the articles in this issue deal with the liturgy. They include the review of a book by Monsignor Klaus Gamber, entitled in the original German, *Die Reform der romischen Liturgie*. Its conclusion contains this pertinent point: “Which of the progressives or conservatives are the most credible and lucid, the most solidly anchored in the future? Not those for whom progress means instability..., but those who know the value of what has been transmitted to us and work to keep it, all the while being open to the pastoral needs of our time.”

V.A.S.

BOLLETTINO CECILIANO. Anno 87, No. 4, April 1992.

The 26th national congress of the Italian Association of Saint Cecilia is announced for September 16-20, 1992, at Bologna. The magazine speaks of the “glorious past” and the “difficult present” of the association in the thirteenth year since the Vatican Council. Letters from several bishops urge the church musicians to attend the event. The program is printed, and a booklet of 32 pages containing the music to be used is announced for sale. An article on the Eucharistic hymns of Saint Thomas by Bishop Pietro Nonis concludes the issue.

R.J.S.


Preparation for the national congress in September continues with notices of the music to be used and letters from bishops urging attendance. Giuseppe
Pausiano continues his history of the restoration of pipe organs, and Alessandro Rizzotto writes a memorial testimonial on Gaston Litaize, the internationally known blind organist who is recently deceased. Notices of various meetings, conventions and broadcasts complete the issue.

R.J.S.


Final notices about the Bolgona congress and more invitations from the Italian bishops make up this issue. Alessandro Rizzotto writes about Helmut Walcha, a distinguished organist who died in 1991, and Pietro Righini continues the history of the restoration of organs. Sante Zaccaria reports on the 32nd international choral convention at Loreto.

R.J.S.


An article in praise and in memory of P. Manuel de Faria Borda, who did so much for church music in Portugal and for the journal itself, opens the issue. P. Mendes de Carvalho writes on organ registration, and reports on various meetings are presented. As always, the greater part of the magazine is given over very practically to the publication of new music, all of it in the vernacular.

R.J.S.

Books

James W. Demers, The Last Roman Catholic? (Carp, ON, 1991) 199pp., $17.95.

This book is a cri de coeur telling the story of the expulsion of the Oratorians from Ottawa in 1989. They had begun a rather successful restoration of the century-old Church of Saint Brigid, a venerated Edwardian structure in the shadow of Canada's parliament buildings. The restoration they effected chiefly through the restoration of sacred music there, much as their founder, Saint Philip Neri, set about reforming renaissance Rome by reforming her music. The Ottawa Oratorians were especially fond of Gregorian chant and music of the age of Palestrina, who was a contemporary of Saint Philip Neri.

Their work in Ottawa was certainly laudable, for liturgical music had been all but banished from the city's Catholic churches. Those in search of liturgical music (i.e., music written for the liturgy using biblical or liturgical texts as opposed to merely religious music) had hitherto to resort to Anglican churches. Besides their Masses of Palestrina, the Oratorians were the only Catholics who celebrated choral vespers. There can be little doubt that their expulsion by Archbishop Plourde left a deep void in the church music scene in Ottawa.

At the same time one must admit that from a canonical perspective the archbishop was within his rights, as Rome acknowledged. The Oratorians erred tactically, forgetting the venerable maxim festina lente, make haste slowly. By doing too much too soon they created formidable opposition which in the end crushed them.

Nevertheless, the result was surely sad. When I first saw Saint Brigid's some ten years ago, it was an old limestone pile, whitewashed within and reeking of urine. The Oratorians removed the 1960's grey paint from the walls to expose the handsome mauve and green Edwardian murals and stencils. The gothic vaulting, it turned out, was not plaster but pine from the vast Ottawa Valley timber supply. Shrewdly the Oratorians approached Canada's National Gallery and won several thousand dollars of federal money to pay for the bulk of the restoration. They wisely saw that connoisseurs of art would view the edifice as a national architectural treasure even if church officialdom dismissed it as merely "pre-Vatican II." With the grey paint, out went the midnight blue carpet in the aisles which choked and rendered useless the 1910 Casavante organ in the gallery. But it was too good to be true and doubtless the Oratorians left Ottawa quoting Pope Gregory VII, "I have loved justice and hated iniquity and therefore I die in exile."

DUANE C.L.M. GALLES

Recordings


Much like the classical composers of church music before him, Leo Sowerby (1895-1968) also wrote a scriptural-based setting of the passion account, here in the form of a four-movement cantata. The work dates from 1939, and it was perhaps the Second World War which distracted attention from an otherwise noteworthy composition. It is scored for the traditional divided roles which are integral to the gospel narratives, here sung by excellent soloists, including Bruce Hall, baritone (Jesus), and John Vorrasi, tenor (evangelist). These soloists sing the texts of St. Matthew's gospel while the choir, in addition to its tradi-
tional role of representing the groups active within the passion (turba choruses), comments, in words written by Edward Borgers, on the scriptural passages. By thus reflecting upon the larger meaning of the events taking place, the choir implicitly invites the listener to do the same.

Those who are familiar with Sowerby's choral style will not be surprised to find the music of this cantata always subordinate to the text and its message. Phrase structures, especially in the evangelist's part, as well as melodic lines, harmonic progressions, and larger formal considerations all serve the religious text. Sowerby's natural musical language is counterpoint but the voice-leading of the individual horiztonal melodic lines is not always adjusted to produce traditional vertical harmonies. Chordal structures succeed each other in a manner not easy to analyze by traditional methods. And yet one familiar with the composer's style of writing can perceive that the seemingly discordant notes are in fact resolved in their individual melodic lines, although those resolutions may be greatly delayed.

Maestro Ferris deserves a great deal of credit for successfully carrying out this valuable contribution to the recorded anthology of American music. The Ferris Chorale sings very crisply and rhythmically, true to the stylistic demands of a piece written by Ferris' old teacher. The choir enunciates very clearly so that none of the sacred words goes unheard. Worthy of special commendation is the full rich choral sound which blends so well with the Skinner organ at St. Thomas the Apostle Church in Chicago, masterfully played by organist Thomas Weisflog. This CD recording is highly recommended; proskynesis to the maestro and his chorale.

REVEREND ROBERT A. SKERIS


As stated in its companion booklet, this video cassette, sponsored by the new Latin Mass Society of Ireland, "aims to help priests and lay people learn all about the old rite of Mass—its history, its grace and the significance and beauty of its rubrics." The tape is heavily instructional and is clearly not for "devotional" use. Most of it was filmed during an actual Mass using the 1962 Missale Romanum at St. Paul's Church in Dublin, a church where His Grace, Archbishop Desmond O'Connell, has kindly given his approval for these celebrations on Sundays and holy days according to the Holy Father's pastoral provisions. There are moments when some additional material filmed at another time is edited in, but given the tape's objective, they distract very little.

After an initial and extremely rapid liturgical history introduction with some beautiful shots of St. Peter's Basilica and various sacred art works, the scene shifts to a sacristy. The priest, Fr. Joseph Val-lauri, FDP, with narration voice-over by the producer Kieron Wood, go through some of the necessary arrangements for a celebration of the 1962 Mass, including the vesting prayers, which one can also follow in the booklet. From the preparation of the chalice in the sacristy until the priest receives the biretta from the server after the Mass is finished, there is a constant and rapid voice-over commentary describing the priest's actions. Since the video cassette format allows one to pause and rewind easily, this is not an insurmountable difficulty. The celebrant is not completely inaudible while the voice-over narration is provided, but he is not easy to hear. Also included are some interesting observations about the historical developments of certain rubrics or prayers. One could, because it is an instructional tape, find some faults with the priest's hand, head, and body positions. But obviously great care has been taken to demonstrate how one should celebrate the Mass, any Mass...that is, with reverence and precision. To his credit, the celebrant does not come off like a machine. He is dignified and observes the rubrics carefully, without being inhuman. In the voice-over at one point the narrator mentions the importance of precision with the rubrics and a certain uniformity of celebration. On the other hand, the celebrant is not a slave to this principal. He is not rigid in his rubrical observance.

One or two things might strike the viewer as rather odd. For example, both on the tape and in the booklet the Pater noster is called a "sacramental" and it is stated that by its recitation, presumably in the context of the Mass, one may obtain pardon for venial sins. This is at least strange. Prayers themselves are not sacramentals though they can accompany their use. Things such as holy water, rosaries and churches can be sacramentals. Also, the use of sacramentals, under the usual conditions, can obtain indulgences. But indulgences refer to remission of temporal punishment for sins, and not to forgiveness of venial sins. One can obtain forgiveness for venial sins with a good act of contrition, during the Mass or outside of the Mass, or by sacramental confession. However, what the tape and booklet are referring to is not clear. Regardless of whether reference is being made on the tape to indulgences or forgiveness of venial sins, one should be aware that even in celebrations of the old Mass, the new indulgences are applicable.

Also, and not accurately, the narrator says on the tape that in the celebration of the Mass using the 1962 missal, the new calendar and lectionary are not to be used. This is somewhat different than what is printed in the booklet and one should perhaps under-
stand the statement on the tape in that light.

To follow up on this point, wherever the local bishop has graciously conceded celebrations of the Mass with the 1962 form, it is not opportune to impose the use of the new lectionary and calendar on groups who would find it difficult to accept them. This point was affirmed recently by Cardinal Mayer in his capacity as president of the Pontifical Commission Ecclesia Dei in a letter with guidelines interpreting the recent legislation governing the use of the 1962 Missale Romanum. There are groups who wish to preserve the celebration of these Masses in their integrity, and to impose something else could be a true obstacle to their ecclesial unity.

Nevertheless, under the new pastoral provisions it is now possible to use also the calendar and the lectionary promulgated by Pope Paul VI. For some groups this can be an opportunity to make use of the greater breadth of scripture available for the Mass since the liturgical reforms.

On the tape, the epistle and gospel are also read in the vernacular. The celebrant removes the maniple, places it on the open missal, and then goes to do the readings. There follows a very short homily clarifying the purpose of the taping session to the congregation attending the Mass.

Both the video tape and the booklet provide direction on how to receive holy communion. This includes a brief historical explanation of the various practices throughout history. The producer of this tape clearly shows a predilection for kneeling to receive holy communion on the tongue under one species only and that it should be distributed by priests. The commentary says that because the priest recites the entire formula for distributing holy communion, including the Amen at the end, the people should make no response. Also, it is mentioned correctly that the second Confiteor is not precisely part of the 1962 form of the Mass.

It must be mentioned that the tape is not only helpful for a celebrant but also for servers at the Mass. There are two servers present who respond accurately, though they are not always audible over the commentary. They carry out their proper roles with dignity and care and contribute significantly to the usefulness of this teaching tool.

With the voice-over, one can hear the choir that was providing music for this Mass only rarely. Snatches of Mozart's Ave verum Corpus come through at the conclusion. At the very end a few bars of the Toccata from Widor's Symphony No. 5, and well-played at that, can be heard.

The Mass and the tape conclude with the priest reciting the prayers prescribed by Pope Leo XIII. He then exits the sanctuary with the servers. There is a delightful moment during the responses made by the congregation when the camera shows some children a bit "distracted" during their prayers. That merely serves to underline the fact that this observance of the liturgy was quite real and lived. It is not enslaved to a rigid rubricism or a sterile dumb observance of an outdated liturgical form. An attitude of prayer comes through, despite the fact that there is constant voice-over narration and its didactic intention.

In the back of the booklet there is a short bibliography including some classic works on the history of the Mass and on the rubrics, classic "how to" books, such as that written by Fortescue. Unfortunately, in my opinion, there are some rather "partisan" works included. There is a brief list of some useful Vatican documents and addresses.

The last section of the booklet is entitled "Vatican guidelines on the Tridentine Mass." Although this section contains items which, in fact, do not actually pertain to the title there are at the end certain useful points concerning the most recent legislation. It explains, for example, that in 1986 an ad hoc commission of cardinals determined that the conditions governing the 1984 indult permitting use of the 1962 missal were too restrictive, recommending that they be relaxed. There are also found six very important points made recently by Cardinal Mayer which serve to clarify and interpret the existing legislation governing the celebration of the so-called "Tridentine" Mass in light of the Holy Father's motu proprio. I would express some disappointment at the title of this video and booklet. Unfortunately, the now famous quote of Fr. Faber has become a by-word for "traditionalists." These same traditional minded faithful often forget that Fr. Faber was referring to the Mass as such, the only Mass he knew at the time he was writing. He was not referring to the 1962 Mass as set up against the 1970 Mass. This kind of "terminology" from the pens and lips of certain people who have vigorously sought the opportunity to attend Masses using the 1962 missal, which is then imitated by countless others, has, alas, produced more heat than light. It should be set aside.

I would recommend the tape for several reasons. On the technical level, the quality of the picture and the color are quite good. Also, the rubrics were observed conscientiously, and not slavishly. The celebrant was formal and yet comfortable. With the booklet, and lots of practice of course, this tape could be of real benefit to a priest who would like to review the rubrics of the 1962 Mass or learn them if he had never celebrated using the previous form.

Though the tape moves very quickly, and though some movements could be carefully double checked on one's own, I think that it is a practical tool worthy of use. I would further recommend careful study of the Missale Romanum itself, though the rubrics and instructions are in Latin.

REVEREND JOHN T. ZUHLSDORF
Position of the Altar

Upon reading the splendid and illuminating article by Andrew Nash in the latest issue of Sacred Music, I could not help but to reflect upon it and share some of my own observations. In particular, the final analysis in the article concerning the orientation of priest and people in relation to the altar really caught my attention. I hope that my own reflections might be seen as a continuation of the analysis on this particular point, and perhaps they can be used as a springboard for a more gifted and scholarly writer to take up the question more definitively in some upcoming edition.

The whole issue of the placement of the altar and the orientation of the priest and people in relation to it opens up two basic questions: How is the altar to be placed in the sanctuary? and what is the position of the celebrant and the people in relationship to it? Many readers, no doubt, are aware that most churches in the U.S., up until the Second Vatican Council, had an altar that was placed upon a platform near the wall at the back of the sanctuary. These altars were commonly built-up behind with a retable and reredos. Some of them were even free-standing, but were so close to the wall that they could not be compassed about during the incensing. The celebrant of the Mass would do virtually every liturgical function facing towards the altar, even the readings. This state of affairs sometimes is referred to as the priest “having his back to the people.”

A Vatican II document on the arrangement of sacred furnishings in church buildings calls for free-standing altars as a new general rule for the universal Church. (The instruction on the Roman Missal states that it must “be possible” but not necessarily mandatory for the celebrant to stand behind the altar and face the people.) The purpose for the free-standing altars is to show forth a more emphasized symbol of the altar apart from the surrounding edifices of retable and reredos which had developed over centuries. In addition, the celebrant can now actually walk around the altar for the incensations. As for whether churches built prior to Vatican II should be changed at any cost is another issue. Some renovations do such violence to the aesthetic decorum of a given church building; they should never be done. This is not an easy question.

The relative positions of the celebrant and the people is a very intriguing question. In viewing the common relationships that existed prior to the council and after it, I am struck by what seems to be a very rigid “all or nothing” mentality. Whereas virtually all of the Mass used to be celebrated with the priest's back to the people, it is now all celebrated with the priest facing the congregation! I sometimes wonder why some liturgical experts did not seem to follow the course of a more happy medium based upon the principle: “When the priest addresses the people, he faces the people; and when the priest addresses Heaven, he does not face the people.” In this kind of a concept, the readings could be done at their proper time, in the vernacular, towards the people from an ambo. In addition, any of the exhortations to the people such as at the beginning of Mass, the Orate fratres, the Ecce Agnus Dei, etc. could be done from the altar platform, facing the people who are being addressed. Then, when the preparation of gifts and the Eucharistic canons are done, the priest could very naturally face towards the altar with the people, and lead them in the offering of the true sacrifice to the Father.

Nonetheless, there still remain a host of questions and perceptions, both historical and contemporary that need to be addressed. For example, how many times have you heard of how “in the good old days, Father at least ‘faced the tabernacle.’” Well, this statement does not hold up if the tabernacle happens not to be on the main altar, but is reserved rather in a separate Blessed Sacrament chapel. And besides, if the impression is that the sacrifice is offered toward Jesus present in the Blessed Sacrament, such a notion is unsound theologically. The sacrifice is offered to God the Father, in the Holy Spirit, by Christ through the ministry of the priest who is used as an “instrument” and “is acting in the person of Christ.”

On the other hand, if we see the orientation of the priest at the altar based literally upon “facing east,” then what of those churches built such that when the priest and people all face the altar, they are actually facing “compass west”? I once read a book purporting to be a concise history of the western rite of Catholicism in which the author argued that even when the priest is behind the altar facing the people, both the priest and the people are really “facing east” anyway. This is because Christ becomes present at the altar under the forms of bread and wine, and we all face Him, Who in His resurrection, was as the rising sun in the east.

You may ask what the point of this article is. In some ways, I may have raised more questions than answers, but questioning the present modern liturgical shibboleth of the versus populum altar is going to have to be the first step in getting a foot-in-edgewise for a true liturgical reform in the next generation. The position of the altar, and the relative orientation of the priest and the people toward it must progress beyond the common tendency to automatically tie the versus orientem altar to the Missal of Pius V (the “old Latin Mass”) and the versus populum altar to the Missal of Paul VI (the “new Mass”). Rather, good
liturgical taste and sound principles must govern the regulation of liturgical worship in our contemporary churches. It is time to challenge the "great unchallengeable orthodoxy" of the versus populum position of the celebrant at Mass, and to overcome any kind of extremism prevailing on either side.

SCHOLASTICUS IGNOTUS

Canadian Comment

At the faculty of music at the University of Toronto I have discovered volumes of back issues of Sacred Music. I have been reading these over the last few months. The material has certainly been informative and thought provoking! I have attempted in my studies to focus on the liturgy of the Church and sacred music.

I have appreciated Sacred Music mainly because it seems to be the only orthodox journal dealing with the liturgy and sacred music. I tell colleagues and friends of mine about my "music conversion," that I underwent in 1986 when I started reading Sacred Music and some of the books recommended in its pages. My wife has suggested that "conversion" is the wrong word to use to describe my discovery of the Church's authentic sacred music. I do not necessarily accept her observation because it was almost like a "religious experience." Like Saint Paul, my whole vision of the Church’s liturgy and sacred music was suddenly changed. When I started reading your journal in 1986, as well as publications put out through the Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae, it was like discovering a hidden treasure.

RAYMOND J. SANBORN

Cover Pictures

The summer 1992 issue of Sacred Music invites comment before it is even opened: the face on the cover is an unworthy representative of the timeless matters which the journal always treats. That remark is applicable not only to Columbus but to everyone else (Mozart, English ecclesiastics, Roman musicians) whose portraits have adorned the quarterly exteriors, from volume 116 onward. True enduring masterpieces are ultimately so much more than the human artist who gives birth to them. For Dante, "art is the grandchild of God;" hence the appropriateness of lofty religious architecture to recall the sacred music performed through the ages within those noble edifices. The mere sight of historic churches, with their numinous evocation stirs the imagination and uplifts the spirit. I would therefore entreat the editors of Sacred Music to give us more of the handsome prints of churches and monasteries that graced the covers prior to 1988, when the journal’s exterior alone—an eloquent message in itself, buttressing the ‘inside stories’—was worth the subscription.

GEORGE MARTIN

Mother Josephine Morgan, R.S.C.J.

Mother Morgan died of heart failure at the Kenwood Convent of the Sacred Heart in Albany, New York, on July 3, 1992. She was 88 years old. Known internationally for her work in church music and in particular in Gregorian chant, she was director of the Pius X School of Liturgical Music at Manhattanville College of the Sacred Heart in Purchase, New York, from 1952 to 1969. Born in New York City, April 23, 1904, she entered the convent at Kenwood, August 14, 1923, and was professed in Rome, August 1, 1931. She served as assistant to Mother Georgia Stevens, who with Mrs. Justine B. Ward founded the Pius X School. She was a member of the board of directors of the Church Music Association of America, and was recipient of two honorary doctorates, one from Seton Hill College in Greensburgh, Pennsylvania, and one from Manhattanville College in Purchase.

Her funeral was held at the convent on July 7, and was attended by many family members, former students, friends and faculty members of her school. She was buried in the convent cemetery at Kenwood. R.I.P.

R.J.S.

Sister Theophane Hytrek, O.S.F.

Known nationally as organist, teacher and composer, Sister Theophane was born in Stuart, Nebraska, on February 28, 1915. She joined the School Sisters of Saint Francis in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, in 1928, and during her long life with them she studied music and taught at their motherhouse on Layton Boulevard and at Alverno College. She held degrees from the Wisconsin Conservatory of Music, DePaul University in Chicago and the Eastman School of Music where she earned the Ph.D. degree. In demand as a recitalist, she performed across the nation up until her sudden death. She received many awards and honors and was a member of several musical, educational and liturgical societies. Her Pilgrim Mass, commissioned for the occasion, was sung by a congregation of over 60,000 people, at the 41st International Eucharistic Congress in Philadelphia in 1976.
She died in her sleep on August 13, 1992. Funeral services were held at Saint Joseph's Convent in Milwaukee. Archbishop Rembert G. Weakland celebrated the Mass. Burial was in Mt. Olivet Cemetery.

R.J.S.

NEWS

Michael B. Hoerig directed the members of the choir of Saint John Kanty Church in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, in Mozart's Coronation Mass on the occasion of the Mass of thanksgiving celebrated by recently ordained Father Edward S. Kopec, May 31, 1992. Other music sung for the celebration was by Arcadelt, Byrd, Morley, Pitoni and Rheinberger. Father Carl M. Kazmierczak is the pastor of Saint John Kanty.


The Most Reverend René H. Gracida, Bishop of Corpus Christi, celebrated the solemn liturgy of ordination to the priesthood in the Anglican use, June 29, 1992, when he elevated Father W. T. St. John Brown, a former Episcopal priest, to the priesthood in the Roman Catholic Church. Music for the occasion which was held in the Chapel of the Immaculate Conception at Corpus Christi Academy in Corpus Christi, Texas, was sung by the Cathedral Pontifical Choir under the direction of Lee Gwozdz and Greg Labus. Compositions by Healey Willan, Ralph Vaughan Williams, Harris and Palestrina were on the program.


The solemn Latin Mass in the crypt of the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception in Washington, D.C., on Sunday, June 28, 1992, was celebrated by Father Robert A. Skeris for registrants of the church music colloquium held the preceding days at Christendom College in Front Royal, Virginia. Theodore Marier directed the Gregorian chant and Brian Franck was organist. Joseph Archer, Edward Hester, Paul Schwenkler and Michael Summers were acolytes.

Saint Joseph's Church in Columbia, South Carolina, was the scene of a concert on May 24, 1992, featuring Charles Gounod's Messe Solennelle, Saint Cecilia (1855). The program opened with G. F. Handel's Coronation Anthem No. 1 and closed with Gioacchino Rossini's Chorus No. 10 "In Sempiterna Saecula, Amen" from the Stabat Mater (1842). Teresa Sturcken Riley directed the program, and Janet Shuffler was organist. Instrumentalists were from the Columbia Symphony Orchestra.

Cantores in Ecclesia of the Archdiocese of Portland, Oregon, continue to present classical music for the liturgy of Sundays and feast days at Saint Patrick's Church, where Father Frank Knusel is pastor. During May and June they sang works of Gabriel Fauré, William Byrd, Palestrina and Lassus. In June and July they sang works of Palestrina, Viadana, Langlais, Michael Haydn and Poulenc. In August the program included music of Lotti, Duruflé, Byrd, Purcell and Monteverdi. Dean Applegate is director.

The Twin Cities Catholic Chorale has announced its program of orchestra Masses beginning in October 1992. Thirty Masses are sung each year at the Church of Saint Agnes in Saint Paul, Minnesota, concluding with the Feast of Corpus Christi. During the past twenty years over 450 orchestral Masses have been done; the repertory includes 8 Haydn Masses, 7 Mozart, 3 Schubert, 2 von Weber, one each of Beethoven, Cherubini, Dvorak and Gounod. The choir numbers sixty-five and the orchestra in the neighborhood of twenty-four players depending on the instrumentation demanded. Monsignor Schuler is director, and Mary E. LeVoir is organist. Paul LeVoir directs the chant schola which sings all the Gregorian chant.

Father James A. Nowak was celebrant for the solemn Mass commemorating his 25th anniversary of ordination, May 3, 1992, at the Church of Saint Anthony in Joliet, Illinois. Music for the occasion was provided by the Ecclesiastical Chorale, Saint Anthony Choir and Choristers and members of the Sinfonia Camerata, all under the direction of Richard Siegel. Sr. M. Teresine Haban, OSF, was organist. Tu es Sacerdos by Desmet was the processional, and Re- Vicles's Missa Choralis and several Gregorian chants were sung along with the congregation.

The choir of Saint Stephen's Church on the campus of Brown University in Providence, Rhode Island,
has celebrated solemn liturgy on Sundays and feast
days with such works as Victoria’s Missa O quam
gloriosum, Britten’s Te Deum, Mozart’s Missa brevis
in F (K192), and works by Howells, Pinkham,
Duruflé, Scarlatti and Anerio. Richard Benefield is
organist and choirmaster.

The Dallas chapter of the American Guild of Or-
ganists presented “An Evening of Duruflé,” April 28,
1992, at the Church of Saint Thomas Aquinas in
Dallas, Texas. Among the works programmed were
Choral varié sur le thème du “Veni Creator,” Quatre
Motets sur des thèmes grégoriens pour choeur a cap-
pella, Notre Père, Scherzo, Messe “Cum jubilo,” Prél-
ude sur l’Introst de l’Epiphanie, and Fugue sur le
thème du Carillon des heures de la Cathédrale de
Soissons. Artists performing were Paul Riedo, who
directed the St. Thomas Aquinas Choir, Mary Pres-
ton and Jesse Eschbach, organ, and David Bennett,
baritone. The choristers of St. John School with Mi-
chie Akin at the organ performed under the direction
of William Jordan. Mme. Duruflé, widow of the
composer, was present at the concert.

A festival concert was presented by the Pontifical
Chorale and the Youth Chorale and Choristers of
Corpus Christi Cathedral, Corpus Christi, Texas, on
June 12, 1992, under guest conductor Ronald L. Shi-
rey. Works by Hans Leo Hassler, Victoria, Rach-
maninoff, Noel Goemanne, Fauré, Handel and John
Rutter were programmed. Conductors of the ensem-
bles are Lee Gwozdz and Greg Labus.

R.J.S.

CONTRIBUTORS

Paul Koch has been active in music in Pittsburgh
for nearly half a century, serving both as organist
and choirmaster at Saint Paul’s Cathedral there and
as Carnegie organist with frequent concerts on the
famous instrument in the city auditorium. He is a
member of the historic Singenberger family.

Károly Köpè has served a director of the Moravian
Music Society in Winston-Salem, North Carolina,
directing concert performances of orchestral and cho-
ral music. He has just completed a recital tour of
eastern Europe where he played several organ con-
certs.

Father Robert A. Skeris is a priest of the Archdio-
cese of Milwaukee. He has a doctorate from the Uni-
versity of Bonn and has taught at the Pontifical Insti-
tute of Music in Rome. At present he is on the faculty
of Christendom College in Front Royal, Virginia.
Christmas at St. Agnes

This magnificent recording includes 18 hymns sung by the Twin Cities Catholic Chorale, with instrumental accompaniment by the Minnesota Orchestra conducted by Monsignor Richard J. Schuler. The hymns are sung in either English, Latin, or German. A listing of a few are: Silent Night; Behold a Simple Tender Babe; Alle Jahre Wieder; Magnum nomen Domini; Exultate Jubilate; As Lately We Watched; Ihr Kinderlein, Kommet; plus many more. Double length playing time Cassette. Cassette — $9.95. Compact Disc — $15.95. Shipping — $2.00.

Order From:

The Leaflet Missal Company
976 W. Minnehaha Ave. St. Paul, MN 55104
Tele. (612) 487-2818 • FAX (612) 487-0286